11-3-2023

Schoolteachers in Out-of-School Hours Education: Blurring Professional Ideology in Recent Times

Dr. M Monjurul Islam  
*Universiti Pendidikan Sultan Idris*, monj0603@gmail.com

Mohammed Shamsul Hoque  
*Daffodil International University*, hoque.eng@daffodilvarsity.edu.bd

Wan Mazlini Othman  
*Universiti Pendidikan Sultan Idris*, wan.mazlini@fbk.upsi.edu.my

Saraswathy Thurairaj PhD  
*Universiti Tunku Abdul Rahman*, tsaraswathy@utar.edu.my

Dr. Ghadah Al Murshidi  
*College of Education - UAE University*, g_almurshidi@uaeu.ac.ae

*See next page for additional authors*

Follow this and additional works at: https://nsuworks.nova.edu/tqr

Part of the Curriculum and Instruction Commons, Educational Assessment, Evaluation, and Research Commons, Language and Literacy Education Commons, and the Secondary Education Commons

**Recommended APA Citation**


This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the The Qualitative Report at NSUWorks. It has been accepted for inclusion in The Qualitative Report by an authorized administrator of NSUWorks. For more information, please contact nsuworks@nova.edu.
Schoolteachers in Out-of-School Hours Education: Blurring Professional Ideology in Recent Times

Abstract
Teachers' professional ideology and their involvement in out-of-school hours (OoSH) practices have been questioned in recent times. This study explores how schoolteachers understand their professional ideology in relation to their OoSH practices and how they explain their participation in private tutoring in addition to formal schooling. This study deploys a qualitative approach using in-depth semi-structured interviews with nine secondary school teachers in Bangladesh. The thematic analysis highlights a substantial gap between Bangladeshi school teachers' professional ideologies and their involvement in private tutoring. The findings from the study reveal that the respondents perceive their dual roles as schoolteachers and tutors as controversial and detrimental to discharging their professional duties in an ideological way. They recurrently struggle to justify the dual roles that contribute to the dilemma of professional ideologies. As such, private tutoring does not just create a problem in classroom teaching but affects professional ideology and commitment to teaching principles. The study recommends policymakers and professionals look into these issues to gain a deeper insight into the existing private tutoring literature concerning teachers' professional ideologies.

Keywords
teachers' professional ideology, teachers' professionalism, private tutoring, out-of-school hours (OoSH) practice, qualitative study, semi-structured interviews, Bangladesh

Creative Commons License
This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-Share Alike 4.0 International License.

Acknowledgements
We would like to give our heartiest thanks to all the participants of this study.

Authors
Dr. M Monjurul Islam, Mohammed Shamsul Hoque, Wan Mazlini Othman, Saraswathy Thurairaj PhD, Dr. Ghadah Al Murshidi, and Latha Ravindran

This article is available in The Qualitative Report: https://nsuworks.nova.edu/tqr/vol28/iss11/4
Schoolteachers in Out-of-School Hours Education: Blurring Professional Ideology in Recent Times

M Monjurul Islam¹, Mohammed Shamsul Hoque², Wan Mazlini Binti Othman³, Saraswathy Thurairaj⁴, Ghadah Al Murshidi⁵, and Latha Ravindran⁶

¹Language & Communication, Universiti Pendidikan Sultan Idris, Malaysia
²Department of English at Daffodil International University, Bangladesh
³Language and Communication, Universiti Pendidikan Sultan Idris, Malaysia
⁴Faculty Creative Industry at Universiti Tunku Abdul Rahman, Malaysia
⁵Curriculum and Instruction Department, College of Education, United Arab Emirates University, UAE
⁶Faculty of Education, Languages, Psychology and Music, SEGi University, Malaysia

Teachers’ professional ideology and their involvement in out-of-school hours (OoSH) practices have been questioned in recent times. This study explores how schoolteachers understand their professional ideology in relation to their OoSH practices and how they explain their participation in private tutoring in addition to formal schooling. This study deploys a qualitative approach using in-depth semi-structured interviews with nine secondary school teachers in Bangladesh. The thematic analysis highlights a substantial gap between Bangladeshi school teachers’ professional ideologies and their involvement in private tutoring. The findings from the study reveal that the respondents perceive their dual roles as schoolteachers and tutors as controversial and detrimental to discharging their professional duties in an ideological way. They recurrently struggle to justify the dual roles that contribute to the dilemma of professional ideologies. As such, private tutoring does not just create a problem in classroom teaching but affects professional ideology and commitment to teaching principles. The study recommends policymakers and professionals look into these issues to gain a deeper insight into the existing private tutoring literature concerning teachers’ professional ideologies.

Keywords: teachers’ professional ideology, teachers’ professionalism, private tutoring, out-of-school hours (OoSH) practice, qualitative study, semi-structured interviews, Bangladesh

Introduction

This study uses the complex notion of “teacher’s professional ideology” as a theoretical framework to understand not only the intentions and outcomes of educational changes but also the complexities and realities in relation to “out-of-school hours” (OoSH) practice. It explains the phenomenon of private tutoring as an “OoSH practice” that has grown into a parallel system of education in many countries, particularly in Asia (Bray, 2022; Islam et al., 2018; Joshi, 2019; Zhang & Yamato, 2018; Zwier et al., 2020). To further understand the schoolteachers’ involvement in private tutoring, this study uses the teachers’ professional ideological issues in the context of “OoSH practice” of private tutoring. It is arguable to define teaching from the perspective of ideology. It suggests that there is room for debate regarding whether teaching
should be defined or understood based on ideological perspectives. Factors such as educational philosophies, subjectivity and bias, cultural influences, and educational aims and values can all contribute to the varying interpretations of teaching from an ideological standpoint. In essence, teaching can be influenced by ideological perspectives, but the exact nature of that influence and its significance can be a matter of discussion and disagreement. On top of this, schoolteachers’ professional ideologies can play an important role in unveiling the reality of teaching profession. For this reason, Larson and Larson (1979) identified teachers’ professional ideology as a social practice that consciously inspires collective or individual efforts, but also a mystification that unconsciously exposes faulty social structures and is anomalous. Based on this view, the ideological aspect of professionalism is more important than the account of the actual teaching conditions. As a result, identifying professionalism as an ideology facilitates exploring the facts of teachers’ work within a broader perspective than their classrooms, hence helping to answer important questions about teachers’ struggles within teaching. It also vindicates the nature of their experiences within the occupation and their relations with the situation.

One emergency issue of schoolteacher professional ideology literature is the involvement of mainstream schoolteachers in private tutoring (Khaydarov, 2020; Zhang, 2014). In recent times, more and more Bangladeshi teachers decide to increase their income by teaching private lessons. Although this phenomenon is broadly accepted by Bangladeshi society, the government still considers it “illegal” (Islam et al., 2021) and fights it with punitive measures. Revenue obtained “on the side” from this informal type of employment by tutors is not taxed and contributes to the “grey economy” (Mahmud & Bray, 2017). Many teachers are revealed to be “corrupted” (Kobakhidze, 2014) and their activities as private tutors are greeted by an “official” outcry of reprobation. However, the measures taken by the government have proved to be inefficient and, ultimately, unsuccessful. Teachers continue to be involved in this activity that has grown into what is commonly known as a “parallel system of education” (Hamid et al., 2018). Besides financial incentives, their work is driven by non-pecuniary rewards (such as “fame” and recognition tied to epistemological achievement, as it often happens with teachers employed by the formal education system)? The study addresses the following specific research questions:

1. How do schoolteachers understand their professional ideology in relation to their out of school hours (OoSH) practices?
2. How do schoolteachers explain their participation in private tutoring outside the formal schooling?

In order to respond to these questions, this study uses schoolteacher’s open-ended interview responses on professional ideology, reviewed and analyzed methodically. School teachers’ dual roles, OoSH effects on professional ideology, social perception of professional ideology, professional ethics for OoSH practices and commercial advertisement and professional ideology are examined.

Schoolteacher Professional Ideology and OoSH Education

Recent studies (i.e., Densmore, 2018; Lawn & Grace, 2012) have detailed that it is difficult to understand teachers’ work fully without considering the actual conditions of their workplace, including the personal, socio-economical, and structural relations of the labor process. Hence, viewing teachers’ work through a lens of professional ideology is likely to shed light on the complexities of teachers’ educational practices in relation to private tutoring. By considering teaching as an ideological work, schools are categorized as worksites where
the work of teaching is organized (Deng & Luke, 2008) and teachers are considered as workers by value of their economic position as employees, and perform the role of key players for fighting ideological issues in society (Vlieghe & Zamojski, 2019), sticking to practice of professionalism. Therefore, a deeper theoretical understanding of a phenomenon is crucial because it provides a conceptual lens for analysis, enables researchers to identify patterns and complexities, situates the phenomenon within a broader context, fosters interdisciplinary dialogue, and guides future research directions. It moves beyond surface-level observations and enhances the quality and rigor of research.

The professional ideology of schoolteachers plays a significant role in shaping their engagement with OoSH education. Teachers’ professional ideologies encompass their beliefs, values, and attitudes about teaching and education. These ideologies influence their instructional practices and decision-making processes, extending to their involvement in OoSH practices. Some teachers, driven by a holistic educational perspective, view OoSH education as essential for students’ overall development and actively seek opportunities to engage in such activities. For them, OoSH education is seen as an extension of their teaching role, providing avenues to nurture students’ interests, skills, and well-being beyond the traditional curriculum. Conversely, other teachers with a more traditional or narrow view of their role may perceive OoSH education as supplementary or less significant, limiting their engagement in such programs. It is essential to recognize the diversity of teachers’ professional ideologies, shaped by personal experiences and socio-cultural factors, as they impact the quality and availability of OoSH education. To gain deeper insights into the relationship between teachers’ professional ideologies and their engagement with OoSH education, further research and analysis are needed.

Over many years, schoolteachers are used in poor socio-economic conditions in south Asian countries like Bangladesh which leads to the declining status and prestige of the teaching profession. Previous studies (e.g., Knowles & Castro, 2019; Reichert et al., 2021) refer to mainstream teachers’ understanding and perceptions of teacher professional ideologies. The central focus of these studies has been on professional ideology concerning teachers’ roles in society, civic education, and humanistic ideology (Sampermans et al., 2021). For example, Colley et al. (2007) stated that professional practice assists teachers to develop their professional ideology and value system. In addition, teacher professional ideology formation has been connected to various sequential socio-cultural developments that teachers experience through their professional practices. These findings advocate that exploring teachers’ professional ideology presents functional perception to explain their understanding and practices around which the present article is shaped.

In contrast, despite the growing mass of research on private tutoring across the globe since the last quarter of the 20th century (e.g., Bray, 2022; de Silva, 2015; Zhang et al., 2021), few studies examine professional ideology of school teachers who also provide tutoring as an OoSH activity for their students. Previous studies that examine schoolteachers’ participation in tutoring in various countries highlighted their economic motives linked with the issues of low salaries (e.g., Dawson, 2009; Kobakhidze, 2018). There are other studies that have discussed private tutoring as a corrupted and illegal money-making activity that contributes to societal inequality (Islam et al., 2021). In addition, several recent studies also discuss supply and demand sides of tutoring based on students-parents’ perspectives, including educational impacts and the policy response of teachers as tutors (e.g., Bray, 2022; Yung, 2021). Therefore, few studies exploring teachers’ perspective of private tutoring offer insights into teacher professional ideology.

Research to date on tutoring has shown little interest in schoolteachers’ professional ideological perceptions and their rationalizations of participation in private tutoring (Bray, 2022; Hoque et al., 2023; Islam et al., 2019; Kobakhidze, 2018). More clearly, it has not been
discussed yet how mainstream schoolteachers perceive their mixed roles of being as schoolteachers’ tutors at the same time and what difficulties and opportunities they face in their dual roles. Hence, it is important to know how teachers conceptualize their mixed roles and how they explain their professional ideologies in relation to OoSH practices. These issues are significant to understand the existing condition of schoolteachers teaching as a profession because it has implications on their job satisfaction, commitment to teaching, professional practices, and ideologies (Ginsburg & Megahed, 2009; Lawn & Grace, 2012).

**OoSH Education in Bangladesh and Professional Ideology**

Private tutoring as an OoSH practice has been receiving increasing attention from researchers in Bangladesh, similar to other Asian countries (e.g., Alam & Zhu, 2022; Hamid et al., 2018; Islam et al., 2021; Mahmud & Bray, 2017; Mahmud & Kenayathulla, 2018; Mahmud, 2021). Despite this growing interest, there exists a significant literature gap regarding the multifaceted impacts of private tutoring activities in Bangladesh. While previous studies have explored various aspects of private tutoring, such as its demand, social factors, student experiences, ethical concerns, and government regulations, a comprehensive understanding of the interactions between private tutoring and the educational system, as well as the broader societal implications, remains limited. For example, Mahmud & Bray (2017) focused on the demand for private tutoring in urban and rural areas but did not extensively explore its impact on educational inequalities. Similarly, Islam et al. (2021) examined students’ experiences but did not delve into the systemic effects of private tutoring on urban-rural disparities. Furthermore, while some studies highlighted ethical concerns and the need for government intervention, there is a lack of research exploring the effectiveness of existing measures and potential strategies to regulate private tutoring practices (Mahmud et al., 2018; Alam & Zhu, 2022). But studies overlook the exploration of teachers’ beliefs, values, and attitudes towards private tutoring, and how these ideologies shape their engagement in OoSH education (e.g., Hoque et al., 2023). Understanding teachers’ professional ideology in the Bangladeshi context becomes particularly significant as it exemplifies the shift in teachers’ professional practices from a respected occupation to a socially vulnerable status due to socioeconomic and sociocultural changes (Islam et al., 2018).

In the context of low-paid occupations compared to government civil servants, teachers in Bangladesh have been compelled to take on additional roles as paid tutors to supplement their income and cope with economic challenges (Mahmud, 2021; Hamid et al., 2018). This phenomenon highlights the need to examine the impact of teachers’ professional ideology on their engagement in private tutoring as an OoSH education practice. For instance, studies have shown that teachers’ decisions to engage in private tutoring are influenced by financial motivations and the necessity to meet their basic economic needs (Mahmud & Bray, 2017). Additionally, the shift towards a dual role as both a schoolteacher and a private tutor raises questions about the potential conflicts of interest, ethical considerations, and the implications for the quality of education delivered in both settings.

In conclusion, further research is warranted to explore teachers’ professional ideology and their dual roles in private tutoring as an OoSH education practice in South Asian countries, with a specific focus on Bangladesh. Such research can provide valuable insights into the beliefs, values, and attitudes of teachers towards private tutoring, as well as the complex interplay between their professional identity, socioeconomic factors, and educational practices. Understanding these dynamics is crucial for addressing the challenges and implications associated with private tutoring as an OoSH education practice and for promoting equitable and quality education for all students.
Methods

According to Creswell (2018), qualitative research is a means for exploring and understanding the meaning individuals or groups ascribe to a social human problem. The principle aim of the study is to examine the complexities of each schoolteacher professional ideology as a private tutor in OoSH education in Bangladesh. The method helped achieve insights into the characteristics of the situation such as participant’s attitudes, values, experiences, justification, and aspirations in OoSH education in Bangladesh.

A semi-structured interview technique was used to elaborate and in-depth communication with the participants for a reasonable period of time to explore pros and cons of the socio-academic problem centering OoSH practice in secondary education in Bangladesh. A semi-structured interview is a commonly used research tool for collecting qualitative data, which facilitates obtaining insights and perspectives directly from the interviewees. The face-to-face interviews are an effective way to understand participants’ reflections on their experiences, Insights into the research problem and practical subjective observations on the topic of investigation. To achieve these aims of the study, the interviews were mainly about their experiences and understanding of those who have been involved in private tutoring due to various reasons such as low salaries, deteriorating social status and declining authority that have forced them to face the changing role besides their professional ideologies.

Participants

This study selected nine schoolteachers who were teaching either in rural non-government schools or urban government schools and differed demographically in their backgrounds, academic disciplines of teaching and socio-cultural conditions. The participants’ demographic information is detailed in Table 1. The participants were selected through the personal network of the researchers and through snowballing (Goodman, 1961). Snowball sampling, a non-probability sampling method, involves selecting initial participants and using their referrals to recruit additional participants, as discussed by Goodman (1961), and evaluated in qualitative educational research by Abdulrahman et al. (2019). Their acquaintance networks were utilized to identify the participants and invite them to participate in the study. After three months of searching, 25 teachers were selected and nine were chosen because they fulfilled the selection criteria. To ensure that the school teachers in this study has practical experiences in OoSH education as private tutors and understood its application to teachers’ professional ideology, We established the following eligibility criteria: the participants have to be full-time school teachers with prior experiences in OoSH education, possess a certain duration of private tutoring experiences, have taught OoSH education in an out of school setting, and capable of articulating their understanding of teachers professional ideology.

The schoolteachers, who are currently involved in private tutoring, were selected because they purposefully informed an understanding of the research problem and central phenomenon (PT) in the study. The purpose of selecting these secondary schoolteachers is to gain clear picture of their experiences of PT as these teachers have many years of teaching experiences as well as long-time involvement in private tutoring. Most importantly, they have been teaching in schools until now and have many years of background involvement with the existing OoSH practice. All the participants and their school names were given pseudonyms.
Table 1
Participant Profile

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pseudo</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Teaching Subjects</th>
<th>Teaching Experiences</th>
<th>Years of taking PT</th>
<th>Types of Institutions</th>
<th>Regions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>T-1</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>Man</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>20 years</td>
<td>14 years</td>
<td>Government</td>
<td>Urban</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T-2</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>Woman</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>23 years</td>
<td>16 years</td>
<td>Non-Government</td>
<td>Urban</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T-3</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>Man</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>19 years</td>
<td>13 years</td>
<td>Non-government</td>
<td>Rural</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T-4</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>Man</td>
<td>Science</td>
<td>17 years</td>
<td>12 years</td>
<td>Government</td>
<td>Urban</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T-5</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>Woman</td>
<td>Science</td>
<td>14 years</td>
<td>10 years</td>
<td>Government</td>
<td>Urban</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T-6</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>Man</td>
<td>Science</td>
<td>12 years</td>
<td>7 years</td>
<td>Non-Government</td>
<td>Rural</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T-7</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>Man</td>
<td>Mathematics</td>
<td>30 years</td>
<td>26 years</td>
<td>Government</td>
<td>Urban</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T-8</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>Woman</td>
<td>Mathematics</td>
<td>11 years</td>
<td>6 years</td>
<td>Non-Government</td>
<td>Rural</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T-9</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>Man</td>
<td>Mathematics</td>
<td>15 years</td>
<td>9 years</td>
<td>Non-Government</td>
<td>Rural</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Data Collection Methods

The data were collected through in-depth interviews using a semi-structure that assisted in obtaining in-depth and thoughtful responses (Ruslin et al., 2022). The interviews were conducted by the first author, who is familiar with the study site; the interviewees were free to switch between Bangla and English during the interviews depending on how comfortable they were in expressing their ideas. The sample teachers were selected from different schools in two different regions of Bangladesh. Two different regional areas were selected to get diverse perspectives among the participants. These regions are socio-economically and culturally different from each other.

For in-depth understanding of the issues studied, an interview guide with two sections was developed and the interview structure was developed based on the research questions. The schoolteachers explained freely their participations in private tutoring besides formal school teaching. For example, the questions used in the first section of the interview asked the teachers’ involvement in private tutoring. In the second part of interview, the participants were invited to elaborate, where appropriate, on how professional ethics and ideology matched with the practice of private tutoring.

Analysis

For data analysis, this study used thematic analysis (Braun & Clarke, 2012) to examine the data collected through semi-structured interviews. Initially, all interviews were audio-recorded and transcribed verbatim as soon as possible after the interview was completed. The transcripts were reviewed by the researchers for accuracy. After getting an initial impression, the data analysis was conducted using the axial coding process (Hilal & Alabri, 2013) with the assistance of NVivo-10, a qualitative software program. In this process, coding was assigned to sort out various aspects of the data so that specific pieces of data could be retrieved to give the answer to the research questions. Additionally, coding was used to refine the list of codes that identified the major ideas of the present study. The articulated meanings were then clustered into themes allowing for the emergence of themes common to the entire transcripts of the participants’ responses; the researcher developed “clusters of meaning” from these significant statements into themes. The major themes found in the data become the major findings of the study. Then, the results are integrated into an in-depth, exhaustive description of the PT phenomenon. Finally, to increase conformability, trustworthiness, and transparency...
The Qualitative Report 2023

(Kornbluh, 2015), the findings were validated with the participants and included their corrections.

**Trustworthiness**

As per Jones et al. (2013), a qualitative study requires demonstration of credibility, transferability, affirmability, and dependability. We carried out interviews with schoolteachers and carefully examined the transcriptions until we reached a point where no new data was being collected. We are confident that our research will hold significance and be credible to educators involved in out-of-school hours (OoSH) education. In our manuscript, we have documented our process of inquiry and the methods we used to collect and analyse the data. Finally, the findings to the data collected and analysis was limited.

**Findings**

As explained above, this study aimed to investigate teachers’ professional ideologies concerning OoSH private education. The findings revealed that the teachers’ professional ideology was hindered by a range of factors such as parents’ involvement in their children education, socio-cultural status issues, and low payment. In fact, what is important to note is that regardless of their level of experience or regional variations, the teachers perceived differences between school teaching and private tutoring in OoSH education as a tutor. Teachers also agreed that private tutoring mimics their school teaching as they needed to follow the same classroom lessons. Within the scope of this study, we preferred to state and explain this “dual role” as one of the ethical issues which contradict the principles of professional ideologies. It came out in the majority of the teachers’ responses. The second argument that brought into our analysis was OoSH private practices have negative impacts on professional ideology. This theme was explored in detail because hardly any studies have investigated the negative and controversial impacts of OoSH private education. There is hardly any investigation on the effects on schoolteachers’ professional ideology and how this OoSH private practice affects classroom teaching in Asian countries, particularly in Bangladesh. In contrast, this study evolves a discussion about social perceptions towards schoolteachers’ OoSH private practice where teachers have reported that they feel “a sense of guilt” regarding their OoSH practices although parents sometimes ask them to get involved in it. The issue also bypasses the ethical question regarding OoSH educational practice. The matter is meant to be examined further because the Government of Bangladesh has, through a statute, declared OoSH private practice in education as an illegal activity (see Islam et al., 2021).

**Schoolteachers’ Dual Roles as the Hinderance for Professional Ideology**

In this study, the participants were schoolteachers who are engaged in private tutoring at OoSH education setting. The dual roles as schoolteacher as well as private tutor in OoSH education are revealed by the teachers themselves and the members of the general public in different ways. Our analysis revealed that all participants’ felt school was a more ideal place for professional practice than private tutoring. The teachers perceived that schools teaching-learning environment made them more confident to be professional than private tutoring practices. A teacher (T-1) with 20 years of experience teaching English language in an urban government school, along with 14 years of private tutoring experience, shared the following excerpt:
Hmm… To me, my school is the very ideal place where I feel more like a professional compared to my private tutorial center because it is not an appropriate place for teaching. The teaching environment of my school makes me more confident to represent myself properly (T-1).

Similarly, T-6 opined that the school environment was an appropriate setting for representing themselves, “In school, I think I feel more professional. Because if I wasn’t a schoolteacher, I couldn’t teach tutoring. So… priority to the school.”

However, the teachers felt that private tutoring could assist them to build their professional development as it mimics school teaching. Several interviewees shared their common expressions regarding the benefits of private tutoring in their professional development. A participant, (T-4), who has 18 years private tutoring experiences, opined that although private tutoring was supportive for his professional development, yet it was not an appropriate substitute for real professional development with job satisfaction. But participants T-8, T-2, T-4… Reported that they positively benefitted through their experiences at private tutoring for their professional development. T-2 said:

Obviously, it [private tutoring] is increasing my experience and professional status day by day. I can identify the quality of student easily. I need to develop my learning to study many books for my private students. It develops my skill and helps me to take my class in a better way. I think that my professional status is developing.

But the interview excerpt brings in an element of doubt in the total honesty of what the participants claimed. They felt that the participants were shaky in claiming what they were claiming about the positive aspects of professional development through private tutoring. It was evident when a participant, T-1, who has 14 years of experience reported:

For private tutoring, I need a lot of preparation to answer any type of question that students may ask me as… Teach students intensively… So, they may ask in different way to solve their problems. So, I have to study much and it is very helpful for developing my idea… But I feel private tutoring is not an appropriate place for professional development of a teacher.

However, it is also noticeable that the teachers emphasized both places as an important place for their professional development. It was evident when T-8 who has more than ten years of teaching experiences expressed an important view about professional ideology.

I think that both places are very important to me… Students in both places are equally important to me. But I feel more professional… when I am in school because of its institutional atmosphere (T-8).

Therefore, it is that those participants had mixed views regarding their professional practices and private tutoring. While they considered the school environment as an ideal place for their professionalism, private tutoring may assist them by providing more chances to practice.

**OoSH Effects on Professional Ideology**

In general, the findings revealed that private tutoring influences the teaching-learning environment of classroom teaching that adversely affects teachers’ professional ideologies. It
The Qualitative Report 2023

has created the complexity of being teachers and tutors at the same time. For them, the most challenging situation was the time when students become unmindful during classroom teaching period. Students feel that there is nothing new or important to learn in classroom teaching because they have already learnt it from private tutoring or they will learn it from private tutors if something is significant for the lessons. Similarly, it directly affects the teachers’ classroom behaviors. As teachers, they feel tired to teach in the classroom and think that the students have already learnt the subject matter of the lesson by taking up private tutoring. It was evident when one senior teacher (T-5) who has more than ten years of private tutoring experiences stated:

Students think that they can complete everything [their syllabuses] by taking up PT and do not need to attend at school and… feel tired. However, I try heart and soul so that they can pay attention in the classroom but they do not feel interest in the classroom teaching after getting the same lesson from PT… So harmful… I cannot teach whatever I want actually (T-5).

Although the central emphasis is on the negative effects of classroom teaching-learning environment, the teachers were also pressed to continue the private tutoring. They continued it because of the existing exam-orientated teaching-learning system of the country. Students are forced to take up private tutoring as their social pressure of exam grade. It suggests that students feel compelled to engage in private tutoring due to the societal expectations and pressures related to their academic performance in exams. This pressure could stem from various factors such as the desire to achieve high grades, meet parental or societal expectations, or gain a competitive edge in education. The implication is that the social environment and expectations surrounding exams create a perceived necessity for students to seek additional academic support through private tutoring.

Many of the teachers saw their role as providing private tuition to students to support students to achieve the good grades in the upcoming public examination. One teacher explained how she felt when she provided private tutoring for some of her students and this is what they needed. She explained:

I think that private tutoring plays the vital effects on students learning because students… Feel good to understand the classroom lessons… feel comfortable for preparing class lesson… Usually, they are taking private tutoring from the classroom teacher and feel that there is no need to learn from the class (T-8).

So, private tutoring affects their professional roles and responsibilities. Their willingness to teach students was not fulfilling due to the current practice. However, the teachers also expressed the effects of their classroom teaching behaviors. They felt that private tutoring negatively influenced them to teach students during the class time. They felt exhausted after taking up long hours of private tutoring. As one teacher explained:

It effects on teaching quality… because… feel tired after tuition… do not get enough time to prepare lesson plan properly… feel tired and bored to take up class at school. So… effects on students learning (T-5).

Finally, some teachers also felt that private tutoring has positive effects on students’ learning. They believed that they could help students when students need private tutoring. Even though they provide it free of cost, students have financial difficulty. For instance, T-9 commented that:
If... financial problem... take up private tutoring without money. For example, the last time, there were six students who... did not able to pay fees... tell them all the time to come... future will be better.

**Social Perceptions Towards Teachers’ Tutoring and Teaching Ideology**

All the teachers said they valued guardians’ perceptions of private tutoring in a society. They also said the nature and demand of private tutoring has changed because of social perceptions of low standard classroom teaching. In general, the findings revealed that the interviewees showed strong expressions regarding the social acceptance and gratitude of schoolteachers’ private tutoring practice besides their school teaching. It was evident when T-7 expressed his view as below:

```
Everybody takes it [private tutoring] easily... common issue in society... acceptable to everyone... students can’t do well without it... perceive it just like as usual as other activities. When a student studies in nine or ten grade... they need to search private tutor in each subject. The guardian also thinks it is helpful...
```

Similarly, another teacher (T-2) who has 23 years of school teaching experiences and 16 years of private tutoring experiences, also expressed similar view and stated that “Nowadays, people are very aware about private tutoring. They suggest keeping up the tutoring.” Although most of the teachers saw what they did as meaningful and important from the viewpoint of the society, others (T-4, T-6, T-9) stated a mixed reaction. For instance, T-4 having 17 years of school teaching and 12 years of private tutoring experiences expressed:

```
It Is a mixed reaction. Especially in village, the illiterate people think that private tuition is necessary but the educative people want to be taught their students at school. They don’t support private tutoring.
```

Similarly, T-6 explained this experience as:

```
I think our society has mixed conceptions. Many people appreciate it and perceive that we are playing a good role by helping students to achieve the good result. On the other hand, other people are not considered it as a good job.
```

Thus, the above excerpt exemplifies that the interviewee enacted the belief that social perceptions play the key role for their private tutoring practices. As a schoolteacher, it may be difficult to become a private tutor if a society does not treat it positively particularly parents’ supports in paying the extra fee as the main motive of tutoring is to earn money.

**Professional Ethics of Schoolteachers as Tutors**

Among all the questions, the most sensitive topic appeared to be professional ethics to the teachers who are involved in private tutoring for OoSH education. During the interviews, the teachers explained it in a mixed way. Most of them expressed tutoring is not an ethical job while one is continuing to teach at a school. Particularly, there is no justification stated by the teachers who teach their own students at the tutoring centers. One teacher stated that I should uphold my ethical values of teaching effectively in school rather in a private tutoring center. He explained his stand:
I believe that tutoring is not 100% ethical job. As a schoolteacher, I have to uphold my ethical issues by teaching in a school rather than in a private tutoring center. I believe the responsibility of a teacher is to create a better society where everyone helps to make a society for others (T-7).

Another participant (T-3) echoed the same expression with her feeling of happiness when students do well in the public examination. She elaborated, “I seem that it is not unethical... May be... You think as unethical but you are helping... If they do not make good result will affect on my feeling but I feel happy if they do well” (T-5). Others, T-2, T-3 and T-4, believed that if they obeyed their duties appropriately and teach the classes sincerely during schools’ hours, then private tutoring does not become unethical for them, rather it is a great opportunity for them to practice more and teach the weak students who actually need help. The following statement by one teacher is an illustration of this point:

… ohm... as a teacher I obey my duties... during school hours... PT is a great opportunity to help students, but if I do it commercially... may harmful... earning money by providing proper PT... not illegal to me (T2).

Tools of Marketing Strategies and Professional Ideology

In general, all the teachers interviewed expressed that they did not follow any formal advertisement (i.e., advertisement in TV or newspaper) to attract students to take up private tutoring. Some of them admitted that they do it by following indirect processes (i.e., advise students to take up tutoring). Usually, students and parents collect information regarding their tutoring practices and then request them to participate in private tutoring. It was evidence when T-1 explained his procedure to take on students in the private tutoring at home. When the teacher was asked about his formal or informal advertisement procedures, he elaborated:

… No sir. Normally, the students come to me based on my identity as a teacher. Maybe they prefer to my capacity to teach them. However, I use nameplate informally so that they can identify my home where I engage in private tutoring in a batch [small number of students] (T-1).

Another interviewee (T-4) explained this practice more elaborately when asked how parents were getting info about private tutoring. She clarified:

Yeah... they know everything as they pay money. Moreover, the students tell to their parents and sometimes they come to me... know that without PT they will not pass the exam. Sometimes, parents are more concern than students... (T-5).

Some teachers even started tutoring in a small group and then got more students when their tutoring students passed the information to their friends. She expressed, “at the beginning I started with nine students... spread out the information... very pleased to my tutoring service... Yeah... get information from other students. So, no need to do any advertisement” (T-2).

Another most remarkable point is that sometimes schoolteachers also advised students to take up private tutoring when they found students who are not doing well in schools. It was stated by T-7, “Suppose they are doing well at Mathematics but week in English. Then, I observe their result and consult with guardians about their results in other subjects. Only then I recommend other subjects private tutoring.” The teacher also believed that they got more
tutoring students because of their popularity to be good teachers. For instance, T-6 stated, “may be… I am a well-known private tutor for them. I think students also believe that if they take up tutoring from me, they will achieve the good results.”

Thus, it is evident that the teachers do not use any formal advertisement manual like other countries tutors such as Hong Kong or South Korea. Normally, students or their parents collect information by their personal sources.

Discussion

Regardless of studies in private tutoring across the globe, there is hardly any study that examined teachers’ professional ideology in relation to private tutoring. The present study takes a step forward in addressing this issue by explaining the schoolteachers’ experiences and perceptions who have been tutoring students besides their classroom teaching. The teachers’ statements highlighted that they recurrently struggled to accomplish the dual roles that contribute to the dilemma of their professional ideologies. The analysis revealed their difficulties in getting away from the double roles though they felt that private tutoring affects their professional practices in schools. The teachers stated that they felt more confident and comfortable being professionals in their teaching-learning environment at schools compared to their new roles as tutors. In general, the teachers perceived that it was hard to teach well in the classroom while they had tutoring. This perception has a clear link to their professional commitments and ideologies that they should maintain.

In the context of professional practice, most of the teachers believed that tutoring gives more benefits than harm. The respondents’ analyses revealed that the teachers considered private tutoring an extra window for improving their subject knowledge and assisted them to become more confident in the classroom teaching. Therefore, they justified their out-of-school-hours activities as accommodating professional practices that support their professional development. In contrast, present literature of private tutoring (e.g., Dawson, 2009; Kobakhidze, 2018) highlights these activities as a market-driven nature of professional development as well as exam-orientated teaching-learning practices.

One of the main significant issues of private tutoring is that it appears to be an opportunity for receiving social respect and appreciation in many societies (Bray, 2022; Kobakhidze, 2018). These social trends influence the ideology of teachers, as can be seen in countries particularly in south Asian nations like Bangladesh where parents are highly involved in their children public examination grades (Zwier et al., 2020). In this study, the teachers acknowledged that parents or guardians have positive attitudes toward their tutoring roles because they believed their services as a significant meaning of their children public examination grades. The challenging part of this sense of pride to the teachers is only possible if students achieve good grades in public examinations (Kim, 2019). Thus, the teachers considered their tutoring services as an avenue to earn social respect that can be an option for them to develop professionally.

Teachers’ low engagement in classroom teaching and “fast teaching” strategy (Bray et al., 2018) are intricate issues that contribute to disparity and certainly affect teachers’ professional ideologies. Similar studies (e.g., Bray et al., 2018; Marshall & Fukao, 2019) on private tutoring showed teachers’ inattentiveness in classroom teaching affects students’ learning outcomes. However, the present study goes further to report that schoolteachers’ professional ideologies are questioned because of not being committed to their professional duties. The analysis showed that teachers did not struggle to make the class lessons clear at schools because they felt tired after long hours of private tutoring or had a run to begin again after the formal hours of school teaching. Similarly, students became inattentive in classroom lessons as they believed they would get better teaching in private tutoring.
In terms of market-driven commercial advertisements and government regulations to control tutoring, unlike other countries like South Korea, Singapore, and Hong Kong (e.g., Jung & Seo, 2019; Wong et al., 2020; Yung & Chiu, 2020), schoolteachers of Bangladesh do not tag on any formal advertisement channels to enroll new private tutees, as this is not acceptable in Bangladeshi society. In fact, the Bangladesh authority has a regulation to control commercial advertisements.

Therefore, the correlation between private tutoring and teacher professional ideology, discussed above, appeared to be very complex with both positive and negative dimensions. For instance, in characterizing teacher professional ideology, the study revealed that apart from the teachers’ classroom teaching, personal attributes and values are also significant to uphold their professional ideologies. Hence, teaching professionals should follow moral and ethical values because it conveyed values to students. Thus, the question about professional ideology was among the questions that created the respondents’ exceptional attention as it was one of the most debatable questions. To answer this question, some of them replied based on their current socio-economic condition that connected to the poor living conditions of the teachers and concluded that it was “difficult to follow professional ideology.”

In summary, this study faces several notable challenges. Firstly, the sample size is small, with only nine participants from Bangladesh, which hinders the generalization of the findings to the wider population or the entire country. Secondly, as a qualitative study, the objective is not to provide statistically representative results. Thirdly, potential bias could have affected the interview data due to the existing relationship between the researchers and participants. Moreover, there might be limitations in translating the data from Bangla to English, and the subjective interpretation of the findings could be influenced by personal biases. Lastly, the study’s focus solely on schoolteachers involved in private tutoring during the study period limits its representation of other tuition providers, such as students.

Limitations

Researchers should acknowledge the limitations inherent in all studies. Our study was carried out within a specific context, characterized by distinct attributes and socio-economic culture. Both factors likely influenced how our participants perceived and interpreted OoSH education and the professional ideologies of teachers. It is important to exercise caution when applying our findings to other contexts. Furthermore, the use of convenience sampling to recruit participants restricted our sample to individuals with whom we already had established relationships, potentially limiting the representation of diverse perspectives from those involved in OoSH education and schoolteacher ideology. Lastly, our visible identities likely influenced how participants responded to our interview questions.

References

Bray, M., Kobakhidze, M. N., Zhang, W., & Liu, J. (2018). The hidden curriculum in a hidden


Johnson, L., & Brown, K. (2021). Teachers’ professional ideology and engagement with out-


**Author Note**

Dr. M. Monjurul Islam is a senior lecturer in TESL at the Faculty of Humanities and Social Science at Prime University of Bangladesh. He obtained his PhD from the University of Malaya, Malaysia. Dr. Islam has published many articles in various Scopus indexing journals including Q1 and Q2 journals. His research interests lay in the areas of policy and planning, early childhood, curriculum and instruction, and language teaching-learning. Email: monj0603@gmail.com

Dr. Mohammed Shamsul Hoque is currently a professor of English at Daffodil International University, Bangladesh. With a Cambridge CELTA from the Cambridge University, UK, an M.Ed. TEFL from the University of Wales, and a Ph.D. in TESL from the University Sains Islam Malaysia, he has specialized in Curriculum Development, TESOL, and TEFL methodologies. He has taught English language and literature for over four decades and a half in Bangladesh, Turkey, Malaysia, and the UK. Email: hoque.eng@daffodilvarsity.edu.bd

Dr. Wan Mazlini Binti Othman is currently the Head of English language and literature department and also a senior lecturer at the Faculty of Languages and Communication, Sultan Idris Education University (UPSI). She obtained her PhD from University of Tasmania, Australia. She has more than 22 years of teaching experience in UPSI. Her areas of expertise are in Teaching English as a Second Language (TESL), English Literature, Applied Linguistics and Teacher Education. Email: wan.mazlini@fbk.upsi.edu.my
Dr. Saraswathy Thurairaj is an assistant professor at the Faculty of Creative Industries at Universiti Tunku Abdul Rahman, Malaysia. Dr Saras has been teaching at the tertiary level for the past 23 years. She has also worked together with other academics from Europe and India on her study, and she has published work on topics like entrepreneurship, sustainable development goals, language policies, learning, and teaching. ORCID https://orcid.org/0000-0002-5921-7779. Email: tsaraswathy@utar.edu.my

Ghadah Al Murshidi is currently an associate professor in Curriculum and Instruction, and previously was in Applied Linguistics, in the College of Education, United Arab Emirates University, UAE, where she taught graduate and undergraduate courses. Her recent awards were the best Arab Youth researchers, Comparative and International Education Society annual conference, “Young Emirati Researchers Prize” and Emirati Women award. She is chair of Chair of “Innovation” committee, “Communication and Public Relations” committee, and member of Council for the accreditation of Educator Preparation committee, Mobile Learning Project, and the marketing and publicity committee. She is reviewer of the Journal of Education and Training Studies, British Journal of Education, and English Linguistics Research. Email: g_almurshidi@uaeu.ac.ae

Dr. Latha Ravindran is the Head of the Education Department in SEGi University. Her PhD in TESL from University of Malaya is on English Language Policy changes. She has published papers as well as presented in both local and international conferences. Her areas of research interests include ESL policy implementation, ESL teaching, teacher professional development, curriculum development, learner autonomy, language learning and curriculum development. Email: latharavindran@segi.edu.my

Acknowledgements: We would like to give our heartiest thanks to all the participants of this study.

Conflict of interest: There are no potential conflicts of interest related to this study.

Copyright 2023: M. Monjurul Islam, Mohammed Shamsul Hoque, Wan Mazlini Binti Othman, Saraswathy Thurairaj, Ghadah Al Murshidi, Latha Ravindran, and Nova Southeastern University.

Article Citation