1-1-2018

Countering Violent Extremism in Peshawar Pakistan

Licona Bryan

This document is a product of extensive research conducted at the Nova Southeastern University College of Arts, Humanities, and Social Sciences. For more information on research and degree programs at the NSU College of Arts, Humanities, and Social Sciences, please click here.

Follow this and additional works at: https://nsuworks.nova.edu/shss_dcar_etd

Part of the International Relations Commons, Peace and Conflict Studies Commons, and the Sociology Commons

Share Feedback About This Item

This Dissertation is brought to you by the CAHSS Theses and Dissertations at NSUWorks. It has been accepted for inclusion in Department of Conflict Resolution Studies Theses and Dissertations by an authorized administrator of NSUWorks. For more information, please contact nsuworks@nova.edu.
Countering Violent Extremism in Peshawar Pakistan

by

Bryan Licona

A Dissertation Presented to the
Graduate School of Humanities and Social Sciences of Nova Southeastern University
in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirement for the Degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

Nova Southeastern University
2018
Copyright © by

Bryan Licona
September 2018
Nova Southeastern University
College of Arts, Humanities, and Social Sciences

This dissertation was submitted by Bryan Licona under the direction of the chair of the dissertation committee listed below. It was submitted to the College of Arts, Humanities, and Social Sciences and approved in partial fulfillment for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Conflict Analysis and Resolution at Nova Southeastern University.

Approved:

Date of Defense
9/25/2018

Dustin D. Berna, Ph.D.
Chair

Date of Final Approval
10/8/2018

Jason J. Campbell, Ph.D.

Neil Katz, Ph.D.

Dustin D. Berna, Ph.D.
Chair
Dedication

This is an optional page for a dedication. If you include a dedication, use regular paragraph spacing as shown here (not centered, italicized, or otherwise formatted). If you do not wish to include this page, delete the heading, the body text, and the page break below the end of the text.
Acknowledgments

This is an optional page for acknowledgments. It is a nice place to thank the faculty, family members, and friends who have helped you reach this point in your academic career.

No page number appears on any of the pages up to this point. If you do not wish to include this page, delete the heading and the body text; if a blank page remains, delete the page break above but leave the section break that you see below this text.
Table of Contents

List of Tables ....................................................................................................................... vi
List of Figures ......................................................................................................................... vii
Abstract ...................................................................................................................................... ix

Chapter 1: Introduction to the Study ...................................................................................... 1
  Problem Statement .................................................................................................................. 4
  Purpose Statement .................................................................................................................. 8
  Research Question Process .................................................................................................... 8
  Research Question ................................................................................................................ 10
  Delimitations ........................................................................................................................ 10
  Declaration of Conflicting Interests ....................................................................................... 13
  Funding ................................................................................................................................. 13
  Key Concepts Defined .......................................................................................................... 13
  Abbreviations & Acronyms .................................................................................................. 17

Chapter 2: Literature Review .................................................................................................. 19
  Introduction .......................................................................................................................... 19
  Pakistani Constitution .......................................................................................................... 21
  Pakistani Government .......................................................................................................... 27
    The Era of Praetorianism (1958-1971) .............................................................................. 31
    Benazir Bhutto (1988 – 1990) .......................................................................................... 45
    Nawaz Sharif (1990 – 1993) ............................................................................................ 46
Benazir Bhutto (1993 – 1996) ................................................................. 48
General Pervez Musharraf (1999-2007) ........................................... 49
Conflicts in Pakistan ........................................................................ 52
Violent Extremism ........................................................................... 57
Social Groups .................................................................................... 62
Theoretical Perspectives ................................................................. 66
Theory of Rationalization ............................................................... 66
Theory of Power ............................................................................... 69
General Systems Theory ................................................................. 70
Social Facts (Emile Durkheim) ......................................................... 72
Compare Theoretical Perspective ................................................... 73
Chapter 3: Methodological Approach ............................................ 75
Introduction ..................................................................................... 75
Research Design .............................................................................. 75
Research Paradigm .......................................................................... 77
What is a Paradigm? ....................................................................... 79
Scientific Paradigm .......................................................................... 82
Critique of Scientific Paradigm ....................................................... 86
Interpretive Paradigm .................................................................... 89
Critique of Interpretive Paradigm ................................................... 93
Critical Paradigm ............................................................................ 96
Critique of Critical Paradigm ........................................................ 101
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Paradigm Summary</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Content Analysis</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Content Analysis Process</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Issues of Content Analysis</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture Awareness</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finding Discrepancies in Data</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Triangulation</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Representativeness of Data</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constant Reflection</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Consultation</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theory-Construction and Negative Evidence</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data Collection</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Written Material</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Published Literature</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electronic Database Searches</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manual Databases</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analyzing &amp; Organizing the Literature</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unpublished Literature</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Locating Documents</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observations</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical Artefacts</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary Analysis Data</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Databases to Search</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sampling Strategies and Inclusion Criteria</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Processes for Data Analysis</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analyzing and Reporting Findings</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Triangulation of Data</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethical Considerations</td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reliability Considerations</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Validity Considerations</td>
<td>149</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 4: Results</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data Analysis</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time Line</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data Gathering</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Division of Data</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data Structure</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Action Plan</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Action Plan Analysis</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis of Violent Extremist Attacks</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Results/Findings</td>
<td>190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theoretical Findings</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data Findings</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theme 1 – Word-Based Agency</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theme 2 – Knowledge &amp; Governance</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theme 3 - Accountability</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theme 4 – Closure</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theme 5 – Deontic Orientation</td>
<td>214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 5: Discussion, Conclusions, and Recommendations</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discussion</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significance of Study</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limitations of Study</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendations</td>
<td>223</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Future Research</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td>226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
<td>228</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Tables

Table 1. Heads of State and Prime Ministers of Pakistan, 1947 to Present .................. 28
Table 2. 20 Points of National Action Plan ................................................................. 164
Table 3. N.A.P. Point, Overseeing Institution of N.A.P. Point, & Analysis of Data Point Progress ................................................................. 167
List of Figures

Figure 1. North-West Region of Pakistan .......................................................... 2

Figure 2. Sea Accessibility ............................................................................... 55

Figure 3. Various examples of qualitative sampling ........................................... 130

Figure 4. The Restructuring of Information Sharing ......................................... 166

Figure 5. Chain of Command at Provincial Level ............................................ 167

Figure 6. Number of Deaths in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence (2003 – 2006) .... 172

Figure 7. Number of Deaths in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence (2007 – 2010) .... 173

Figure 8. Number of Deaths in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence (2011 – 2014) .... 174

Figure 9. Number of Deaths in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence (2015 – 2017) .... 175

Figure 10. 2003 In-depth Analysis of Body Count in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence .......................................................................................................................... 176

Figure 11. 2004 In-depth Analysis of Body Count in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence .......................................................................................................................... 177

Figure 12. 2005 In-depth Analysis of Body Count in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence .......................................................................................................................... 178

Figure 13. 2006 In-depth Analysis of Body Count in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence .......................................................................................................................... 179

Figure 14. 2007 In-depth Analysis of Body Count in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence .......................................................................................................................... 180

Figure 15. 2008 In-depth Analysis of Body Count in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence .......................................................................................................................... 181

Figure 16. 2009 In-depth Analysis of Body Count in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence
Figure 17. 2010 In-depth Analysis of Body Count in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence ................................................................. 182

Figure 18. 2011 In-depth Analysis of Body Count in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence ................................................................. 183

Figure 19. 2012 In-depth Analysis of Body Count in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence ................................................................. 184

Figure 20. 2013 In-depth Analysis of Body Count in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence ................................................................. 185

Figure 21. 2014 In-depth Analysis of Body Count in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence ................................................................. 186

Figure 22. 2015 In-depth Analysis of Body Count in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence ................................................................. 187

Figure 23. 2016 In-depth Analysis of Body Count in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence ................................................................. 188

Figure 24. 2017 In-depth Analysis of Body Count in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence ................................................................. 189

viii
Abstract

Spikes of militancy, intolerance, ethnic division and sectarianism have all risen within Pakistan in recent years, yet Pakistan’s continuous battle to deter violent extremism fails to be successful. Following the December 16, 2014 Army Public School (APS) massacre in Peshawar Pakistan little empirical attention has been paid on how the Pakistani government, in the Northwest region of Pakistan, is countering violent extremism (CVE). As well as, its link to policy-making decisions on CVE. This dissertation study sought to analyze the currently active CVE narrative that Pakistan implemented into its Constitution in 2014. This qualitative explanatory case study project focused on operational links that could be traced over time. A content analysis of secondary sources of Pakistani political briefings and press conferences relating to the Pakistani 21st amendment was carried out to identify important themes that emerged. The qualitative analysis of the data generated five themes: (1) word-based agency, (2) knowledge & governance, (3) accountability, (4) closure, and (5) deontic orientation. To assist in addressing the research question, a critical holistic historical qualitative case study analysis was preferred because of its unique strength in incorporating various sources of evidence. Several suggestions of the findings are discussed. These include suggestions for practice and theory, benchmarking of the 21st amendment, and the inclusion of stakeholders in the CVE process.
Spikes of militancy, intolerance, ethnic division and sectarianism have all risen within Pakistan in recent years, yet Pakistan’s continuous battle to deter violent extremism fails to be successful (Javaid, 2011). Various critiques claim that Pakistan’s government, over the years, has failed to address significantly high concerns of security internally and externally (Javaid, 2011). Critiques of the Pakistani government’s policy makers claim that policy decisions have escalated the conflict instead of lessening or managing extremism. Javaid (2011) claims that numerous Taliban and Al-Qaeda groups have found refuge within tribal areas of Pakistan in hopes of ensuring shelter to plan their activities. Sharing a personal experience, Javaid (2011) states that the Afghanistan war has had a ripple effect in Pakistan, contributing to the instability in the North-West region. Due to its geographical location, Pakistan’s Pashtun community is specifically located in the North-West region. Because of its location, Javaid (2011) claims that, the region currently populated by Taliban as their headquarters share not only linguistic elements, but also ethnic relationships.
Figure 1. North-West Region of Pakistan

Ali (2002) contributes an additional element that researchers should observe, the fact that both Afghanistan and the North-West region of Pakistan both have meaningful ties to the same interpretation of Deobandi Islam. Deobandi is a revivalist movement within Sunni (majority Hanafi) Islam (Lapidus, 2002). According to scholars, the upheaval of the Deobandi movement was a reactionary response to British colonialism and is viewed as corrupting Islam (Lapidus, 2002). Shahzad (2011) builds on Lapidus (2002) by claiming that the North-West region is the ideal terrain, offensively and defensively, for militancy training and safe passage travels because of the secret tunnels and safe retreats. Schaffer and Schaffer (2011) move past military strategic advantages/disadvantages and introduce the political element of Pakistan.
According to Schaffer and Schaffer (2011, p. 24), since its independence Pakistan “has been torn between different interpretations of its Islamic identity.” Javaid (2011) claims that contrary to popular belief, the first few years of Pakistan’s independence did not incorporate religion into their political realm. It was not until a few years after its independence, Javaid (2011) states, that key policy makers for varying reasons took it upon themselves to merge religion and political agendas. Hence, both Javaid (2011, p.229) and Schaffer and Schaffer (2011), agree with one another in the belief that “politics of religion in Pakistan has caused immense damage to the society and the state leading to religious hatred, backwardness, intolerance, sectarianism, and ethnicity.”

Without a doubt, Pakistan is at the center of a complex phenomenon. Pakistan is confronted by both domestic and external influences that are playing vital roles in influencing the uprising of militancy and extremism (Khan, 2011). Arif (2010) claims that the instability Afghanistan faces spills over to the Tribal belt of Pakistan and then further into Pakistan. Mir (2010) counters such a claim by stating that the spillage is not the cause effect of extremism within Pakistan, because Pakistan already has a high population of Taliban militants. According to Mir (2010, p. 235), “closely allied with al-Qaeda, the TTP is the main Taliban militant umbrella group in Pakistan and is responsible for most of the suicide bombings, and fidayeen attacks carried out in almost every nook and corner of Pakistan in recent years.”

Javaid (2011, p. 237) makes the claim that “the use of military force (Pakistani military) alone cannot win the war against rising militancy, which poses the biggest internal security threat to the country (Pakistan”). Lodhi (2011, p. 147) raises the concern that to counter the spike in violent extremism the demand for a more holistic strategy is
needed. A holistic approach that incorporates the “political mobilization of the people to combat terrorism” (Lodhi, 2011, p. 147). Therefore, to understand and provide an explanation for Lodhi’s (2011) claim of the need for a more holistic approach my dissertation sought to fill this gap in the literature.

**Problem Statement**

Kordig (1978) claims that it is natural for researchers to subject to theoretical assumptions about a phenomenon after they come about a new (to them) idea. Gutting (1972), claims two separate stages must be reached before a researcher begins to implement approaches to answer these concerns. First, there comes a moment when the researcher is intrigued by a phenomenon and begins to theorize potential solutions to solve the phenomenon (Gutting, 1972). Secondly, the researcher begins to critically web together hypothetical speculations to attempt to validate any and all potential solutions (Gutting, 1972). Hence, through the work of David McClelland (1987, 1985, 1965) and Eleanor Maccoby (1983) I reached my dissertation topic. McClelland (1987, 1985, 1965) claimed that individuals are complex with multiple complex motives, as well as having complex social needs. In addition, McClelland (1987, 1985, 1965) raised awareness to the fact that human beings can be socialized by directly intervening on how they achieve their motives. In an earlier study, McClelland (1965) believed that by manufacturing a humble social environment, by manufacturing social and emotional support systems, and altering the ways in which individuals express their expectations to maximize their potential, individuals could be re-socialized.

Although Maccoby’s (1966) study focused on familial impacts of the socialization process, through her work and McClelland’s (1987, 1985, 1965) work I gained an
appreciation for the study of the socialization process. Even though both scholars studied socialization, the context in which they specialized varied; one focused on the business realm and the other focused on the familial context. Furthermore, both scholars agreed and claimed that individuals within a society, or group, can be motivated to seek varying social and task-based goals. Hence, such scholars have influenced my decision to understand the contextual conditions by which violent extremism could be countered in Peshawar, Pakistan.

Since the beginning of 2017, the Pakistani government has embraced a reactionary strategy to attacks and the interconnected challenges they face from violent extremism (Ahmed, 2017). Although terrorism attacks have decreased significantly over the last decade, Pakistan is facing a different challenge that is alarming the people locally and globally; the uprising of violent extremism (Ahmed, 2017). In the fight against terrorism, the government of Pakistan measure their success against terrorism based on their ability to decrease the number of casualties claimed by terrorism-related actions (Ahmed, 2017; Masood, 2012). Hence, researchers have taken the stance of stating that intolerance and extremist behavior continually rise in Pakistan and need to be addressed in a more effective manner (Masood, 2012; Cockcroft, Andersson, Milne, Omer, Ansari, Khan, & Chaudhry, 2009).

Scholars, both locally and internationally, have conducted multiple studies focused on countering violent extremism. These scholars have focused their studies on expanding peace education interventions within Islamic seminaries, referred to as Madaris (Komatsu, 2009; Behrman, Ross, & Sabot, 2008; Behrman, Khan, Ross, & Sabot, 1997). In these studies, the scholars have structured their intervention models for
countering violent extremism (CVE) to include local teachers and students from both the public and the private schools, to bring the community together for countering violent extremism (CVE). As well as, shining a light on the flaws of educational curriculum and the need to improve the quality of education.

Prior research studies on CVE in Pakistan have focused on four important topics. Several exploratory studies have sought to support the connection between CVE and education, noting that research supports the linkage between the types of schools in Pakistan, referred to as madrasas, curriculum and militant Islamic fundamentalism (McClure, 2009; Blanchard, 2008; International Crisis Group, 2007; Kronstadt, 2004, Looney, 2003; ICG, 2002, Singer, 2001). Other studies have focused on finding links between militancy support and economic status (Blair, Fair, Malhotra, & Shapiro, 2013; Bullock, Will, Kosuke Imai, & Shapiro, 2011; Firdous, 2009; USAID, 2009; Aziz, 2009).

These studies proposed the creation of new jobs to give Pakistani community members a task to refocus their attention from joining militancy groups. In addition, some of these scholars have gone as far as to assume that higher poverty would increase the sympathy for militant groups; however, their studies showed the opposite was supported. Fewer studies have examined linguistic markers associated with extremist violence, radical violence, or the misrepresentation of education on social media for Pakistani community members (Cohen, Johansson, Kaati, & Mork, 2014; McClure, 2009). For example, research on social media lone wolf terrorists and perpetrators of political representatives tend to align themselves as some type of warrior, an individual that is prepared to engage in a disciplined fashion of violence for a “greater cause” than herself/himself (Spaaij, 2012; Meloy & O’Toole, 2011).
However, aside from revamping the educational system within Pakistan, little empirical attention has been paid on how the Pakistani government in the Northwest region of Pakistan is countering violent extremism and its link to policy-making decisions on CVE. As a result, a gap in the scholarly literature exists, which my dissertation sought to bridge and to fulfill. Some would argue, and others would learn to accept, that effective governance is linked to institutional and governmental policy processes (Lodhi, 2011; Wenger, Andreas, Zimmermann, & Doron, 2010; Shah, 1997). Scholars argue that the outcomes achieved by both forms of processes are vital in the achievement of stable progression, long-term development, and lasting peace (Christmann, 2012; Crone, & Harrow, 2011). In addition, effective governance, according to scholars, must be viewed and planned as a never ending (continuous) process (McDonald & Mir, 2011). To ensure the stability and effectiveness of such process requires public/societal establishments to assume the duty of key players and become catalysts, because these are the same institutions that are held accountable in the management of societal resources and are looked upon to fulfill basic human rights/needs (Abbas & Siddique, 2012; Lindekiilde, 2012; McDonald & Mir, 2011; O’Duffy, 2008). Hence, basic human rights/needs that are free of corruption, exploitation, and abuse to the people were the reason that they were established in the first place. Established with the goal and hopes that these institutions will follow the law to ensure equity and equality are protected. According to scholars, protection of equity and equality through the distribution of “human, civil, cultural, economic, political and social rights” (Miller, 2011). Hence, one can speculate that the lack of effective governance is the foundation on which corruption, lack of incompetence, inequalities, lack of justice and societal abuses thrive and remain constant. Therefore,
such an environment fosters anarchy and chaos, two key ingredients that scholars claim are the foundation for conflict creation.

**Purpose Statement**

In this dissertation, I sought to investigate the Northwest region of Pakistan’s violent extremism national transformation to countering violent extremism that occurred prior and after January 06, 2015. To meet my research goals, I assured to incorporate Yin’s (2014) Case Study Research approach. Within this dissertation, I conducted a qualitative study by analyzing historical documents. The goals for my dissertation were as follow: (1) to obtain a better understanding of the countering violent extremism transformation that occurred within the Pakistani government, (2) to defend my methodological approach for my dissertation, (3) to define the complex conditions that influence violent extremism, radicalization, and recruitment within the Northwest region of Pakistan, (4) to describe the methods by which I analyzed the case study data using explanation building and time-series analysis, (5) to explain how I connected my theoretical perspectives with the data generated, my literature review, and the methodological approach literature review, and (6) to be as transparent as possible in raising awareness to any and all research limitations I foresee.

**Research Question Process**

Benschop and Doorewaard (2012) claims that research questions are thoughts researchers have regarding a specific phenomenon that are sorted, organized, and categorized until the researcher reaches an exact question she/he seeks to answer. In addition, the way in which questions are formulated will guide the researcher in designing and conducting the study to achieve the research objectives (Benschop &
According to Benschop and Doorewaard (2012), a research question for a case study project must meet two requirements; (1) the question itself needs to be meaningful and effective at guiding the researcher through the complex process of designing and conducting the study, and (2) the set of questions a study seeks to answer should be structured in the most effectively and smoothest fashion possible to facilitate the flow of the study. Yin (2014) simplifies this by claiming that the form of the question the researcher seeks to answer throughout her/his study will shine a light on the most effective methodological approach to use. Thus, case study methodology most commonly seeks to address “How” and “why” research questions (Yin, 2014).

As any novice researcher will quickly understand, generating a topic worth researching is not as easy as many scholars portray the process to be. As a result, in this dissertation I implemented Chenail’s (2011) “Ten Steps for Conceptualizing and Conducting Qualitative Research Studies in a Pragmatically Curious Manner” to assist me in the process of narrowing down my broad topic. Chenail (2011) claims that researchers should ask themselves specific fundamental questions to help develop their research idea and provides researchers with ten steps to reach a topic. (1) Who do you want to study and from whose perspective do you want to learn about? In this dissertation, I sought to study the Northwest region of Pakistan (Peshawar) from Pakistan’s policy-makers’ perspective. (2) What aspect about this phenomenon would be your focus? My areas of focus for this dissertation is the anti-extremism movement narrative implemented by policy-makers and the change that occurred, if at all, over time. (3) When would you focus on this phenomenon? In this dissertation, I focused on the time period from January 1, 2003 to January 31, 2015, the timeframe prior to the
Pakistani government adding their twenty-first (21) Constitutional Amendment act to counter violent extremism (CVE) AND February 1, 2015 to February 28, 2017; the time frame after the twenty-first (21) Constitutional Amendment to counter violent extremism was put into effect and enforced. (4) Where would you observe this phenomenon? Since the Peshawar Army Public School massacre (reason/tipping-point for the twenty-first Constitutional Amendment) occurred on December of 2014, I was not able to directly observe this phenomenon. As a result, the goal of this dissertation was to conduct a historical analysis. (5) Why would you study this phenomenon? It was my goal to understand and effectively explain how the Pakistani government helped, if at all, make structural changes to help counter violent extremism. (6) How will you generate data in order to study this phenomenon? It was my goal to generate data for this dissertation through document retrieval; media, CVE and related-field research databases, academic material, and reports from government (official) sources and non-governmental organizations (NGOs), universities, and think tanks.

**Research Question**

As a result, through Chenail’s (2011) approach this dissertation’s case study research question is:

*How has Pakistan’s Countering Violence Extremism narrative influenced (or not) the conditions that enable countering violent extremist recruitment and radicalization in the North-West province (Peshawar) of Pakistan?*

**Delimitations**

Simon and Goes (2013, p. 3) define delimitations as “those characteristics that arise from limitations in the scope of the study (defining the boundaries) and by the
conscious exclusionary and inclusionary decisions made during the development of the study plan.” The first step in the delimiting process, according to Simon and Goes (2013), is to explain and defend the rational for wanting to study the phenomenon; as well as explain why the researcher(s) did not undertake another approach to studying the specific phenomenon. Therefore, I assured to explain that process first. Previous scholars, from various disciplines, have attempted to address the numerous forms of violent extremist concerns that Pakistan face. Educators advocate that the poor educational system, or inability to join an institution, of Pakistan has led to the rise of violent extremism (Rahman, 2004; Mumtaz, 2000; Saigol, 1995). Psychological researchers claim that numerous mental concerns have led to the increase in violence (Amiot, Valleran, Blanchard, 2006; Baumeister, Bushman, & Campbell, 2000; Brown, 2000; Greenberg, Solomon, & Pyszczynski, 1997; Aron, Aron, & Smullan, 1992). Economist provide trade developmental suggestions to help increase the flow of revenue and resources to provide stability in the region; thereby curbing the desire to join militant groups (Berman, 2009; Collier & Rohner, 2009; Rashid, 2008; Piazza, 2006; Zahid, 2002, Rashid, 2001). But my study sought to take a sociological approach. I sought to analyze and explain the process by which Pakistan policy-makers shifted/transformed into supporting and implementing their 21st constitutional amendment to counter violent extremism after the 2014 Peshawar, Pakistan school massacre that left 141 dead.

I decided to take a qualitative approach, instead of quantitative, because I sought to provide an explanation of the chronological events that took place prior to the Army Public School massacre, while also explaining how Pakistan has, if at all, made changes to counter violent extremism. Through the literature review process, I found sources that
pushed me away from conducting a quantitative dissertation. The reporting of deaths and violent extremism incidents raised numerous validity and reliability concerns that far outweighed conducting a qualitative study. Therefore, I resorted to conducting a holistic historical qualitative case study dissertation. This dissertation study focused on the countering violent extremism narrative that the Pakistani government added to their constitution in 2015. This dissertation study does not attempt to measure the significant (or non-significant) impact that the narrative has had on decreasing violent extremism. In addition, this dissertation study does not attempt to provide lived experiences of individuals directly connected to the 2014 Army Public School massacre that took place in Peshawar Pakistan.

As a result, within this dissertation project the researcher assured to conduct a holistic analysis not an individualistic analysis (Yin, 2014). Although one critique of this study may be that the study fails to incorporate individual’s lived experiences, the researcher intends to conduct such research studies after the completion of this dissertation project. In addition, due to the current climate within the region and security concerns it would not be feasible to travel to Peshawar Pakistan to interview Tehrik-i-Taliban; to obtain direct statements to outline, analyze, and understand their planning process for the 2014 attack. Furthermore, due to the high restrictions of traveling to certain regions of the world, it would be too problematic to obtain travel clearances and ensure my safety in Peshawar Pakistan to conduct an ethnography study. As a result, due to the restrictions and constraints I have presented the audience has a better understanding of why this study has been designed with the techniques I intended to implement/execute.
Declaration of Conflicting Interests

The author declares no potential conflicts of interest with respect to the research, authorship, and/or publication of this dissertation.

Funding

The author received no financial support for the research, authorship, and/or publication of this dissertation.

Key Concepts Defined

As any researcher will quickly come to understand and learn to accept, during the research process it is not uncommon for readers to be confused by technical jargon; especially if they fail to have a point of reference that defines such terminologies (Creswell 2009). Since it is possible that the audience of this dissertation study may vary on the area of discipline they specialize in, for the purpose of this dissertation study, I seek to clearly define my terminologies. Following Creswell’s (2009) recommendation, by clearly defining key terminologies of my study I seek to minimize any language/interpretation concerns that can ultimately hinder the precision of the use of terms in a research project. Creswell (2009) seeks to help graduate students, in the process of writing their research proposals, by suggesting to clearly define key terminology within in its own section of a research study. Such an action will help readers early on to understand the terminology and facilitate the reading and understanding process of this dissertation study.

Abiding by Creswell’s (2009) recommendation, below I have provided definitions of key terms within this introduction chapter. It is my goal to help readers understand the value of these important terms that will be used within this qualitative case study. The
terms provided below have been structured not by their importance, they are simply structured in alphabetical order.

**Case Study Research Approach** – An all-comprehensive methodology that scrutinizes a recent, complex, contemporary situation through an empirical inquiry facilitated by theoretical proposals, that ultimately dictate the process of collecting, triangulating, analyzing, and presenting multiple sources of evidence (Yin, 2014).

**Conflict** – “Perceived divergence of interest, a belief that the parties’ current aspirations are incompatible” (Pruitt & Kim, 2004, p. 7-8).

**Constant Comparison** – “A procedure used during grounded theory research whereby newly gathered data are continually compared with previously collected data and their coding in order to refine the development of theoretical categories. The purpose is to test emerging ideas that might take the research in new and fruitful directions” (Gibbs, 2007, p. 148).

**Context** – Knowledge/information that surrounds a specific event that is inseparably constricted by the specific event’s meaning (Hall & Hall, 1990).

**Culture** – An accumulation of experiences, which are created, learned, and transferred in a structured and organized format through various mediums, such as messages, images, artifacts, etc. by individuals from one generation to the next generation (Avruch, 2003).

**Extremism** – Is a complex phenomenon that cannot be easily defined. As a general definition, “it can be defined as activities (beliefs, attitudes, feelings, actions, strategies) of a character far removed from the ordinary. In conflict settings, it manifests as a severe form of conflict engagement” (Bartoli & Coleman, 2003). Thus, this
researcher feels obligated to express that the process by which individuals/groups label other individuals/groups as “extremist,” and the process of outlining what should be considered “ordinary” within any context (conflict or not) is always a subjective and political process.

**High-Context Culture** – The decryption (reading between the lines) of information/messages because authentic meanings are not explicitly expressed or written. “Communication or message is one in which most of the information is either in the physical context or internalized in the person, while very little is in the coded, explicit, or transmitted part of the message” (Hall, 1976, p. 91).

**Legitimacy** – “The moral and legal right to rule, which is based on law, custom, heredity, or the consent of the governed; with reference to a government, a state recognized by members of the international community” (Khan, 2012, p. viii)

**Low - Context Culture** – Hall (1976) claims, information/message is directly expressed as intended to be received; providing additional explanation to clearly transmit information to receiver. Messages reveal what is missing in the context.

**Normative** – “Relating to ethical rules; in foreign policy and international affairs, standards suggesting what a policy should be” (Khan, 2012, p. ix).

**Power** – “A relationship between two individuals, groups, or states in which one party has the ability both to influence the other and to force outcomes that the other party may not want” (Khan, 2012, p. ix).

**Sanctions** – “Economic, diplomatic, and even coercive military force for enforcing a state’s policy or legal obligations; (punishing a state)” (Khan, 2012, p. x).
**Social Research Process** - A framework to guide researchers in constructing structures used to explore, to analyze, and to explain a social phenomenon (Crotty, 1998).

**State** – “The organized political unit which has a geographic territory, a stable population, and a government that is externally independent and has not come into existence in violations of Public International Law” (Khan, 2012, p. x).

**System** – An overarching network of components, which operates through the interrelationship of its parts (Luhmann, 2012).

**Talibanization** – “Refers to the political process of, officially sanctioned, that is through government policy or through the activities of non-state entities, including political parties and other associations, that transforms a Muslim society towards an extreme form of Islamic principles. Alludes to the practices of Taliban government in Afghanistan, 1996 – November 2001” (Khan, 2012, p. x).

**Terrorism** – “Acts by non-state actors involving the threatened or actual use of illegal force or violence to attain a political, economic, religious, or social goal through fear, coercion, or intimidation” (Lafree & Dugan, 2007).

**Violent Extremism** – Per the Federal Bureau of Investigation (FBI), “encouraging, condoning, justifying, or supporting the commission of a violent act to achieve political, ideological, religious, social, or economic goals.”

**Countering** – Reverse action of response to end, disrupt or reverse hostile acts or victimization processes.

**Countering Violent Extremism** – Per the United Nations Security Council Counter-Terrorism Committee resolution 2178 (2014), “on stemming the flow of foreign terrorist fighters (FTFs), the Council underscores that CVE is an ‘essential element’ in
addressing the threat to international peace and security posed by FTFs. By engaging with relevant local communities and non-governmental actors in developing strategies to counter the violent extremist narrative that can incite terrorist acts. States are also called upon to address the conditions conducive to the spread of violent extremism, including by empowering youth, families, women, religious, cultural and education leaders, and all other concerned groups of civil society, and promoting social inclusion and cohesion”

**Radicalization** – A change in belief, feeling, or behavior toward increased support for intergroup conflict (McCauley & Moskalenko, 2008)

**Abbreviations & Acronyms**

- ANP – Awami National Party
- CENTCOM – United States Central Command
- Cento – Central Treaty Organization
- CFT – Counter Financing for Terrorists
- CMLA – Chief Martial Law Administrator
- FATA – Federally Administered Tribal Areas
- FBISE – Federal Board of Intermediate & Secondary Education
- HEC – Higher Education Commission
- ISAF – International Security Assistance Force (in Afghanistan)
- ISI – Inter Services Intelligence (Directorate of)
- ITMP – Ittehad-e-Tanjeem-ul-Madris Pakistan
- JI – Jamaat – e- Islami
- JUI – Jamiat – Ulema – e- Islam
- JUP – Jamiat – e – Pakistan
• NACTA – National Counter Terrorism Authority
• NAP – National Action Plan
• NISP – National Internal Security Policy
• NATO – North Atlantic Treaty Organization
• NTF – National Task Force
• NWFP – North West Frontier Province
• OIC – Organization of the Islamic Conference
• PMC-N – Pakistan Muslim League (Nawaz Sharif faction)
• PPP – Pakistan People’s Party
• PTI – Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf
• TTP – Tehrik-e-Taliban Pakistan
• UNGA – United Nations General Assembly
• UNSC – United Nations Security Council
• WTO – World Trade Organization
Chapter 2: Literature Review

Introduction

It is not uncommon for scholars to stumble on articles, books, interviews, and media opinion articles from an individual claiming that terrorists struggle with specific psychopathologies or/and that these terrorists assume a specific characteristic profile that naturally causes them to conduct violent acts. However, numerous scholars challenge such notions and claim terrorists are not any more or any less likely to have psychopathic traits than you or me (Feinberg, 2013; Kruglanksi & Fishman, 2009; Horgan, 2008; Silke, 1998). LaFree and Ackerman (2009), provide one of many countering claims in support of the stance that psychopathic traits are not the cause of terrorist violence. According to LaFree and Ackerman (2009), significant evidence exists that links terrorism to political elements; such as the legitimacy of the representatives/administration, the conversion to a democratic government, and the stability of the state. In addition, Lum, Kennedy, and Sherley conducted a (2006) study that found a significant relationship between various political party groups agenda, specifically antiterrorism campaigns and terrorist patterns. According to their study, depending on the severity of the politician’s campaign agenda the findings support the claim that agenda severity had a significant influence on either reducing or increasing deterrence (Lum, Kennedy, Sherley, 2006).

Other scholars have sought to study the connection between macro-level social activity and political variables (Feinberg, 2013). According to Feinberg (2013), the stages by which groups are formed have been found to have a significant influence in forecasting terrorist acts. Scholars focused on social networks have claimed that the associations and bonds individuals have within communities revealed significant
influence on the sustainability of terrorist networks and the expansion of their recruitment process (Asal & Rethemeyer, 2008; Sageman, 2008; Sageman, 2004). Feinberg (2013) elaborates on these claims by stating that terrorist group cultures and ideas need to be studied and understood; the groups social norms, their individualistic values, and personal beliefs must all be taken into consideration and analyzed further.

Some of the first scholars to make note of terrorist group cultures have shined a light on a different perspective to understand terrorists (Feinberg, 2013; Ginges & Atran, 2009; Atran, Axelrod, & Davis, 2008). In their studies, these scholars raised awareness to *sacred values* that influenced how terrorist conduct their acts. Other scholars sought to understand the “shared reality” that terrorist groups fostered (Kruglanski, Chen, Dechesne, Fishman, & Orehek, 2009). In their study, they found supportive evidence claiming that shared realities play a crucial role in triggering a group to commit acts of violence against those not within the group; those acts were glorified and mystified to give members status within a community/group and a sense of honor. Building on these scholar’s work, Feinberg (2013, p. 497) sought to answer: “Are there national cultural differences in the degree to which terrorism thrives or is thwarted?” Feinberg (2013) sought to study *macro cultural context* predictors of terrorist. In the study, Feinberg (2013) found significant correlations between terrorism and cultural factors. More in-depth, communities that strongly align themselves with the beliefs that (1) their life and/or destiny is fixed, (2) live by strict customs and/or norms and use severe means to realign any deviations to those customs, and (3) have a clear gender imbalance were found to have significantly higher levels of terrorism behaviors than other communities with varying cultural factors (Feinberg, 2013).
But the study conducted by scholars, such as Kruglanski, Chen, Dechesne, Fishman, and Orehek (2009) and Feinberg (2013), leave a gap in the literature that my dissertation sought to bridge and to fill. In this dissertation I sought to investigate, through multiple theoretical perspectives, the mechanisms that contribute to violent extremism within Pakistan and the ways in which Pakistan have countered violent extremism since implementing the twenty-first constitutional amendment. To begin, this chapter will introduce the concept of violent extremism, provide a better understanding of the forms of violent extremism Pakistan battles, and the various attempts made to counter violent extremism within Pakistan. In addition, a literature review of the Pakistani Constitution, the Pakistani Government, and the theoretical perspectives will be presented and defended.

**Pakistani Constitution**

At the time of independence, in 1947, Pakistan was governed by the 1935 Government of India Act; at the time of their independence Pakistan did not introduce their own Constitution, instead they amended the Government of India Act of 1935 (Becker, 1995). According to the literature, the modifications made to the Government of India Act of 1935 restructured the leadership roles (Becker, 1995). The first revision focused on appointing a governor-general to the leadership role of head of state for Pakistan (Becker, 1995). The second modification sought to create and empower a Constituent Assembly that worked together but served differing functions; the first function was to frame and create a constitution for Pakistan (Becker, 1995). The second function of the Constituent Assembly was to be a legitimate, temporary, federal legislature until a formally accepted and enforced constitution would be created and
enforced (Becker, 1995). Prior to Pakistan establishing their independence, Muhammad Ali Jinnah was the overarching authority within the region (Taj, Nouman, Gul, 2014; Baxter, 1995, p. 37). According to the literature, seven years after the Lahore Resolution Pakistan achieved its independence (Baxter, 1995, p. 37). According to the literature, governor-general Muhammad Ali Jinnah was also referred to as Quaid-i-Azam (translation: Great Leader) and Baba-i-Quan (translation: Father of the Nation) (Baxter, 1995, p. 37). As governor-general, Jinnah took control as head of government and dominated the ceremonial duties of head of state (Taj, Nouman, Gul, 2014; Baxter, 1995, p. 37). According to scholars, after taking on such powers Jinnah sought to expand on the government and created the (1) Muslim League assembly and the (2) function of the office of president to oversee the Constituent Assembly (Taj, Nouman, Gul, 2014; Baxter, 1995, p. 37). Scholars claim that the Muslim League, when compared to the Indian National Congress, was improperly introduced and structured (Talbot, 2005).

Although short lived, prior to his death after assuming the role of governor-general for thirteen months following Pakistan’s independence, Jinnah initiated the first attempt to creating Pakistan’s first constitution. According to the literature, Liaquat Ali Khan, lieutenant of Muhammad Ali Jinnah, assumed the role of prime minister after Jinnah died (Baxter, 1995, p. 37). Scholars claim that Liaquat was the first to formally envision and attempt to outline a constitution for Pakistan (Baxter, 1995, p. 37). Initially, the Constituent Assembly of India assumed the role of Pakistan’s initial Constituent Assembly (Baxter, 1995). The Constituent Assembly of India was an eight-member committee that functioned as Pakistan’s formal legislature (Baxter, 1995). According to scholars, the Constituent Assembly was bestowed formally with the credit of bringing to
life the March 1949 Objectives Resolution (Baxter, 1995). According to the resolution, Pakistan would be established as, and recognized as, Islamic, democratic, and federal (Baxter, 1995).

According to the literature, in theory the Objectives Resolution of March 1949 was effective and managed to achieve buy-in from the public and committee members (Baxter, 1995). However, implementing and enforcing the Objectives Resolution of March 1949 raised concerns and proved to be more difficult than expected. Firstly, the resolution failed to address the limitations/boundaries of executive power for both the prime minister role and the governor-general (Baxter, 1995). Secondly, the resolution lacked clear guidelines describing how the center and the provinces would distribute powers (Baxter, 1995). Thirdly, the Objectives Resolution of March 1949 lacked outlining the balance of power of both political wings (Baxter, 1995); mainly within the context of the electoral process. Lastly, the resolution failed to address the interconnection between the overall government and Islam (Baxter, 1995). According to scholars, in 1951 Liaquat Ali Khan was assassinated and the flaws within the Objectives Resolution of March 1949 were left unresolved (Baxter, 1995). In the years following the assassination of Liaquat none of the resolution issues were resolved, instead the assassination resulted in uniting parties together which created a political division that will be discussed in more detail in the following section.

After declaring independence in 1947, it took Pakistan nine (9) years to formally outline, draft, and introduce to the public its first constitution; in the year 1956 (Becker, 1995). According to the literature, the following passage found written within the
Objectives Resolution of March 1949 and created by the Constituent Assembly was the first step towards outlining Pakistan’s first constitution:

“Wherein the principles of democracy, freedom, equality, tolerance and social justice, as enunciated by Islam, shall be fully observed; wherein the Muslims shall be enabled to order their lives in the individual and collective spheres in accordance with the teachings and requirements of Islam as set out in the Holy Quran and Sunna; [and] wherein adequate provision shall be made for the minorities freely to progress and practice their religions and develop their cultures” (Becker, 1995, p. 204).

According to scholars, by reading the passage above presented by the Constituent Assembly, readers received a brief introduction that clearly outlined the fundamental principles of the new state; Pakistan (Becker, 1995). Scholars claim that the following seven (7) passages were turmoiled by debates on how to reach a consensus on key vital concerns; such as, the proper ways various regions would be granted representation within the government and the proper structure of the state’s constitution (Becker, 1995).

Ayub Khan, whom I will speak more about in the following section to come in this chapter, in 1962 put an end to martial law in Pakistan; created and empowered his version of a presidential form of government and bestowed upon the presidential role amplified financial, executive, and legislative powers (Becker, 1995). According to scholars, seven (7) years later, in 1969, the constitution created by Ayub Khan was repudiated (Becker, 1995). With the resignation of Ayub Khan, Yahya Khan stepped into the role of president and instead of enforcing or creating a constitution, enforced martial law and appointed himself chief martial law administrator (Becker, 1995). According to
the literature, it was not until April 1973 that Pakistan introduced a new constitution (Becker, 1995). The constitution of April 1973, according to researchers, was not formally implemented and enforced until August 14, 1973 (Becker, 1995); which happened to be Pakistan’s twenty-sixth (26) independence anniversary.

The 1973 constitution of Pakistan accomplished something that the previous editions failed to do. The 1973 constitution addressed three core issues that all parties agreed upon (Becker, 1995). First, the 1973 constitution raised awareness on the issue of the role of Islam (Becker, 1995). Secondly, the literature shows that the concerns revolving the sharing of power amongst the provinces and the federal government within Pakistan were addressed within the newly constructed constitution (Becker, 1995). Thirdly, the constitution realigned the functions of the president and the prime minister (Becker, 1995). Specifically, the realignment favored and enhanced the governing power of the prime minister role over the presidential role. According to scholars, the constitution of 1973 also made two significant advances that were often overlooked. The constitution formed a bicameral legislature that also had a Senate, so that the provinces with lower numbers had proper representation (Becker, 1995). In addition, the constitution paved the way for a National Assembly, in which each province was granted a seat for representation (Becker, 1995). Secondly, within the 1973 constitution Islam was formally designated as the official religion of the state of Pakistan (Becker, 1995).

According to the literature, in 1977 the constitution in place was once again nulled and martial law was initiated (Becker, 1995). According to scholars, in the following years Pakistan gradually transitioned into an Islamic state; on the assumption that in order for Pakistan to survive and progress as a state it would have to become
Islamic (Becker, 1995). According to the literature, in 1985 martial law ended and a new constitution was introduced and enforced (Becker, 1995). The 1985 constitution was a modified version of the previously recognized 1973 constitution (Becker, 1995). Within the new 1985 constitution, a power shift occurred; the president now held more power than the prime minister (Becker, 1995). According to the 1985 constitution, anyone in the role of the president has the full power to assign and remove the prime minister (Becker, 1995). Furthermore, the constitution gave power to provincial governors, by which these governors could at their discretion eliminate both the assemblies within various provinces and the national assemblies (Becker, 1995). Finally, the ratified 1985 constitution revived and emphasized an article that was originally written by the Constituent Assembly in the 1949, 1956, 1962, and 1973 constitutions (Becker, 1995). The Objectives Resolution emphasized that in regard to Pakistan:

“Wherein the Muslims shall be enabled to order their lives in the individual and collective spheres in accordance with the teachings and requirements of Islam as set out in the Holy Quran and the Sunnah” (Becker, 1995, p. 209).

Hence, in 1985 Pakistan embraced a new constitution and the government along with the people adopted and recognized the state’s new name and status; the Islamic Republic of Pakistan (Becker, 1995). Under the new constitution, the people of Pakistan would recognize a federal parliamentary system (Becker, 1995). Within such a system the role of the president would be the head of state and the role of the prime minister would need to be popularly elected and serve as head of Pakistan’s government (Becker, 1995).
According to scholars, to understand the history of Pakistan readers must first understand the concept of “the two nations theory” (Baxter, 1995, 28). According to the literature, in 1929 Motilal Nehru summoned all parties for a conference (Baxter, 1995). Scholars believe the 1929 conference by all parties initiated the actions that lead to Pakistan’s independence (Baxter, 1995). In 1930, Sir Muhammad Iqbal made the claim that India was a miniaturized example of Asia (Baxter, 1995). Thusly, Sir Muhammad Iqbal claimed that any form of government that was brought together under one umbrella was implausible for India (Baxter, 1995). Instead, Sir Muhammad Iqbal emphasized religious community and/or identity should be the fundamental basis for identification, not the location and/or territory limitations of the people (Baxter, 1995). For Sir Muhammad Iqbal the concept of communalism was the key element that would aid India in achieving long-term peace and stability (Baxter, 1995). As a result, the literature supports the notion that Iqbal stressed the importance of creating and legitimizing a confederated India (Baxter, 1995); in which, Punjab, NWFP, Sindh, and Balochistan would all be grouped together into a Muslim state (Baxter, 1995). Building on Iqbal, three years later in 1933 a group of Cambridge students in Britain accomplished what Iqbal failed to do three years earlier, give a name to the philosophized state (Baxter, 1995).

In 1933, the Cambridge students in Britain took a firm stance against three core issues. First, the students opposed the concept of a federation for the region (Baxter, 1995). Secondly, the students reiterated the idea presented by Iqbal that India was not and should not be a single country (Baxter, 1995). Thirdly, Baxter (1995) claims that the
Cambridge students advocated and stressed the need for the partition into various segments. Specifically, demanding that the North-West region gain legitimacy and be recognized as Pakistan (Baxter, 1995). According to scholarly research, the creation of the term Pakistan is a result of:

“Composed of letters taken from the names of our homelands: that is Punjab, Afghanistan [North-West Frontier Province], Kashmir, Iran, Sindh, Tukharistan, Afghanistan, and Balochistan. It means the land of the Paks, the spiritually pure and clean” (Baxter, 1995, p. 29)

In its more than seventy years of history, Pakistan has faced various forms of political instability that range across the spectrum from cabinet transitions, various coups, multiple assassinations, and dismissals (Khan & Saqib, 2008). Khan and Saqib (2008) believe it is virtually impossible to effectively create, introduce, and enforce consistent and coherent policies during times of political instability.

Table 1

Heads of State and Prime Ministers of Pakistan, 1947 to Present

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tenure</th>
<th>Governor Generals</th>
<th>End of Tenure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>August 14, 1947 to</td>
<td>Quaid-e-Azam</td>
<td>Expired in office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>September 11, 1948</td>
<td>Mohammed Ali</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Jinnah (Father of</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>the Nation)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>September 14, 1948 to</td>
<td>Khawaja Nazimuddin</td>
<td>Became Prime Minister; replaced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>October 19, 1951</td>
<td></td>
<td>by Malik Ghulam Mohammad</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>October 19, 1951 to August 7, 1955</td>
<td>Malik Ghulam Mohammad</td>
<td>Forced to resign by Iskandar Mirza</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>August 7, 1955 to March 23, 1956</td>
<td>Major General Iskandar Mirza</td>
<td>Became President</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tenure</th>
<th>Presidents</th>
<th>End of Tenure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>March 23, 1956 to October 27, 1958</td>
<td>Major General Iskandar Mirza</td>
<td>Overthrown by General Mohammad Ayub Kham</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>October 27, 1958 to March 25, 1969</td>
<td>Field Marshal Mohammad Yahya Khan</td>
<td>Resigned following widespread protests</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Start Date</td>
<td>End Date</td>
<td>Incumbent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>to December 20, 1971</td>
<td>Yahya Khan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>to September 16, 1978</td>
<td>General Mohammad Zia-ul-Haq</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>September 16, 1978</td>
<td>Ghulam Ishaq Khan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>to August 17, 1988</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>August 17, 1988</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>to July 18, 1993</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>July 18, 1993</td>
<td>November 14, 1993</td>
<td>Wasim Sajjad</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>to December 2, 1997</td>
<td>Leghari</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>December 2, 1997</td>
<td>Wasim Sajjad</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>to January 1, 1998</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>January 1, 1998</td>
<td>Justice (Ret.) Rafique Tarrar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>to June 20, 2001</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>June 20, 2001</td>
<td>General Parvez Musharraf</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>to October 15, 2007</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>August 15, 1947</td>
<td>October 16, 1951</td>
<td>Khan Liaqat Ali Khan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>to October 17, 1953</td>
<td>Khawaja Nazimuddin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>October 17, 1951</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>to April 17, 1953</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>April 17, 1953</td>
<td>Mohammad Ali Bogra</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>to August 11, 1955</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>August 11, 1955</td>
<td>Chaudhry Mohammad Ali</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>to September 12, 1956</td>
<td>Hussain Shaheed Suhrwardy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>September 12, 1956</td>
<td>I.I. Chundrigar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>to October 18, 1957</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>October 18, 1957</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>to December 16, 1957</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Period</td>
<td>Prime Minister</td>
<td>Reason</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>December 16, 1957 to October 7, 1958</td>
<td>Malik Feroze Khan Noon</td>
<td>Removed when Ayub Khan imposed Martial Law</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>December 7, 1971 to December 20, 1971</td>
<td>Nurul Amin</td>
<td>Removed after the fall of Dhaka</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>December 2, 1988 to August 6, 1990</td>
<td>Benazir Bhutto</td>
<td>Dismissed by president Ghulam Ishaq Khan under article 58(2)/(b).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>August 6, 1990 to November 6, 1990</td>
<td>Ghulam Mustafa Khan Jatoi</td>
<td>Caretaker capacity replaced when the Muslim League dominated IJI swept the polls</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>November 6, 1990 to April 18, 1993</td>
<td>Mian Mohammad Nawaz Sharif</td>
<td>Dismissed by president Ghulam Ishaq Khan under Article 58(2)/(b).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>April 18, 1993 to May 26, 1993</td>
<td>Balakh Sher Mazari</td>
<td>Ceased to be caretaker Prime Minister following Supreme Court verdict</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May 26, 1993 to July 8, 1993</td>
<td>Mian Mohammad Nawaz Sharif</td>
<td>Stepped down under pressure after earlier unsuccessful dismissal by president Ghulam Ishaq Khan under Article 58(2)/(b).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>July 8, 1993 to October 19, 1993</td>
<td>Moin Qureshi</td>
<td>Caretaker capacity handed over charge to elected government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>October 19, 1993 to November 5, 1996</td>
<td>Benazir Bhutto</td>
<td>Dismissed by President Farooq Leghari under Article 58(2)/(b).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>November 5, 1996 to February 17, 1997</td>
<td>Malik Miraj Khalid</td>
<td>Ceased to be caretaker Prime Minister after elections</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>February 17, 1997 to October 12, 1999</td>
<td>Mian Mohammad Nawaz Sharif</td>
<td>Exiled to Saudi Arabia after October 12, 1999 assumptions of power by General Pervez Musharaf Relinquished office of chief executive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>October 12, 1999 to November 23, 2002</td>
<td>General Pervez Musharaf</td>
<td>Relinquished office of chief executive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>November 23, 2002 to June 26, 2004</td>
<td>Mir Zafarullah Khan Jamali</td>
<td>Asked to relinquish the post to pave the way for Shukat Aziz</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June 30, 2004 to August 26, 2004</td>
<td>Chuadhary Shujaat Hussain</td>
<td>Caretaker</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>August 28, 2004 to November 15, 2007</td>
<td>Shaukat Aziz</td>
<td>End of tenure for the preparation of general elections</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
November 16, 2007 to March 24, 2008
Muhammad Mian Soomro Caretaker
March 25, 2008 to June 19, 2012
Syed Yousuf Raza Gilani Disqualified
June 22, 2012 to March 25, 2013
Raja Pervez Ashraf
March 25, 2013 to June 5, 2013
Justice (Ret.) Mir Hazar Khan Khoso Caretaker
June 5, 2013 to Present
Mian Muhammad Nawaz Sharif Current

Source: Dates reproduced from Pakistan’s National Assembly Website [http://www.na.gov.pk]

The Era of Praetorianism (1958-1971)

According to the literature, praetorianism implies that a military force exhorts independent political power through the use, or threat, of strategic violence against the general public (Chengappa, 1999). In other words, a military force transforms into an influential actor that makes threats of force to legitimize its authority within a country (Chengappa, 1999). In theory, praetorianism is viewed as an evolving process that once started cannot be stopped. However, within the context of the real world Perlmutter and Bennett (1980) claimed that praetorianism could only occur within underdeveloped countries that exhibit high levels of “poverty, illiteracy, weak middle class, absence of strong political parties, nascent stages of administrative evolution, and dichotomy between tradition and modernity.” Huntington (1968) argues that praetorianism commonly occurs within states that are in the infancy or teenage developmental years of modernization and political organization. According to scholars, Pakistan experienced numerous moments of dependence on their armed forces (Chengappa, 1999). In addition, Pakistan’s history of instability in civil administration contributed to historians making the claim that Pakistan embraced the image of a “praetorian” state (Chengappa, 1999). Perlmutter (1969), argued that within new and emerging states, the military are commonly catapulted into political action immediately after the failure of civilian entities to obtain
the masses legitimacy. According to scholars, praetorian militaries, unlike civilian-controlled militaries, fail to recognize or take command from the civilian population, often governing and manipulating control of the state’s entities (Huntington, 1968). Chengappa (1999) states that Field Marshal, Ayub Khan, Generals Yahya Khan and Zia-ul Haq are three dictators that have ruled over Pakistan for more than twenty-five (25) years; and played a key role in branding Pakistan as a “praetorian” state (Chengappa, 1999).

According to some scholars, military forces tie together international and domestic politics (Staniland, 2008). But military forces are not stand-alone entities that guide themselves, militaries are overwhelmingly influenced by both domestic political forces and social forces (Staniland, 2008). Since independence in 1947, Pakistan’s military force has played an active role within the political realm and has been known to have direct influence on policy (Staniland, 2008). Cillers (1996, p. 87), claimed that praetorian military groups are “instruments for gathering, guarding, and dispersing largesse – they exist, in short, to help maintain political or ethnic power.” In other words, praetorian military entities have the power to limit or empower the functions of ordinary civilian governed establishments (Staniland, 2008).

Scholars claim that after the 1947 independence and its first military dictatorship, which occurred in 1958, Pakistan suffered from anxiety of perceived threats to its existence and stability (Staniland, 2008). Internally, Pakistan fretted over the polarity amongst the provinces and its established central government, the ongoing debate over the influence of Islam on Pakistan’s political agenda/realm, the assassinations of vital leaders, and both religious and cultural violence (Staniland, 2008). Mahmood (2000),
claims Ayub Khan, whom was at the time army commander in chief, was inducted into the cabinet so that he could impose and establish formal procedures of governance. Mahmood (2000, p. 47), argues that in 1954 Ayub Khan marked the tipping point for the loss of civilian governance within Pakistan.

According to scholars, in 1955 Ayub Khan resigned from office within the cabinet but failed to relinquish his power and/or influence (Blood, 1995). Staniland (2008) declares that the legitimacy of Pakistani citizens governance, during the resignation of Khan, were consistently high, on the other hand the military isolated itself and obtained unconventional levels of autonomy and governing influence. Hamid Khan (2001, p. 197) stated, “the country expected great things” from the 1956 constitution. A constitution that Khan (2001) claims established legitimacy within Pakistan’s governmental system. Yet, Jalal (1995) asserted that the Muslim League split, and various party alliances lead to political stalemates that ultimately contributed in favor of undermining the stability of Pakistan’s political realm. Syed (1989) argued that Pakistani government effectiveness plummeted, and provincial and cultural violence increased to levels that tempted various regions to attempt, and hint towards, secession.

Researchers claim that civilian influence disappeared post-independence for Pakistan because of various party alliances of party leaders and the presidential leader Iskander Mirza (Shafqat, 1997). For example, Talbot (1998) claims Pakistan’s East province assembly struggled with continuous violence, violence that lead to the murder of the deputy speaker within the assembly’s chamber in September 1958. Khan (2001) emphasized the high turnover of cabinets that flourished and vanished immediately. Wilcox (1965) contributed by bringing to light the various strikes and movements that
occurred, while also stressing the magnitude and impact of such strikes and street protests. Khan (2001) also stressed that Pakistan’s government and various regions within the state continued to increase the tension that required urgent attention. Urgent attention that Ziring (1971) had made clear years before about the uprising of secessionist threats. In other words, Pakistan lacked “in basic consensus” (Coser, 1956).

According to the literature, Ayub Khan and presidential leader Iskander Mirza established an alliance that in the short term benefited both parties, however, in the long-run facilitated the process in which the military assumed full control and power (Jalal, 1990, p. 274). Twenty days after assuming the Presidential role and implementing martial law within Pakistan Ayub exiled Mirza (Khan, 2001). As a result, scholars claim that with Mirza exiled in London, the Pakistani military assumed complete control and had a free hand on governing the state (Staniland, 2008). Arguably, the implementation of martial law was not only a result of Mirza’s exile. McGrath (1996) claimed that other essential interests were at play. Staniland (2008) built on Siddiqa’s (2007) response to martial law and advocates that martial law was Pakistan’s response to the military’s external defense mission and the need for tighter security measures. Siddiqa (2007, p. 62) stressed, “the prominence of external threat during the early years was crucial in defining the parameters of the future state-society relationship. Pakistan’s military intervened to protect the state.” Talbot (2005), on the other hand, provides a differing perspective, a perspective that seeks to understand the individual instead of the society in which the individual is placed. According to Talbot:

“The sense that the country was sliding into chaos because of the actions of self-seeking politicians was widely held among the officer corps. There was a growing
feeling within the Army that it was the only properly functioning institution and that its responsibility was to protect the state from both external and internal dangers” (2005, p. 152).

Jalal (1990), however, provides a general systems theory perspective. Jalal (1990) claims that the implementation of martial law was the only option that could neutralize and restore balance to the growing tensions of the state structure itself. In other words, as the system grew and reached its boundaries, the system redesigned itself to accommodate the complex environment.

Afzal (2001, p. 245) provides a national security perspective, arguing that martial law was implemented to preserve the political climate and the political agenda. Ziring (1971) provides a society perspective and claims that martial law was not only accepted by the people, it was even celebrated by the masses. According to Ziring (1971), the masses in Pakistan believed that martial law would restore order to what they stated was chaos in the political realm. Cheema (2002) elaborates on Ziring’s (1971) claims and argues that the masses were dissatisfied with how civilians were running the state of Pakistan, thusly they were neither for nor against martial law. Hence, Haqqani (2005) claims that the more the civilian entities failed and continued to lose credibility in the eyes of the public, the more the military extended its influence within the political realm and increased their legitimacy. According to the literature, shortly after the 1958 military intervention the military of Pakistan embraced and enacted a dual-threat philosophy of how to function. A philosophy that assisted the military in meeting its political interests and its persisting external national security threat perceptions (Siddiqa, 2011; Tellis,
Ashely Tellis (2005, p.100), in line with Haqqani (2005), provides a more in-depth analysis as she claims:

“The military’s usurpation of political authority in Pakistan was meant initially as nothing more than a remedial act to strengthen the country’s defenses temporarily against internal disorder caused by fractious politics, ideological schisms, and interprovincial disputes, as well as the external threats posed by India” (p.100).


According to scholars, after the 1971 civil war that resulted in the establishment of Bangladesh in East Pakistan, Zulfikar Ali Bhutto was inducted as President and Chief Martial Law Administrator (Zahoor, 2017). Even though Pakistan did not have an established Constitutional framework, Bhutto was sworn in to his new leadership roles (Zahoor, 2017). In addition, Zahoor (2017) claims that Bhutto assumed the role of Prime Minister of Pakistan in the month of August in 1973 on an unestablished/created Constitution of 1973. Zahoor (2017) claims that under Bhutto’s five and a half years of governance the economy of Pakistan achieved a noticeable level of stability, as well as Bhutto assisted the private sector which allowed their businesses to flourish. Interestingly, for the purpose of this dissertation, Zahoor (2017) claims that Bhutto was able to achieve consensus of the people which facilitated the development of the 1973 Constitution of Pakistan.

According to scholars, Bhutto built rapport with the masses by promising the people “All Power to the People” (Zahoor, 2017, p. 104). However, after assuming leadership, Zahoor (2017) claims that, Bhutto failed to align what he pledged to the people with his day-to-day actions. According to Zahoor (2017), Bhutto exhibited an
authoritarian and autocratic leadership/governing style. The literature shows that on December 20, 1971 Bhutto was given complete power by Yahya Khan (Zahoor, 2017). Scholars have noted that within the first two weeks, December 23 through December 30 of 1971, Bhutto’s Marital Law Regulations (MLR) facilitated the termination process for the “chairman of the National Press Trust, the senior editor of the Pakistan Times, the Chairman of the PIDC and the managing directors of Progressive Papers and the National Shipping Group” (Zahoor, 2017, p. 105; Niaz, 2010, p. 111). According to the Martial Law Regulations decree, specifically MLR-114, thousands of civil service positions were vulnerable to termination at any given moment (Niaz, 2010). In addition, Niaz (2010) claimed that anyone accused of violating MLR-114 forfeited any rights of defense. According to Zahoor (2017), Bhutto continually made alterations to the 1973 Constitution of Pakistan to benefit his position and interest and amass more power.

Stanley Wolpert (1993) claimed Bhutto was incapable of solving Pakistan’s complex social issues and conflicts because the country was in chaos and he was power hungry. One year later, Mir Zohair Hussain (1994) elaborates on Bhutto’s power-hungry tactics. Hussain (1994) claims Bhutto intertwined Islamic discourse and symbolism because he sought to inspire the people of Pakistan with the philosophy of jihad [holy war]; While also sparking conflict between the Pakistan People’s Party (PPP) regime, capitalism, and feudalism, all in the name of fighting against corruption and inequality within society (Hussain, 1994). Glauber (2006) aligns with Hussain’s (1994) analysis, which allows readers to begin to understand why Bhutto was accused of Islamic Socialism. In his study, Hussain (1994) analyzed “writings, speeches, official documents, journal articles, and newspapers” to support the claims that Bhutto manipulated Islamic
doctrine to facilitate achieving more power with the country. According to Choudhury (1974), Bhutto was not keen of strict Islamic provisions found within tribal communities. Specifically, Choudhury (1974) claimed Bhutto advocated against propositions presented by tribal groups within the North-West Province of Pakistan encouraging ancient Islamic social norms. Chourdhury (1974) elaborates on such Islamic social norms by explaining that tribal groups propositioned Islamic customs such as the removal, by cutting/amputating, of individuals body parts found guilty of stealing; as well as forcing women to wear a *burka* (veil).

Arguably a compromise, Chourdhury (1974) claimed Bhutto followed similar paths as his predecessors and incorporated a set of “Islamic provisions” into the constitution that carried little to no legitimacy; in other words, the provisions were simply incorporated to give the people an illusion that their voices were heard but the provisions were not taken serious by enforcers. Scholars argue that the Islamic provisions incorporated by Bhutto did not differ or create new ground rules that distinguished itself from the 1956 constitution or the 1962 constitution presented by Ayub Khan (Chourdhury, 1974). Under section IX of the constitution the Islamic provisions presented by Bhutto can be read to achieve a deeper understanding (Chourdhury, 1974). According to Article 227 of the constitution: “All existing laws shall be brought in conformity with the Injunctions of Islam as laid down in the Holy Quran and Sunnah, in this Part referred to as the Injunctions of Islam, and no law shall be enacted which is repugnant to injunctions [of Islam].” Chourdhury (1974) claims that regardless, if embraced or enforced, Article 227 had the potential to revamp incompetent social systems and legal systems within Pakistan. However, the literature supports the notion
that Pakistan has a track record of implementing slogans that sound great and achieve buy-in from the masses, but transformation within governmental systems and societal entities, ultimately, fail (Chourdhury, 1974). Furthermore, scholars make note of sub-clauses found within Article 227 that support the claim regarding non-credible provisions for change, provisions meant to give the illusion of creating change but has no legitimacy (Chourdhury, 1974).

According to scholars, the architects of the 1973 constitution of Pakistan, in-line with the framers of the 1956 and 1962 constitutions, were not afraid of any societal repercussions when they incorporated Islamic dogma within the principles of policy (Chourdhury, 1974). Yet, scholars make note of the fact that principles of policy fail to be recognized within the court of law or legal institutions because they are not enforceable (Chourdhury, 1974). According to the literature, principles of policy simply assist, like a road map, the state representatives in leadership roles but are not required to take into consideration such principles of policy when making decisions (Chourdhury, 1974). Researchers claim that Bhutto helped frame a constitution that was filled with strong slogans that uplifted the people, however the showpiece had no real power (Chourdhury, 1974). For example, Chourdhury (1974) claims the Islamic Council, which was originally established and introduced within the constitution created by Ayub, in theory met the needs of legislatures however carried no real power for change except as an advisory role; which was not mandatory that legislatures seek council, just optional. In other words, according to the provisions the legislatures were free to function and execute decisions without achieving buy-in from the Islamic Council (Chourdhury, 1974).
In 1974, scholar Chourdhury brought to light an interesting concern about Bhutto and the constitution he helped frame. According to Chourdhury (1974), in the eyes of the Pakistani military Bhutto lacked integrity and credibility within the political realm. Based on Chourdhury’s (1974) study the military believed Bhutto failed to fulfill his promises and was only window dressing issues; unable to deliver on proposed changes. Based on the literature, Bhutto feared a successful coup and studied his predecessors’ constitutions (Chourdhury, 1974). In 1958 and 1969, both Ayub Khan and Yahya Khan abrogated the constitution of Pakistan (Chourdhury, 1974). Based on their experiences, scholars claim Bhutto emphasized and provided in-depth propositions against high treason in the event that anyone attempted to abrogate the formally introduced constitution (Chourdhury, 1974). Hence, Chourdhury (1974) argues that Bhutto incorporated into the constitution Article Six (6), which revolves around high treason for abrogation of the constitution, because Bhutto revealed his fear and/or anxiety for power.


According to scholars, General Muhammad Zia ul-Haq and his military regime were overly focused and dedicated to Islamization (Nasr(b), 2000). Hence, scholars claim that General Muhammad Zia ul-Haq sought to establish and implement Islamic social and political entities, transform Pakistani public policy making into Islamic philosophy, and create numerous governmental organizations that stood behind and supported Islamist activities (Nasr (c), 1993; Ahmad, 1992; Burki & Baxter, 1991; Kennedy, 1990; Iqbal, 1986; Weiss, 1986). Scholars argue that under General Muhammad Zia ul-Haq the government aided the Islamization process. For example, the government contributed support and contributed the financial resources required for madrasahs, for the
mobilization of Islamic political parties, for social groups, and other organizations like
the ulama to begin the Islamization transformation (Malik, 1996). According to the
literature, even when the government began shrinking the funds and began cracking
down on numerous madrasahs in 1996 the government continued to spend $3.5 million
annual to different entities that mobilized and advocated for Islamization (Economist,
1996).

According to the literature, the support for madrasahs was not simply to support
various educational opportunities for the people of Pakistan (Nasr (b), 2000). Nasr ((b),
2000) claims the Zia regime funneled madrasahs graduates into government entities and
state-institutions-career opportunities to entice future students into obtaining a traditional
Islamic education. In others, for Pakistani civilians to ensure employment within the State
entities, these individuals were significantly encouraged to obtain a traditional Islamic
education. Hence, Nasr ((b), 2000) informs readers that within Pakistan an individual
rarely obtained government service employment that did not also focus on altering the
social and intellectual roles of out-of-date [traditional] Islamic curriculum. Malik (1996)
argued that in order to meet the expectations of the changing societal and economic needs
of the masses in 1979, the National Committee on Dini Madaris [Religious Schools]
drafted a report in which the recommendations were for the government to revamp the
educational curriculum to meet the societal and economic agenda. Although controversial
and worth pursuing as research worthy, the report of the National Committee will not be
analyzed in this dissertation. Instead, the purpose for incorporating the National
Committee Dini Madaris is because the report itself sparked controversy with the
Pakistani government. Hence, it is the specific controversy/conflict from the report which is relevant for this dissertation.

According to the literature, the report drafted by the National Committee on Dini Madaris provoked anger amongst the traditional ulama, which coincidentally were the first group of individuals to publicly express themselves (Nasr (b), 2000). Researchers claim, that various Muslim scholars, such as Mawlama Yusuf Ludhianwi, objected and advocated against the ideology of modernizing madrasahs, their curriculum, and their teaching styles (Zaman, 1996). In addition, scholars argue that Muslim scholars were proactively emphasizing the notion that the education provided within madrasahs should be judged by the quality of Islamic scholarship that was actively generated from each institution, instead of being judged by its effectiveness as another tool in a tool box for the modernization of society (Zaman, 1996). Hence, with the currency contributions provided by the government, scholars claim, numerous madrasahs sought to expand their influence beyond educating ulama and sought to assist the transformation of the Islamizing state by contributing to the Islamic bureaucracy (Nasr (b), 2000). According to Nasr (2000(b)), the Pakistani government instituted the International Islamic University in Islamabad for such purpose; hoping to eventually embrace an Islamic bureaucracy. Thusly, in an attempt to respond to the government demand, various madrasahs revamped their curriculum and in other situations new entities were established to fulfil gaps in meeting the government’s needs (Nasr (b), 2000). As a result, researchers argue that it was the government that founded an entirely new educational forum that favored madrasahs and facilitated their educational dominance in the new arena (Nasr (b), 2000).
Nasr ((b), 2000) claims that in an attempt to expand their influence and support from the masses, numerous Ulama entities and political groups associated with Islamist parties have turned to the new madrasahs for assistance. According to research conducted by Nasr ((b), 2000), a relationship between madrasahs and government policy exist. Nasr (b, 2000) argued that if the madrasahs became the national education it would shape the minds of students and generate future adults that would more likely than not facilitate two objectives; (1) produce adults that would be more inclined to vote for Islamic parties and (2) produce adults that would be more likely to contemplate and support Islamic ideology within the political/policy realm. Nasr ((b), 2000) speculated that General Muhammad Zia ul-Haq found in madrasahs the opportunity to alter, for his benefit, the Pakistani electoral system and empower numerous Islamic parties. In addition, Nasr ((b), 2000) elaborates further by asserting that Islamic and self-proclaimed Islamist organizations have embraced and incorporated the madrasah philosophy to advance their interests from the government resources; while also reaping the benefits of joining government entities and state agencies. According to Nasr ((b), 2000), as more Islamist and self-proclaimed organizations embedded themselves within government institutions and state agencies the more likely they were of being able to expand their influence and obtain buy-in from those within such organizations. According to scholars, the rise of state-led Islamization by madrasahs signified that the ulama would be able to exert its power over Islamist learning during an unstable time when Islam was on the verge of shaping the political agenda of the state and transform the modernization of the economy and society (Nasr (b), 2000).
According to researchers, the webbed connection between the Islamic educational curriculum, the political leadership at the community level, and the drive for societal control map out the impact that patronage of madrasahs had on facilitating and legitimizing the state’s Islamist political agenda (Nasr (b), 2000). Thusly, Nasr ((b), 2000) argues that the vitalness of madrasahs was part of the state’s discourse when describing its goals of expansion. Olivier Roy (1994) provides a more in-depth analysis of the importance of madrasahs for the states expansion. Roy (1994) argues that the goal of the government was not to establish more madrasahs and make them readily accessible, instead the goal was to alter their character and/or integrity, to incorporate them within politics, and ultimately establish a new social class made up of religiously-inclined, militant-inclined, out of work, and semi-literate new generation of youths. Nasr ((b), 2000) claims General Muhammad Zia ul-Haq regime’s insistence in expanding the states governing power over madrasahs by attempting to make them reliant on the state resources, employment, and monetary support ultimately backfired and resorted into resistance and protests from the masses. According to the literature, various Islamist entities and groups, political parties, and ulama that governed madrasahs embraced the assistance from state organizations and institutions, however they did not welcome the control that the state sought in return for such patronage (Nasr (b), 2000).

When analyzing Pakistan at the national level during General Muhammad Zia ul-Haq’s period, scholars claim that, the Islamization transformation narrowed its focus on three specific interest; (1) on the institutions of the state, (2) on the law(s), (3) and on the constitutional issues (Nasr (b), 2000). According to the literature, an in-depth analysis at a central/local level begins to paint a picture of General Muhammad Zia ul-Haq and his
partnerships that support scholars claim that their interests were focused on the dominance of various institutions and agencies of authority through the manipulation of Islamization (Nasr (b), 2000). Scholars argue that the rise of extremism within Pakistan was a domino effect of essential shifts in the influence of religious education, the influence of ulama throughout society and political agendas (Nasr (b), 2000). Furthermore, Nasr ((b), 2000) argues that such shifts occurred within the context of General Muhammad Zia ul-Haq’s pursuit of Islamizing the state.


According to researchers, post December 1988 Pakistan was governed by a civilian government (Javid & Latif, 2017). Javid and Latif (2017) claim that Pakistan’s flawed democratic system was strongly correlated to (1) numerous democratic and political entities intentionally deconstructed by ambitious military rulers, (2) a political agenda that focused only on short-term goals, and (3) the mishandling of power and inability to achieve agreement within parliament. Hence, Javid and Latif (2017) argue that Pakistan’s social norm, culture and legacy is one of system failures, corruption, and short sightedness. Scholars argue that because of the failing democratic system, General Mirza Aslam Beg controlled and governed (Javid & Latif, 2017). However, General Mirza Aslam Beg, according to researchers, relinquished control to a civilian government (Javid & Latif, 2017). Javid and Latif (2017) argue that even after General Mirza Aslam Beg gave up control of Pakistan, Benazir Bhutto did not have the power to govern. As a result, researchers claim that it was not until Benazir Bhutto agreed to a power-sharing agreement with General Mirza Aslam Beg that Benazir Bhutto gained legitimacy (Javid & Latif, 2017).
Hence, researchers argue that even after the power-sharing agreement between General Mirza Aslam Beg and Benazir Bhutto civilian-government partnerships were unstable and could not reach a consensus in matters of national security and foreign policy making (Javid & Latif, 2017). According to Javid and Latif (2017), General Mirza Aslam Beg continued, even after the power-sharing agreement, to directly dominate matters of national security and foreign policy making. Hence, researchers claim that continuous disagreement led to the inability to stimulate the economy and effectively meet the expectations of the people (Javid & Latif, 2017). Thusly, Javid and Latif (2017) argue that with the disenfranchised masses and accusations of corruption and being unfit to govern, Benazir Bhutto was asked to resign in 1990 by President Ghulam Ishaq Khan. According to the literature, Benazir Bhutto experienced political opposition by individuals external to the assembly and it was President Ghulam Ishaq Khan that enacted the eight (8th) amendment of the Constitution, under military pressure, to request Benazir Bhutto’s resignation (Javid & Latif, 2017).

Nawaz Sharif (1990 – 1993)

According to researchers, Pakistan’s Inter-Services Intelligence (ISI) engineered a partnership between Islami Jamhoori Itihad (IJI) and Mian Nawaz Sharif to restore the balance of the public’s support for the Pakistan People’s Party (PPP) (Javid & Latif, 2017). Researchers argue that after the general elections of 1990, which favored IJI with 106 National Assembly seats over PPP’s 60, Nawaz Sharif became Prime Minister on November 6, 1990 (Javid & Latif, 2017). Although Nawaz Sharif did not impact the Constitution of Pakistan, I seek to avoid having any gaps in the timeline of Pakistan’s government. In addition, although Nawaz Sharif will be briefly discussed it is worth
mentioning that his impact on the state of Pakistan can be found within the economical/trade realm.

According to the literature, Nawaz Sharif effectively stimulated the entrepreneurial community and assisted in helping the community to grow, while also privatizing various public sectors (Javid & Latif, 2017). In addition, Sharif, scholars claim, helped investment opportunities flourish within the country through his efforts of minimizing bureaucratic red-tape (Javid & Latif, 2017). Scholars argue that Sharif’s tenure was short lived because President Ishaq Khan feared that Sharif was a threat to his presidency (Javid & Latif, 2017). As a result, the literature shows that on April of 1993 President Ishaq Khan requested Sharif’s resignation and deconstructed the National Assembly (Javid & Latif, 2017). According to scholarly research, in May of 1993 the Supreme Court of Pakistan overruled President Ishaq Khan’s decisions to terminate the IJI (Javid & Latif, 2017). Hence, research supports the argument that President Ishaq Khan, in return to the Supreme Court’s decision, sought to (1) cripple the credibility and legitimacy of the IJI within the National Assembly, (2) cripple the credibility and legitimacy in the Provincial Assembly, and (3) create as much bureaucratic red-tape as possible to ensure that Sharif’s administration was unable to function properly (Javid & Latif, 2017). Rais (1994) argued that President Ishaq Khan strategically engineered crises to intentionally hinder the economic sector. In addition, Rais (1994) claims that it was not until October 6, 1993 when General Abdul Waheed Kakar played the mediator role between President Ishaq Khand and Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif that the instability and pandemonium reached an end.

According to the literature, the 1993 elections outcome where results that the masses were not surprised to learn about; the PPP obtained 86 seats versus PML-N’s 73 seats (Javid & Latif, 2017). Javid and Latif (2017) argue that the masses speculated prior to the results that neither party would have the ability to effectively form an administration that would be able to govern and influence the country. Scholarly research reveals that Benazir Bhutto effectively pulled together an administration by merging numerous smaller parties and assuming the leadership role of Prime Minister for the second time (Javid & Latif, 2017); based on the literature Benazir Bhutto became Prime Minister on October 19, 1993 (Javid & Latif, 2017).


According to scholars, in 1990 Nawaz Sharif was able to govern the country after gaining assistance from the military to help collapse Benazir Bhutto’s regime (Javid & Latif, 2017). However, in 1997 Nawaz Sharif did not have the full support of the military, instead Sharif successfully achieved 2/3 of the majority vote in the 1997 elections (Javid & Latif, 2017). Researchers argue that immediately after the elections Nawaz Sharif openly expressed his objection to the eight (8th) Amendment of the Constitution (Javid & Latif, 2017). In addition, Sharif constructed, proposed, and implemented the thirteenth (13th) Amendment to the Constitution; the amendment removed the President’s power to dismantle the National Assembly (Javid & Latif, 2017). According to the literature, the thirteenth (13th) Amendment was unanimously accepted by all parties of the government; shifting Pakistan’s governmental system from being a Semi-Presidential entity to a Parliamentary Democratic system (Javid & Latif, 2017).
General Pervez Musharraf (1999-2007)

According to scholars, the government of Pakistan has made allowances for religious organizations that ultimately paved the path for extremist policies to be implemented across the state (Lillah, 2008). However, the literature shows not everyone that governed Pakistan was favored by religious organizations. On the contrary, General Pervez Musharraf was strongly opposed by influential religious organizations because he sought to marginalize religious organizations and sought to implement liberal policies within Pakistan (Lillah, 2008). According to scholarly research, after a coup d’état in 1999 against Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif, General Pervez Musharraf assumed the leadership role within Pakistan and obtained complete power (Lillah, 2008). Scholars claim that General Musharraf proposed the idea of “enlightened moderation” for Pakistan, which advocated that all Muslim communities unite and take a stance against militancy and extremism and together achieve socioeconomic progression (Musharraf, 2004). Lillah (2008) claims that it was General Pervez Musharraf that sought to de-radicalize Pakistani communities through the implementation of more accepting and liberal policies. Research supports the claim that General Pervez Musharraf’s first attempt at “enlightened moderation” was his proposal to make alterations to the blasphemy law (BBC, 2014; Hoodbhoy, 2006). In addition, researchers argue General Musharraf proposed that the Hudood Ordinance be amended (Lillah, 2008); the changes proposed sought to give rape victims protection. Furthermore, General Musharraf advocated for a complete ban against militant apparel and partnered welfare organizations of Lashkar-e-Taiba (LeT) and Jaish-e-Muhammed (JEM) (Cheema, Chari, & Cohen, 2006).
According to the literature, various organizations and social groups were opposed to General Musharraf’s proposals and united together to successfully compel him to give up his movement for changes (Lillah, 2008). Scholars claim that General Musharraf’s attempts to transform religious laws allowed religious organizations to exploit the situation and created an opportunity in which such organizations created propaganda against the government (Lillah, 2008). Researchers claim that actions taken by General Musharraf against extremist groups hindered political networks for Musharraf, while also providing extremist elements to take advantage of the situation and create new propaganda (Lillah, 2008). Researchers state that the actions taken by General Musharraf against extremism and extremist led to three murder attempts (Lillah, 2008). Bill Roggio (2007) elaborates on the three attacks and claims that General Musharraf survived two of the attempts and the third was avoided. Abid Ullah Jan (2005) states that the attacks occurred because General Musharraf was viewed by extremist as “supporting agenda of enemies of Islam under the smart title of ‘enlightened moderation.’”

According to the literature, after the October 12, 1999 coup, General Musharraf suspended the constitution and appointed himself to the role of Chief Executive (Javid & Latif, 2017). Scholars claim that in 2001 General Musharraf had President Tarar removed from office and made himself a civilian president, even though he continued in the role of Army Chief (Javid & Latif, 2017). Javid and Latif (2017) argue that it was General Musharraf, in 2001, that constructed and implemented community-level government systems. In 2002, scholars claim that General Musharraf advocated for a popular vote and such actions resulted in him assuring his power for the following five years (Javid & Latif, 2017). According to Rizvi (2013), during his tenure General Musharraf proposed a
Legal Framework Order (LFO), in which he demanded that (1) the constitution be suspended, (2) the deconstruction of the National Assembly and other functions of the government, (3) that the president have complete power to appoint service chiefs, Provincial Governors, and the Election Commission members, and (4) limit the role of the Prime Minister time in office to a maximum of two terms only.

The literature shows that on November 3, 2007, President General Pervez Musharraf declared a State of Emergency and brought forward a Provisional Constitutional Order (PCO) (Javid & Latif, 2017). According to the Provisional Constitutional Order, active judges of the Pakistani government were required to take and support a new oath (Javid & Latif, 2017). Javid and Latif (2017) argue that the Provisional Constitutional Order, for a lack of better words, was General Pervez Musharraf’s way of enforcing an ultimatum; either the judges recited and accepted the new oath, or they refused, which their refusal would resort to the judges losing their jobs. According to researchers, President General Pervez Musharraf implemented such tactics to effectively remove the Chief Justice and various other opposing judges (Javid & Latif, 2017). Rizvi (2013) argues that President General Pervez Musharraf tactics, although effective for meeting his short-term goals, failed in the long-term because the public responded negatively and protested the removal of judges. In addition, Rizvi (2013) claimed that in response to the masses revolt President General Pervez Musharraf implemented a three phase process to alter the narrative; (1) Musharraf resigned to the position of Army Chief on November 28, 2007 and lost direct power/influence over the Army, (2) Musharraf formally took an oath to establish himself as a civilian president on
November 30, 2007, and (3) on December 15, 2007 Musharraf called to an end the State of Emergency and reinstituted Constitutional rule.

**Conflicts in Pakistan**

A brief review of the literature will immediately inform scholars that violent extremism within Pakistan is a complex phenomenon where a one-size-fits-all solution does not exist, nor would it work. That is because violent extremism takes on multiple forms. For instance, Porges and Stern (2010) claim sectarianism, Islamization social movements, the spread of Taliban doctrine, and the numerous doctrines of Jihadist entities are referred to as forms of violent extremism. On the other hand, Zaidi (2011) believes that the spike in violent extremists within Pakistan is a result of regional and global relationships.

Yet, a brief review of the history of Pakistan reveals that Pakistan is a state that has multiple conflicts occurring simultaneously in various regions; all conflicts occurring for various reasons. Regardless of the conflict, scholars agree that the internal conflicts that Pakistan battle with have both regional and international influence that needs to be addressed (Mustafa, 2013). But what can be considered conflict within Pakistan? Pruitt and Kim (2004, p. 7-8) define conflict as “perceived divergence of interest, a belief that the parties’ current aspirations are incompatible.” In other words, Pruitt and Kim (2004) claim conflict occurs when one individual and/or group achieves their interest/resources, leaving the other individual and/or group without interests/resources. Mustafa (2013) believes a majority of Pakistan’s conflicts can be linked in some way to economic and social factors that directly challenges various groups interests. Therefore, Mustafa (2013) claims, that both political and economic solutions that meet the internal needs of the state
need to be created to counter conflicts occurring within Pakistan. Although Mustafa’s recommendations have some validity to support these claims, Mustafa is attempting to portray conflicts within Pakistan as simply black-and-white. The conflicts within Pakistan are far more complex.

To begin, the first conflict that Pakistan faced was its independence from British governance (Mustafa, 2013). More specifically, the riots that occurred after Pakistan declared itself a state in 1947 (Mustafa, 2013). Since their independence, conflicts in Pakistan took on various forms; ethnic, sectarian discord, and linguistic (Mustafa, 2013). Roughly two decades later, Pakistan found itself face-to-face with another conflict, a nationalist conflict (Mustafa, 2013). As a result, in 1971 Bangladesh was established in the Eastern part of Pakistan. Scholars make the claim that the establishment of Bangladesh is the starting point of the conflict that is occurring within the Balochistan region (Mustafa, 2013).

Another conflict involved within Pakistan’s multiple other conflicts is the confrontation with the Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA). FATA are tribal lands located on the North-Western region of Pakistan. Within this region, militant groups have been known to set up camps for training purposes and is regarded by scholars as ground zero for terrorism (Mustafa, 2013). The FATA region, alone, is a contributor to multiple conflicts Pakistan faces (Mustafa, 2013). For instance, the FATA region has led to the conflict between the Afghan leader and Pakistani leader (Mustafa, 2013). The Afghan leader refuses to recognize the current divide of the shared border. On the border, tribes of the Pashtun ethnic group are located on both sides (Mustafa, 2013). The rise of violence, domestic quarrels, drugs and low-level crimes within other regions
are daily conflicts Pakistan face; areas such as Khyber Pakhtunkhawa (KPK), Balochistan, Provincially Administered Tribal Area (PATA), Karachi, Lahore, and many other regions (Mustafa, 2013).

Scholars agree that on a broad level Pakistan faces five types of conflicts that can be broken to numerous sub-conflicts (Mustafa, 2013). In the FATA region, sectarianism is contributing to the violence. The ongoing conflict between the Shia and Sunni groups. Within the PATA region, geo-political conflicts are contributing to the violence within Pakistan. The relationship Pakistan has with India, the United States, and surrounding international players is another conflict Pakistan is attempting to gain control of. Chaudhri (1989) claims that India’s attempt to remove Pakistan as an international player for failing to follow social norms and abide by international laws has caused a generational conflict to stay alive. Khan (2010) adds that the relationship between Pakistan and the United States contributes to conflicts within Pakistan. Razvi and Khan (2001) claimed that Pakistan’s geographical location has influenced the country’s policy-making decision; policies that have contributed to influencing internal and external conflicts for Pakistan.

Regarding geographical location, Pakistan is conveniently situated near the West, the South, and Central Asia (Mustafa, 2013). As a result, Pakistan can leverage the strategic importance that it can provide. For example, Pakistan is strategically the shortest means of access to the sea when compared to neighboring countries that are considered “landlocked” regions of Central Asia (Mustafa, 2013). According to the literature, countries within Central Asia are rich in natural resources, natural resources that have caught the attention of many (if not all) global super powers. As a result, these global
super powers have attempted, some more successful than others, to have a direct impact and influence within Central Asia in hopes of tapping into those natural resources (Mustafa, 2013). Although it might have been well intended, conflict flourished after many influential groups flooded Pakistan with aid in hopes of establishing and fulfilling both their short and long-term interests in the region; conflicts that were caused because of the broad range of differing economic and political interests (Mustafa, 2013). Therefore, scholars make the claim that a cause effect of such interest groups interests in the region sparked the emergence and strengthening of non-state actors within Pakistan (Mustafa, 2013).

Figure 2. Sea Accessibility

The Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa (KPK) religious conflict is another contributor to conflicts within Pakistan. The province of Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa, referred to by some as
the North-West Frontier Province, is the region in which Peshawar is located. Within the province of KPK, governance reforms have been one of many conflicts the region continually struggles to manage (Mehboob, 2011). The governance reform within the province of KPK has gone through three various stages; each reducing and increasing various types of conflicts. The first reform that occurred between 2001 and 2004 was due to the World Bank’s Country Assistance Strategy plan that sought to improve and develop Pakistan’s economy (Samdani, 2011). The reform provided new means by which Pakistan could be held accountable financially by improving financial management systems, creating and implementing new forms of human resources approaches for key roles, it helped create and improve social services within communities, and provided many means for good governance (Samdani, 2011). Between 2005 and 2008 the second stage of the reform occurred. The reform had four objectives, (1) enhance health and education services, (2) address the minimization/elimination of any social service needs within communities to ensure members have effective support systems, (3) improve current and create new private businesses and (4) train and make effective public-sector organizations for governance (Mehboob, 2011; Samdani, 2011; Bhutta, Cross, Raza, & Zahir, 2008; Midhet, Jafarey, Ahsan, & Sheraz, 2008). The fourth reform seeks to make changes to the first three stages and make the appropriate changes on any areas that need immediate attention (Mehboob, 2011; Samdani, 2011). In addition, the fourth stage is focused on measuring the effectiveness of the first three reform phases (Mehboob, 2011).

According to Mustafa (2013), the Balochistan region is associated with Nationalistic/local conflicts. Khan (2009) claims that within Balochistan ethnic nationalists and the Pakistani military have a never ending internal war that started in
2005. According to Khan (2009), the military’s narrative about the conflict reveals that the tribal leaders are revolting against the Pakistani’s government goals of development and progression towards modernization. On the other hand, the militants of the region claim that the military is attempting to colonize the region and reap the benefits of the local resources (Khan, 2009). In addition, the militants believe that because the military are majority Punjabi has caused the on-going war to escalate (Khan, 2009).

Another region, Sindh, is also contributing to multiple conflicts within Pakistan, specifically ethnic conflict and local street crime. According to Waseem (1996) and Mustafa (2013), the Sindh region struggles with linguistic, cultural, and marginalization conflicts. In addition, Waseem (1996) claims that in 1948 the Pakistani government divided Sindh without involving and talking to the community; thereby establishing the conflict. The resettlement that occurred after the divide led to the escalation of frustration among refugees (Waseem, 1996). However, the resettlement is one of various conflicts in the Sindh region. Sindhi community leadership is another conflict. The new generation of Sindhi have attempted to revert to indigenous cultural norms and tradition (Waseem, 1996). In addition, the distribution of terrain raised concerns for Sindhi nationalist. The Sindhi waderas were critiqued for reaping the benefits of the divide, while the Sindhi haris felt they were marginalized and setup to a life of suffering; a textbook example of Pruitt and Kim’s (2004) definition of conflict where one group reaps the benefits leaving the other without any access to resources.

**Violent Extremism**

Rakisits (2009) claims that the history of violent extremism in Pakistan must begin with the extreme violence that created Pakistan in 1947. In addition, Rakisits
(2009) claims scholars should understand the internal and external forms of terrorism Pakistan is struggling to manage. To begin, the security threat caused by Taliban groups, such as the Tahreek-e-Taliban, the Lashker-e-Jhangvi, and Mehdi Militia have contributed to the volatility of Pakistan. In addition, Irshad (2011) claims that nationalism in various regions of Pakistan reinforces the sectarian violence of home-grown terrorism within Pakistan; regions such as Saraike, Mohajir, Sindhi, Balochi, and Pathan. Violent extremists have executed suicide attacks within these regions (Irshad, 2011). In addition, various infrastructures, educational institutions, monetary entities, transportation routes, and gas pipelines have all been victims of violent extremism within Pakistan (Irshad, 2011).

However, violent extremism has not only occurred at the domestic level for Pakistan. International/State sponsored terrorism acts have had significant influence in Pakistan (Irshad, 2011). Attacks have been made towards the President of Pakistan and the Prime Minister in attempts to influence the political agenda within Pakistan (Irshad, 2011). In addition, the Marriot Hotel attack, the violent attacks on the Sri Lanka Cricket team, the Police Stations bombing, and various other forms of attacks have contributed to violent extremism within Pakistan (Irshad, 2011). Furthermore, Irshad (2011) claims that these acts of violence have had the support of state agents as a tactic to manipulate state policy. Violent acts in the name of ethnicity at one point created a divide with Pakistan. During the 1980s and 1990s, ethnic extremist dominated Karachi and Hyderabad because of economic instability (Irshad, 2011). More recently, Irshad (2011) claims that ethnic terrorism has reappeared because of linguistic differences between Urdu social groups and social groups within the Sindh province.
Furthermore, separatist terrorism is still occurring today within Pakistan. In the past, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and Balochistan regions struggled with acts of violence in the name of separatists. In more recent times, scholars claim that Balochistan has inherited separatist terrorism (Irshad, 2011). The violent extremist acts that Balochistan faces from insurgency groups, according to scholars, is due to ethno-nationalist conflicts (Irshad, 2011). Irshad (2011) claims that tribal militants have taken it upon themselves to perform terrorist attacks against state entities and against high value members of the government. The separatist groups, with the support of India, have contributed to violent extremism to further their political agenda (Shaikh, 2009).

Pakistan also struggles with acts of violent extremism from nationalist. According to Irshad (2011, p. 228), “the nationalist are the sub-nationals within the organizations that fight for recognition and a proper identification within the federation, and their struggle is motivated by fears and apprehensions of pre-dominant role of other ethnic groups or nationalities within the federation.” The concern for Pakistan is that smaller provinces, that are not Punjabis, claim to be marginalized and are frustrated by the oppression from Punjabis that dominate within the military and government (Irshad, 2011). The smaller provinces raise awareness to cultural, economic, and social threats they face from lack of security from the majority regions. In addition, Irshad (2011) claims that small regions conduct acts of violence because they fear losing their natural resources to other regions without getting fully compensated. Scholars claim, “the lack of development and poverty frustrates the population and external hands exploit the situation to inculcate a sense of deprivation and fuel violent insurgency” (Irshad, 2011, p. 228). The nationalist threat is not only confined to small provinces within Pakistan. The
governing leaders have contributed to the violent acts conducted by nationalist movements. The leaders claim that the nationalist movements are a direct result of rejection to reform and the federation (Irshad, 2011). Hence, these differing perspectives fuel the continuous cycle of extremist acts.

Religious extremism, according to scholars, has fostered and nurtured the ideology of conducting acts of violence against individuals that embrace other forms of religion (Irshad, 2011). The division created by religious extremism is portrayed as the most lethal in Pakistan (Irshad, 2011). Acts of sectarian violence have been classified as acts caused by intolerant perspectives of other forms of religion being accepted (Irshad, 2011). According to scholars, Afghan Jihad has been the root cause of sectarian violence (Irshad, 2011). More recently, scholars claim that Pakistan should prioritize combating sectarian extremist (Irshad, 2011). For instance, Pakistan should focus on de-escalating the Sunni and Shia conflict that currently drives a majority of the violent extremist acts within Pakistan (Irshad, 2011).

Following sectarian extremism, Pakistan also confronts jihadi acts of violent extremism. Jihadi extremism poses a significant threat to the national security of Pakistan even though Jihadi terrorism has international objectives (Irshad, 2011). Scholars have traced the origin of jihadi extremism to the 1970s in which the Soviets invaded Afghanistan (Irshad, 2011). Shortly after the Soviet Union left Afghanistan riots broke out until the Russian invasion. According to scholars, the riots created instability within the region and allowed numerous jihadi groups to use different regions of Pakistan as safe heavens and trainings camps (Irshad, 2011). Challenges with managing Islamic militants is another contributor to violent extremism in Pakistan (Irshad, 2011). Islamic militants
are most commonly found around the Tribal belt and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa provinces of Pakistan (Irshad, 2011). According to scholars, Islamic militants have their own interpretation of reality and want Pakistan to be ground zero for their interpretation of reality before conquering the world (Irshad, 2011). Scholars claim that Islamic militants have a “distorted, tribalistic, ritualistic, and dark version of Islam with no light of tolerance, peaceful co-existence, human rights and finer things of life” (Irshad, 2011, p. 230). It is important to note that Islamic militants can be broken down to further subdivisions. According to scholars, religion has been used as a disguise by foreign and aboriginal mercenaries, thereby blurring the lines between mercenaries and Islamic militants (Irshad, 2011). Acts of violent extremism caused by these mercenaries can be found in Swat and neighboring provinces, and are in direct opposition to Islamic beliefs, Pushtonism, and Nationalism (Irshad, 2011). Unfortunately for Pakistan, these mercenaries commit extreme acts of violence in pursuit of revenge and personal gain, making it harder for Pakistan to manage.

Finally, the Pakistani Taliban are contributing to violent extremism within Pakistan. According to Irshad (2011), the development and recognition of the Pakistani Taliban was due to the United States and Afghanistan situation. Scattered cells of Al-Qaeda and Afghan Taliban formed alliances and merged forces (Irshad, 2011). The Pakistani Taliban seek to dominate the tribal belt as their headquarters for the fight against the United States interests within Afghanistan and the region (Irshad, 2011). Multiple factors have contributed to the Pakistani Taliban’s ability to survive militaristic actions; for instance, the terrain in which they are located, the numerous tunnels they have constructed, and the fact that they refuse to abide by any rules and regulations of
warfare (Irshad, 2011). Pakistan Taliban have been the leading group of suicide attackers contributing to violent extremism (Irshad, 2011).

**Social Groups**

An essential dimension of any conflict is the way in which the conflict is framed and shared to both internal and external parties. Just as well, it is vital to understand the critical dimension of counter-discourses (Nazir, 2010); more specifically for this dissertation the attempt to counter violence extremism in the North-West region of Pakistan. Scholars claim that the reason countering violent extremism has proven to be a difficult task can be found in the formation of social groups, such as the Army, the militants, and tribal leaders, that seek to reinforce the status quo instead of embracing reforms (Misra & Clarke, 2012; Siddiqi, 2007; Abbas, 2005; Haqqani, 2005; Fuller, 2003; Gardezi & Rashid, 1983; Hussain, 1976; Maududi, 1960). Individuals within the community form these social groups and, according to scholars, have strong associations to various social groups that govern the community (Misra & Clarke, 2012; Siddiqi, 2007; Abbas, 2005; Haqqani, 2005; Fuller, 2003; Gardezi & Rashid, 1983; Hussain, 1976; Maududi, 1960). Therefore, one can argue that individuals within the North-West region of Pakistan have limited alternatives by which they can achieve basic needs, other than in social bonds. Therefore, individuals must embed themselves within a group to obtain access to basic human resources; but first the individual must fully commit, blindly, to the group.

According to scholars, within weak states, such as Pakistan, the formation of social groups is not uncommon because the state is unable to provide members of those communities with means of security (Kfir, 2014); at most they might receive minimal
means of security. As a result, other scholars have claimed that extremist social groups are a result of the need for security, individuals seek groups of power because these types of groups watch over one another, after one another, and provide security for one another (McCormick & Fritz, 2009; Peake, 2003; Jackson, 2003; Duffield, 1998; Tilly, 1995). However, it can be argued that the sensation of belonging that comes from the formation of a social group is not the sole factor leading members to join. Some scholars claim that the actions of the social group and their influence to draw the attention of policy-makers contributes to the membership buy-in process from outsiders (Kfir, 2014). According to scholars, social groups represent bargaining power for individuals within communities that view outsiders as a threat to their limited resources (Cunningham, 2011). Kfir (2014) elaborates that social group’s ability to provide the services and resources that the state is unable to provide is one of many contributing factors by which these social groups achieve support (legitimacy). Other scholars have proposed that social groups behave in the way they do because they want to show supporters and future supporters their ability to create change to their perspective of what reality is for them (Bahadur, 2005, p. 25).

Violent extremism, within Pakistan, is rooted within social groups; for instance, jihadi terrorist groups (Kfir, 2014; Fair, 2014; Fair, 2011; Tinkle, 2011). It is important to understand the difference between acts of terrorism violence and acts of sectarian violence. According to Kfir (2014, p. 459), “one way of distinguishing between domestic terrorism and sectarian violence is that the former focuses on attacking the state and its institutions to attain a specific goal, whereas the latter targets other sects, regardless of the State.” Thus, sectarian groups can also be viewed as social groups, because sectarian groups demand from its participants to welcome their singular identity (Kfir, 2014). Also,
scholars make the claim that sectarian groups demand that its members accept and abide by one specific interpretation of the religious doctrines (Berger, 1954; Kfir, 2014). A critical observation of sectarian social groups is their unconditional loyalty to the specific leader AND the leader’s specific perspective and/or interpretation of the reality of religion teachings and way of life; even if violent extremism is approved and intolerance is vivid (Kfir, 2014). According to scholars, the violence generated from sectarian groups have been linked to weak governmental and economic governance by the State, giving space for groups to exploit the opportunity to provide community members resources the state could not (Iannaccone & Berman, 2006). Scholars claim that the Sunni and Shi’a conflict is a clear example of sectarian violence in Pakistan (Kfir, 2014). Thusly, Nasr (2000, p. 171) makes the claim that sectarianism, within Pakistan, is associated closely with:

“Organized and militant religiopolitical activism, whose specific aim is to safeguard and promote the sociopolitical interests of the particular Muslim sectarian community, Shi’a or Sunni, with which it is associated. Its discourse of power promises empowerment to that community in tandem with greater adherence to Islamic norms in public life, as the religious sources and authorities of that community articulate them. These goals are to be achieved through mobilization of the sectarian identity in question and the marginalization of the rival sectarian community, largely through prolific use of violence” (p. 171).

The Tehrik-e-Taliban Pakistan (TTP) are another social group that developed in 2007; research supports December of 2017 to be around the time the TTP officially established themselves (Kfir, 2014). The Tehrik-e-Taliban emerged in Pakistan through
the merger of twenty-seven (27) varying Taliban networks; social groups. According to scholars, TTP proactively accepts and encourages the ideology of executing violent forms of *jihad* (Kfir, 2014). One school of thought of how the Tehrik-e-Taliban came about in Pakistan is rooted in the belief that Pakistani Islamists sought to mimic, in Pakistan, what Afghan Taliban achieved within Kabul in the year of 1996 (Behuria, 2014). According to the literature, in the beginning the TTP concerned themselves with the international parties functioning within Afghanistan; the United States (Kfir, 2014). Shortly thereafter, the TTP shifted their focus and their objective became two-fold. According to scholars, the first objective of the TTP was to counter the United States drone policy within Pakistan and disrupt government partnerships between Pakistan and the United States; which the TTP believed was “weakening” Pakistan (Kfir, 2014; Ihtiaq, 2013). The second objective of the TTP focused on spreading, implementing, and enforcing Islamic Law in areas controlled by the Pakistani Taliban (Kfir, 2014).

According to the literature, TTP embraced and implemented the concept of “defensive jihad” towards the Army of Pakistan (Fair & Jones, 2009, p. 162). To their advantage, the TTP gained legitimacy from community members because their strategy of defensive jihad resonated deeply for community members (Fair & Jones, 2009). Researchers support the notion that between the years of 2002 and 2007 more than 200 tribal leaders’ killings were a consequence of defensive jihad by the Taliban in Pakistan (Clarke, 2011; Abbas, 2008). Arguably, some researchers, politicians, civilians, psychologist, law enforcement agencies/officers, the media, and other observers from the outside looking in may assume that the act of killing tribal leaders is simply chaos. However, other researchers, politicians, civilians, psychologist, law enforcement
agencies/officers, the media and other observers would argue that the killings conducted by the TTP served their interests in three ways. First, as each tribal leader was eliminated the TTP funneled down the number of opposing ideas and/or views, as well as eliminated religious and tribal values and beliefs that went against the reality that the TTP sought to impose (Iannaccone, 2012). Secondly, by performing defensive jihad against the Army of Pakistan in the North Waziristan region and the Swat District, some scholars argue that the TTP is affirming its stance as a key power player against the group that is supposed to have the most power within Pakistan; which arguably are the institutions established by the state that are meant to provide security for the people (Abbas, 2008). Some scholars claim that by establishing their dominance in the region, the TTP have carved out a piece of territory that can be called their own within Pakistan, while also planting the seed which over time will help them gain legitimacy from the people (Siddiqa, 2011; Abbas, 2008). Hence, the literature shows that the TTP are recognized as a legitimate social group in Northern Waziristan and Southern Waziristan; associated with FATA (Abbas, 2008). Finally, the TTP create and manage institutions of service dedicated to protecting the people under their control; fulfilling basic human needs that the state of Pakistan has failed to do (Siddiqa, 2011; Abbas, 2008).

**Theoretical Perspectives**

**Theory of Rationalization**

Max Weber was a German university scholar during the twentieth century that is most commonly known for being the founding father of sociology. In addition, Weber (1958) is known to have been the creator of the theory of rationalization. Weber (1958) claimed that modern society (although his focus was the Western world) is becoming
exponentially rationalized. According to Weber (1958), the theory of rationalization consists of four (4) pillars that help construct it. The first type of rationality can be found by studying the daily routine tasks of individuals within a society and comprehending how they reflect on their interests of the world (Weber, 1904, 1905, 1958). Ritzer (2008) believed that human beings followed three (3) basic steps before acting on any decision. Ritzer’s claims are based on Weber’s (1958; 1946) theory of rationalization; (1) the individual sorts the number of options she/he has available at the moment, (2) the individual selects the option, at the moment, with the highest possibility of success, (3) the individual commits to the option, from step two, and progresses through life; continually repeating the three steps for all decisions.

Weber (1958, p. 293; 1946) claimed that theoretical rationalization required the ability to theorize about how the world is and/or should function. Theoretical rationalization requires logical inference, the ability to grasp causality concepts within society, and the ability to bring meaning to symbolic arrangements (Ritzer, 2008). Kalberg (1980) claims that theoretical rationalization requires that human beings be able to give meaning (logically) to a world that may appear chaotic. Unlike practical rationality which involves an individual performing an action, theoretical rationalization is an intellectual process that is brain-based. Substantive rationality is associated with an individuals’ personal beliefs, the unique value system that helps them function in the world throughout their day, especially when they must make decisions (Weber, 1958, Ritzer, 2008). Weber (1921, 1946, 1968) claimed that “the degree to which the provisioning of given groups of persons with goods is shaped by economically oriented social action under some criterion (past, present, or potential) of ultimate values,
regardless of the nature of these ends.” As a result, substantive rationality takes into consideration the process by which individuals make their decisions based on their personal humanistic values. Finally, Kalberg (1980) simplifies formal rationality by claiming that such type of rationality consists of how decisions are made by individuals based on “universally applied rules, regulations, and laws.” Formal rationality is most commonly a form of rationality which is found within bureaucracies, laws governing an individual’s society, and means of trade that influence their economy (Ritzer, 2008). The process in which an individual makes decisions are influenced by these surrounding establishments and their governance influence (Ritzer, 2008).

The applicability of the theory is that the theory of rationalization provides researchers a theoretical lens by which they can analyze society effectively. In addition, through the theory of rationalization researchers are able to study the actions of human-beings within the context of meaning and rationality. The theory of rationalization was selected for this dissertation because through this theory I sought to understand and explain the actions taken to counter violent extremism in Pakistan and the meaning associated with those actions. Furthermore, the theory of rationalization may be implemented within a study to understand a community/society and the establishments within said society. The theory of rationalization is relevant to the discipline of conflict resolution because the theoretical perspective provided can assist researchers to conduct an explanatory study of individual and institutional players’ choice selections as means and ends. Finally, the theory of rationalization can assist in conducting an explanatory study of cultural aspects of conflict (Ritzer, 2008, p. 136-147). The theory of rationalization falls within the boundaries of the critical paradigm. As mentioned
previously, the critical paradigm seeks to challenge preconceived notions of society and knowledge in an attempt to correct any short-comings. Scholars believe that the critical paradigm was a result of all the critiques of Marxism and wanted a more in-depth comprehension that accurately portrayed the natural functions of society (Ritzer, 2008).

**Theory of Power**

Michel Foucault was an influential French philosopher during the twentieth-century that has significantly influenced the study of politics. According to Lemert (2004, p. 465), Foucault brought to life the social theory of power as knowledge. Foucault, through the theory of power as knowledge, claimed that political power impacted all aspects of an individual’s life through the channels of knowledge within the modern world (Lemert, 2004). According to Lemert (2004), power should be understood as *strategies* that have originated because of the relationship between power and the interactions throughout society. In the text “The Subject and Power,” Foucault elaborates on *relations* by explaining that in our daily lives we act in such a manner as to manipulate how the other individual reacts to us and others. But Foucault makes clear that our intention to manipulate another individual does not necessarily achieve the results we were expecting. The reason why, according to Foucault, is because the social effects of our actions to alter some else’s behavior are outside of our realm of control and governance. As a result, ceaseless confrontations and struggles become bigger concerns or diminish quickly. According to Lemert (2004, p. 467) Foucault’s theory of power as knowledge makes five (5) speculations: (1) Power is not limited to one source, it comes from multiple points of influence, (2) power relations are significantly obvious in sexual relationships, (3) power originates from below not from above, (4) power relations can be
both non-subjective and intentional, and (5) wherever you can find power, resistance exists as well.

Foucault’s theory of power as knowledge was used in this dissertation to comprehend how power influences relationships, as well as the role power embodies. The theory of power as knowledge is applicable to both micro and macro levels of analysis of social phenomenon. The theory of power as knowledge is relevant to the discipline of peace studies because it helps researchers conducting explanatory studies to address concerns of power within relationships. Foucault’s theory of power as knowledge is most commonly associated with the poststructuralist paradigm. According to Ritzer (2008, p. 222), poststructuralism does not limit itself to the importance of establishments and their influence in society, instead such paradigm goes past these structures and seeks a deeper perspective of other concerns. Hence, the argument can be made that Foucault’s theory of power as knowledge embraces the importance of structures but goes deeper into the analysis to incorporate any and all concerns of power.

**General Systems Theory**

Niklas Luhmann was a German philosopher of the twentieth century. Luhmann is known as being the founding father of systems theory (1982). According to Luhmann (1982), systems theory should not be confused as a theory that analyzes specific cities or states to shine a light on their unique features of how the city and/or state functions. Instead, systems theory is the process by which researchers implement system analysis to understand the structures and approaches by which to reconstruct the societal system (Luhmann, 1982). Luhmann (1982) claimed that systems are in a continuous feedback loop providing meaningful communication to ensure its adaptability and effectiveness.
Since society naturally requires the constant interaction of individuals, the actions (presence) of these individuals generates the actions that the system requires to function (Albert, 2016).

Luhmann (1982) introduces the concept of autopoiesis. According to Luhmann (1982), an autopoietic system is made up of four elements (Luhmann, 1982); (1) it establishes the fundamental elements that are required to have a functional system, (2) they are functional because they are self-organizing, the limitations and internal structures are all self-designed for effectiveness, (3) are self-referential to maximize effectiveness and allow for adaptability, and (4) are closed. In addition, Luhmann (1982) claimed that any challenges to the stability and effectiveness of the system would be eliminated by the system.

The purpose for including general systems theory into my dissertation is because the theory can be used to explain social systems. General systems theory can be used to analyze and provide a more in-depth comprehension of interpersonal, inter-group, and international relations systems. As hinted by Luhmann (1982), general systems theory may also be used to analyze double contingency within systems and how systems are failing to communicate; thereby within a conflict study the systems encompassing the conflict that are failing to communicate effectively. General systems theory is classified under the postmodern paradigm. According to Ritzer (2008), postmodern social theory makes the claim that new and varying ways of thinking about phenomena should be embraced. Scholars claim that the postmodern paradigm seeks to set itself apart from concerns of human subjects (Ritzer, 2008). Hence, Luhmann (1982), through the creation of general systems theory contributed to the literature a fresh perspective by which the
world could be viewed and a perspective that did not focus solely on humans, but on the prevailing systems.

**Social Facts (Emile Durkheim)**

Emile Durkheim was a French sociologist of the twentieth-century that went against nineteenth century philosophers that claimed society was only determined by nature. Instead, Durkheim proposed that society was more complex than the social-Darwinist perspective of the nineteenth-century outlook (Matthias, 2000). Durkheim (1895/2006, p. 285) claimed that “man depends upon only three kinds of environment: the organism, the external world and society.” Durkheim (1895/2006), sought to study social process as divided into two subcategories; (1) things and (2) persons (1895/2006, p. 136). Durkheim claimed, “things, to be sure, form part of society just as persons, and they play a specific role in it. Thus, it is necessary that their relations with the social organism be determined” (1895/2006, p. 115).

Durkheim was not concerned with reducing social facts to the individualistic level. To apply the concept of social facts to the individual level is to completely misunderstand the concept of social facts. According to scholars, social facts should be explained with reference to precursory social facts. In addition, sociologist seeking to understand social facts should avoid reductionism. Durkehim (1895/2006) claimed that the bigger picture of a group and/or society was necessary to obtaining a full understanding, instead of focusing on subcategories. Hence, critiques of Durkheim take an Auguste Comte perspective and claim that Durkheim is advocating for a meta-physical thinking. Durkheim, on the contrary, was not attempting to align himself with meta-physical thinking, instead Durkheim implies that when a mixture of individuals come
together within larger social confines a shift/transition occurs. The group embodies various new traits that cannot be reduced to individualistic traits.

As a result, the social group embodies its own density, establish their specific type/forms of regulation, develop new perspectives of group think, and in the views of Durkheim their own birth rate and suicide rate (Durkheim, 1895/2006). Each of these specific traits become attributes of the social formation and it would be impossible to reduce them to specific members. Durkheim (1895/2006) believed that these attributes emerged from the structures as a whole; collective consciousness. Durkheim’s (1895/2006) notion of social facts was and still is a direct challenge to the field of psychologists. Durkheim (1895/2006) claimed that contrary to the belief that by understanding individual members of a group/society the decisions/behaviors of the masses could be predicted. Durkheim (1895/2006) refuted such claims and stated that as members come together establishing new entities, the process of association creates entirely new phenomenon that cannot be reduced to specific members. Durkheim (1895/2006) advocated that social facts are “\textit{phenomena sui generis}” (Latin) that are not mythical as implied by critiques.

**Compare Theoretical Perspective**

The theory of rationalization, power as knowledge, general systems theory, and social facts theory are all sociological theories that may be used to explain conflicts. It was my goal to use the theory of rationalization to analyze and understand how the actor makes decisions based on pre-conceived notions; attempted to follow the logic used by the policy-makers to reach their decision. General systems theory and the theory of rationalization relates in the sense that they focus and help understand the actors within
the context of their environment. The social facts theory helped understand the specific pressures placed on the individual from various levels. The social facts theory was not used at the individualistic level, it was implemented to support/compliment the theory of power as knowledge. The rationale behind merging these specific two theories together was solely focused on ensuring the study provided various sociological perspectives ranging from micro-level and macro-level. The theory of rationalization, power as knowledge, general systems theory, and social facts theory all originate from various paradigms; critical, positivism, postmodern, and poststructuralist.
Chapter 3: Methodological Approach

Introduction

Within this chapter, it was my goal to provide my readers with a detailed outline of the research design I envisioned to use and provided an effective critique of relevant literature on case study research. In addition, I sought to provide a full report of the population I sought to study, the various sites I sought to incorporate in my study, the data collection process I sought to use, the data analysis process I conducted, and the overall research process.

Research Design

As with all research projects, the researcher must create and make clear the strategy that she/he sought to follow while collecting, analyzing, and reporting the information she/he researched. Yin (2014, p. 4; 1981) believes that research question(s) beginning with “how” or “why” in addressing some social phenomenon, ordinarily, call for case study research. In addition, Yin (2014; 1981) believes that case study research compliments research projects that demand complex and comprehensive descriptions of some societal phenomenon. Yin (2014, p. 9; 1981), provides researchers with three conditions that must be met to narrow down the appropriate method for a researcher’s project. The first condition Yin (2014; 1981) seeks to address is the type of question that the researcher seeks to focus on in her or his research project. According to Yin (2014; 1981), the fashion in which the question is structured and is presented helps the researcher narrow down the options. For example, if a researcher begins her or his research question with “how” or “who,” the five methods available are narrowed down between two or three research methods.
The second condition that Yin (2014; 1981) seeks to address revolves around the researchers’ direct impact or control relating to behavioral events of the research study. Ultimately, the amount of direct influence the researcher will have on the study will assist the researcher in narrowing down the most effective means of research methods and/or techniques for her/his research study. Finally, the third condition Yin (2014; 1981) wants researchers to address prior to selecting their research method is to clearly define if the research seeks to study historical events or contemporary events. By clearly defining the three conditions Yin (2014; 1981) believes researchers will be well prepared in ensuring they have selected the appropriate research method for their research question.

Applying the Yin’s (2014; 1981) previously mentioned three conditions to my dissertation study, I implemented case study methods as my methodology. Since my study sought to understand how Pakistan’s countering violent extremism narrative has influenced the conditions that enable extremist recruitment and radicalization in Peshawar Pakistan I have met the first condition on Yin’s (2014; 1981) three conditions checklist. Furthermore, my dissertation study did not require the control of behavioral events for the execution of my research project. As a result, I have also met Yin’s (2014; 1981) second condition. Finally, because I sought to study the currently active countering violent extremism narrative that was implemented in Pakistan in 2014, I satisfy Yin’s (2014; 1981) third condition; demanding that the focus of the study be a contemporary event. Therefore, as my research question proposed, I sought to conduct an explanatory case study project (Yin, 2014, 1981; Graham & Zelikow, 1999). I sought to focus on operational links that could be traced over time. Also, to assist in addressing the research question, the case study method was preferred because of its unique strength in
incorporating various sources of evidence; “documents, artifacts, interviews, and observations” (Yin, 2014, p. 12; 1981).

**Research Paradigm**

How does a researcher know what knowledge is? How does a researcher know when knowledge has been discovered? Scotland (2012) would agree that the answer(s) to both of these questions would be subjective. It is vital for researchers to determine the ontological and epistemological assumptions behind every contribution of scholarly researcher they conduct or read. Researchers should be able to recognize how other scholars, and their own, assumptions intertwine with their selected methodology and methods, as well as how the alignment of these assumptions guide the research findings (Scotland, 2012). When conducting research, properly understanding these assumptions can strengthen a researcher’s study.

In the following sections below, it is my intention to introduce, analyze, and deconstruct three differing paradigms. Although the deconstruction process is not to support or validate any paradigm, the deconstruction process within this dissertation is solely to help my readers/audience understand my rationale for selecting the paradigm I have implemented in my dissertation project. In addition, it is not my goal within the following sections to persuade readers to favor one paradigm over another. Nor is it my intention to claim that one paradigm is superior to another paradigm. However, it is my goal within the following pages to explain the strengths and flaws of these paradigms and guide readers in understanding why a specific paradigm was selected for the purpose of my research study. In addition, since we can all agree that the same research phenomenon can be analyzed using various theoretical perspectives, methodologies, and techniques,
the paradigm I have selected for this dissertation sought to bridge and to fill a gap in the body of literature.

To begin, I aim to explain how a paradigm is defined within this dissertation and how I intend to recognize paradigms within this dissertation. Secondly, I introduce the first paradigm to readers, specifically the scientific paradigm. Within this section, I attempted to provide a strength and weakness analysis of the scientific paradigm in regard to my dissertation topic. Thirdly, I sought to introduce to the readers the interpretive paradigm, the second paradigm taken into consideration for this dissertation. I attempted to explain what the interpretive paradigm is, the application of the interpretive paradigm within other research studies and finally provide a strength and weakness discussion on the interpretive paradigm. Fourthly, my goal was to introduce the third and final paradigm that was taken into consideration during the research design process of this dissertation. As had been done with previous paradigms, I sought to explain to readers what the critical paradigm is, its application to research studies, and the strength and weakness of the paradigm. Finally, after introducing and critiquing each of the three paradigms, I sought to provide my audience with a brief summary clearly stating the paradigm that was selected and implemented for the duration of this dissertation.

The paradigms to follow below were not selected at random. On the contrary, the paradigms included within this dissertation were three differing paradigms that were all taken into consideration by the researcher throughout the research design process. In addition, as the researcher delved deeper into each paradigm the pros and cons of each paradigm, within the context of countering violent extremism within Pakistan, were
apparent to the researcher. As a result, the researcher intends to guide the audience through the thought process that he himself took while taking into consideration these various paradigms. For research purposes, as well as in attempting to contribute to the overall body of knowledge, in this dissertation I sought to provide a clear rationale for my choice of paradigm.

What is a Paradigm?

According to Scotland (2012), a paradigm is supported by four components. The four components consist of ontology, epistemology, methodology, and methods (Scotland, 2012). Crotty (1989, p. 10), states that ontology explains how the being is studied. In other words, ontological assumptions help researchers address what she/he constitutes as reality (Crotty, 1989); also, referred to as what is reality. To strengthen any body of research, a researcher should take a position regarding how she/he perceives how things in the world are and how the world really works. Epistemology, on the other hand, address a different matter within a research project. Cohen, Manion, and Morrison (2007, p. 7) state that epistemology focuses on defining the nature and various forms of how knowledge is perceived/constructed. The assumptions that epistemology seek to address revolve around how knowledge is formed, attained, and articulated (Cohen et al., 2007). Epistemology seeks to uncover what it means to know (Cohen et al., 2007). In addition, Guba and Lincoln (1994), help readers better understand the concept of epistemology. Guba and Lincoln (1994, p. 108) state epistemology proposes the question, what is the interconnection between what can ultimately be known and the individual seeking to gain the knowledge?
Scotland (2012) emphasizes that paradigms are constructed by specific ontological and epistemological assumptions. In addition, because the assumptions are postulations, the philosophical foundation that construct each element of the paradigm cannot be empirically proven or disproven (Scotland, 2012). Hence, the mixing and matching of differing paradigms can contain numerous combinations of ontological and epistemological views; which is why the same phenomenon studied can be analyzed multiple ways. Thusly, various paradigms will have unique, and differing, assumptions regarding knowledge and reality for their specific research goals. Ordinarily, a researchers’ paradigm can be found clearly defined within their methodology and methods section (Scotland, 2012), or can be derived by reading between the lines of the article/book (Yin, 2014). Crotty (1989, p. 3) emphasizes that a research projects methodology should be viewed as a structured outline bounding the researcher based on the various choices and matching of specific methods. Hence, when a scholar is attempting to define clearly the \textit{how}, \textit{what}, \textit{where}, \textit{why}, and \textit{when} data should be collected and analyzed, she/he is focusing on methodology. In addition, structured outline aids researchers from getting confused and ensures the study is reliable and valid. According to Guba and Lincoln (1994, p. 108), when the researcher is contemplating the methodology for their specific study, ultimately the researcher is attempting to answer: how should I (\textit{researcher}) structure the project to best figure out whatever I (\textit{researcher}) speculate can be known by completing the study? For the purpose of this dissertation, I will attempt to answer, “How should I structure my dissertation to best figure out the impact that the countering violent extremism narrative of the 21\textsuperscript{st} amendment within Pakistan’s constitution has had in the Peshawar region?”
Crotty (1989, p. 3), emphasizes that methods consist of narrowing down various techniques and procedures that should be used throughout the data collection and analysis process of a study. The data collected will fall within two categories (Yin, 2014): (1) qualitative or (2) quantitative. Paradigms can be constructed to use either (1) specifically qualitative methods, (2) specifically quantitative methods, or (3) a combination of both which is referred to as mixed methods (Yin, 2014; Scotland, 2012). Research methods of any study can be broken down into various elements and can be categorized based on their methodology, epistemology, and ontological positions (Scotland, 2012). Although not every study will explicitly state their ontological and epistemological position (Scotland, 2012), it is impossible to effectively conduct a research study without a researcher committing to specific ontological and epistemological positions (Yin, 2014). Grix (2004, p. 64), makes it clear that through the various combinations of mixing-and-matching ontological and epistemological propositions, a researcher can create a specific phenomenon which can be studied multiple times through various perspectives.

Therefore, in the following section I intend to introduce to my readers the first paradigm I took into consideration when designing my dissertation outline. The first paradigm I contemplated was the scientific paradigm. In the section below, I will provide a brief history of the scientific paradigm. Following the history of the scientific paradigm I will attempt to inform my readers of the applicability of the scientific paradigm within research studies found throughout the body of scholarly research. Finally, in the upcoming section I intend to argue what should be the criteria for effective research studies implementing the scientific paradigm.
Scientific Paradigm

Auguste Comte was a French philosopher that is credited as being the founding father of positivism (Scotland, 2012). During the second half of the nineteenth century, positivism dominated the philosophical and political movement during the second half of the nineteenth century (Bourdeau, 2008). Positivism is known to have arose from the Enlightenment period and is referred to as the scientific paradigm (Scotland, 2012). According to Crotty (1998, p. 19), it was Comte that brought awareness to the term that is commonly known as positivism; as he ventured on to apply the scientific paradigm. Cohen, Manion, and Morrison (2007, p. 9) state that Comte’s desire to study the natural world and the social world through scientific paradigms lead to the simplification of the term positivism.

According to Scotland (2012), positivism’s ontological position is categorized as realism. Cohen et al. (2007, p. 7), explains that realism’s stance of the world is that regardless of the knowers acknowledgement that the object exists, the object has an existence. Pring (2000a, p. 59), hence, stresses that regardless of the researcher and her/his specific study, reality continues to exist independently. According to Scotland (2012), positivists assume a speculative stance that reality is not constructed through our senses. Frowe (2001, p. 176), argues that through the process of naming and designating objects, words create the meaning of such objects. Hence, language becomes the transformative agent as it brings together the world through appointive functions (Scotland, 2012).

As a result, it can be argued that objectivism is the epistemological stance of positivists (Scotland, 2012). Attempting to discover knowledge about what positivists
consider an objective reality, positivists take an impartial stance as they progress throughout the world. From an academic stance point, the scholar and the phenomenon studied are perceived as independent entities (Scotland, 2012). Therefore, an object does not receive its meaning from the scholar, the meaning of an object already exists, and it is the responsibility of the scholar to collect and analyze the object to reveal its meaning.

Crotty (1998) provides readers with a vivid example of positivist epistemology,

“*A tree in the forest is a tree, regardless of whether anyone is aware of its existence or not. As an object of that kind, it carries the intrinsic meaning of treeness. When human beings recognize it as a tree, they are simply discovering a meaning that has been lying in wait for them all along*” (p. 8).

House (1991, p. 2) states that because scientific proposals are rooted in facts and actual data, a scientific paradigm has a solid foundation. Hence, through research the independent existence of a phenomena can be discovered (Scotland, 2012). Scotland (2012), believes that knowledge which is discoverable is not hidden within historical or political context; because it is value free and absolute. Positivism paved the path for post-positivism during the 20th century. Hence, because post-positivism shares similar ontological and epistemological assumptions like positivism, post-positivism can be and is confused with positivism. However, post-positivism differs in various ways.

Popper (1959, p. 415-419), believes that when scholars accept the truths that are the result of the scientific paradigm, their actions and/or assumptions are nothing more than reaffirming the currently tested speculations of reality. In other words, their results are not contributing new scholarly knowledge, they are simply providing support for preconceived notions/knowledge. In addition, Ernest (1994, p. 22) reminds researchers
that because of the *principle of falsification* scientific theories struggle with the ability to be proven true. It is through the numerous failed attempts to refute the scientific theories that these scientific theories can be accepted (Scotland, 2012); cautiously. Therefore, Popper (1959, p. 280) reminds readers that because all theories are flawed every scientific finding should remain forever in a tentative mode. As a result, post-positivism takes the stance that empirical data is required in order to comprehend scientific theories (Scotland, 2012). According to Crotty (1998, p. 29), post-positivism speculates that knowledge through the post-positivistic lens is considered to be more significant and objective when compared to the knowledge that is created by other paradigms.

According to Scotland (2012), positivist methodology is used when a research question seeks to explain the connection(s) of a phenomenon. Creswell (2009, p. 7), makes clear that positivists seek to uncover causes that impact the end results. Ultimately, positivist contribute to the bringing about of laws (Scotland, 2012); therefore, creating the opportunity for their outcomes to be predictable and generalizable. Scholars agree that positivist undertake a deductive approach (Yin, 2014; Scotland 2012; Creswell, 2009). Positivists methodology implement correlations and experimentations to breakdown complex exchanges down to their individual elements (Scotland, 2012). Positivist methodology techniques focus on direct observations and experiences (Creswell, 2009). Through the techniques of empirical testing, the process of randomized samples, controlled groups and controlled independent, dependent, and moderator variables positivists gain knowledge (Scotland, 2012). Instead of designing and conducting quasi-experiments positivist implement true-experiments (Cohen et al., 2007). Cohen et al. (2007), therefore, informs readers of the concept of nomothetic, which is an approach that
focuses on discovering generalizable laws that are created by following specific procedures and methods. Because positivist incorporate a value neutral perspective within their methodology, the knowledge that is brought about from their studies is ultimately value neutral (Scotland, 2012).

In the same way, post-positivist studies focus on understanding the complex causal relationships (Scotland, 2012). As a result, often times researchers seek to incorporate a quantitative analysis approach to generate data. Pring (2000a), elaborates on the quantitative techniques and shares that through standardized tests, closed ended surveys and standardized observation tools positivist generate quantitative data. Scotland (2012), believes that the analysis process of post-positivists studies report statistics through descriptions and inferential means. As a result, it is because of the inferential statistics generated from sample groups that post-positivists are able to generalize their studies to populations.

Post-positivist research can be classified as exemplary only if the independent variable, which is also the internal validity, has the ability to be generalizable or implemented to similar populations and/or situations; the external validity would be the populations and/or situations (Scotland, 2012). In addition, the study can be replicated by other scholars, regardless of discipline and area of expertise, and achieve the same conclusion following the original researchers’ methodology; thereby meeting the replicability and reliability requirement (Scotland, 2012). Furthermore, research conducted through a post-positivists lens requires that the proper procedure has been taken by the researcher to ensure that the study adheres to being as unbiased as possible, while also being able to withstand vigorous empirical disproof from critiques.
Critique of Scientific Paradigm

Since all research questions demand the implementation of various styles of methods to analyze and comprehend the natural world we currently live in, not all methods have the flexibility to be transferable to the social world (Scotland, 2012). As a result, positivism has limitations that other scholars have not failed to critique. As previously mentioned, positivism seeks to deconstruct complex issues by reaching to the root traits and controlling variables (Scotland, 2012). However, such a task can be difficult to conduct in certain research studies. One critique of positivism is that if a researcher is studying a specific phenomenon, the context of the phenomenon could limit the methodology (Scotland, 2012). In addition, the ability to isolate specific variables can prove to be a dreadful and difficult task for the researcher(s).

House (1991) points out that certain variables only reveal themselves as meaningful/useful to the scholar only after the impact of the variable(s) become(s) apparent in the study. In other words, specific factors that have the capacity to fluctuate such as food poisoning (considered an ordinary life occurrence) and anger (an attitude/emotion) are hidden variables within a study (Scotland, 2012). Hence, Shank and Brown (2007) remind researchers that the assumptions within a study may ultimately be supported because of unaccounted for reasons that were not originally taken into consideration in the design process of the study. Berliner (2002), furthermore, emphasizes that it is impossible and unrealistic to assume that human behavior can be fully explained through scientific explanation. Scotland (2012) reminds readers that data from inferential statistics can be misunderstood and, therefore, taint the overall study conducted by researchers. In addition, inexperienced researchers run the risk of selecting
and implementing the wrong statistical test for the study (Scotland, 2012). For instance, when attempting to analyze data that is not normally distributed the researcher would benefit from using a non-parametric test. In addition, how the P-values are interpreted are dependent on the researchers’ objective; is the researcher attempting to test a hypothesis or is the researcher attempting to test the significance (Blume & Peiper, 2003). In addition, Blume and Peiper (2003, p. 2) remind researchers that the statistical significance of the tests is dependent upon the size of the sample population/group.

Hence, these researchers remind us that the outcomes (results) that are reached through inferential statistic tests cannot be accepted at face-value (Scotland, 2012), scholars need to understand the complexity behind them.

Scriven (1970, p. 100), states that the deductions made by researchers from empirical generalization are usually not explanatory. Scotland (2012) builds on that statement by explaining that generalizations made from a positivistic lens fails to account for the individuals’ intentionality, therefore the actions of an individual cannot be understood completely. Simply because two police officers arrive to a crime scene and give the appearance that they are doing the same procedure, may in reality be doing two completely different things at the crime scene. In another instance, two mechanics replacing a failed battery in a vehicle may take two differing approaches to diagnosing the issue. Mechanic A may use a fluke digital multimeter to read the battery’s low voltage, while mechanic B may insert the key into the ignition and realize the electrical components of the vehicle fail to function properly. The actions of an individual must be comprehended from the subjects’ point of view while also taking into consideration both the process and agency (Scotland, 2012).
Another critique of positivist is the concern that the researcher(s) genuinely embraces the concept that their study is strictly removed from standards and is purely objective (Scotland, 2012). However, while conducting the study the researcher embraces the postulation of various judgments. For instance, Salomon (1991) states that positivist researchers clearly define their variables, explain the specific behaviors that will be observed throughout the study, and provide their comprehension of the study outcomes. In addition, Scotland (2012) reminds readers that knowledge produced through the positivistic lens is considered law, and therefore political. Some researchers claim that their refusal to have any political association connected to the outcomes of her/his study is in itself a political stance (Scotland, 2012). Ashby (1964) states clearly that research conducted by positivists have undeniably advanced societies understanding of philosophy, embraced rigorous measures of standards and sought to provide scholars with a different method that has resulted in widely accepted outcomes from studies. Verified observational claims have aided policy makers in furthering their agendas (Scotland 2012).

As a result, it is not my intention to reaffirm preestablished knowledge. On the contrary, the purpose of this dissertation is to contribute new knowledge to the overall body of scholarly research. In addition, the goal of this dissertation is not to bring about laws to counter violent extremism. The goal of this dissertation is to explain the established amendment Pakistan has implemented into their constitution. Furthermore, as stated above, with the scientific paradigm the context of a phenomenon limits the options of methodologies. As well as, the scientific paradigm hinders the ability of the researcher to explain human behavior. In this dissertation, my aim is to explain the chain of events
that occurred which lead to the establishment of the countering violent extremism amendment by Pakistani government officials. Finally, because the scientific paradigm fails to explain the intentions of individuals making specific actions/decision I was left with no choice but to take into consideration another paradigm. Therefore, in the following section I will introduce the second paradigm I considered for the purpose of this dissertation; the interpretive paradigm.

**Interpretive Paradigm**

Scotland (2012) states that relativism is the ontological stance of the interpretive paradigm; interpretivism. In 1994, Guba and Lincoln (1994) stated that relativism is the assumption that every individual in society has their own interpretation of what constitutes reality. Therefore, because of our natural senses we interpret reality based on our senses. In addition, because we have the ability to exercise consciousness we provide meaning to the world; without consciousness, the world around us would serve no purpose and be meaningless (Scotland 2012; Crotty, 1998; Guba & Lincoln, 1994). Crotty (1998) believes that it is through our own awareness (consciousness) while we interact with things, that already have meaning, that the emergence of reality occurs. Hence, for every individual roaming the world reality is interpreted differently from their perspective; resorting in accepting the notion that the construction of reality is individualistic (Scotland, 2012). Frowe’s (2001, p. 185), contribution reveals that through language objects in the world begin to take shapes and patterns that constitute reality, instead of simply getting a commonly accepted label with no meaning. Therefore, the construction of reality is established by both our choice of language and characteristics of an autonomous world (Scotland, 2012).
In regard to epistemology, the epistemological stance of the interpretive paradigm is rooted on phenomena that occurs in the real world and is therefore classified subjectivism. Grix (1998), states that the world in which we live in does not continue to function independently of our knowledge of all aspects of it. Crotty (1998), returning to the example of the tree to explain the scientific paradigm, explains the interpretive paradigm as follows,

“We need to remind ourselves here that it is human beings who have constructed it as a tree, given it the name, and attributed to it the associations we make with trees” (p.83).

Therefore, one can extrapolate that without individuals labeling the tree a tree, the tree cannot be recognized as a tree. Crotty (1998), reminds researchers that our individual consciousness is due to the consciousness of the objects in the world. Heron and Reason (1997) remind us that the fashion in which we, as individuals, experience a world goes hand-in-hand with how we reconstruct and interact with the world. From a subjectivism point of view, the exchange between a specific phenomenon and consciousness refers to intentionality (Scotland, 2012). Crotty (1998) states that when numerous individuals focus on the same phenomenon multiple meanings are constructed in varying fashions. However, Pring (2000(b)) added on to Crotty’s belief and reminded researchers that it is through the consensus process of individuals within a society/group that the construction of the truth occurs. As a result, knowledge can be consequential of cultures and can be positioned historically (Scotland, 2012). Therefore, Scotland (2012) makes clear that with the interpretive paradigm point-of-view, ideologies are not refuted they are simply accepted.
Crotty (1998) reminds researchers that individuals give meaning to their reality and knowledge through multiple ways. Knowledge and reality can be established by how, or not, individuals interact with the world (Crotty, 1998). In addition, knowledge and reality are established and conveyed through social context (Crotty, 1998). So, Cohen et al. (2007), reveals that the social world must be analyzed and understood through the lens/perspective of individuals that are part of the specific social world being studied. Therefore, if researchers seek to study social forces and structures it would be in their interest to contemplate interpretivism, because interpretivism’s goal is to raise our consciousness of the unrecognized forces of society and structures (Scotland, 2012).

Creswell (2009, p. 8) informs researchers that an interpretive methodology attempts to study and raise understanding about a phenomenon from the perspective of individuals. Such understanding, per Creswell (2009), attempts to study the social process that occurs among individuals within a society and/or group along with any and all cultural and historical contexts that relate to and impact the members that form the society/group. Multiple methodology approaches exist to help a researcher. For example, a researcher can incorporate case studies by designing a detailed study of events or processes that occurred over a long period (Scotland, 2012). A researcher can also attempt to analyze the lived experiences without intrusion of existing predeterminations, also referred to as phenomenology (Scotland, 2012). Furthermore, a researcher could implement a hermeneutics methodology, which focuses on analyzing and decoding any concealed meanings that are found in language (Scotland, 2012). As a last example, a researcher could potentially embrace an ethnography methodology, if she/he is
attempting to study cultural groups, while living within their community, over a long period of time (Scotland, 2012).

Guba and Lincoln (1994), share that individual constructs are educed and comprehended through the interplay among the individuals conducting the study and the individuals being researched. Unlike other approaches, interpretations of studied occurrences are not simplified to their most basic element. On the contrary, Scotland (2012) believes that through rich descriptions of the phenomena scholars begin to understand the hidden multilayered interconnections that were not previously known. Thusly, Cohen et al. (2007) remind readers that due to the inductive (grounded) nature of interpretive theory knowledge is generated from the data. As a result, researchers embrace research questions that are not specific and narrowed down; instead, the questions are broad (Scotland, 2012). In addition, interpretivists take a firm stance in their belief that it is not possible for knowledge to be considered value-free (Scotland, 2012). For instance, Edge and Richards (1998), support the argument that knowledge cannot be value-free because throughout the planning stage and research process researchers take a stance (implicitly or explicitly) on their beliefs; by selecting what they want to study, the make-up of how they intend to study the phenomenon, and their claim(s) on how to effectively analyze their data to generate new knowledge.

According to Scotland (2012), selecting an interpretive method should be done if the researcher is seeking to shine a light on and comprehend behaviors, conduct an explanatory study in regard to specific actions based on the study’s participants’ perspective, and if the researcher seeks to remove herself/himself from influencing or manipulating participants throughout the study. Scotland (2012, p. 12) states that in order
to conduct such studies researchers may decide to implement “open-ended interviews, focus groups, open-ended questionnaires, open-ended observations, think aloud protocol and role-playing” techniques. The use of such techniques ordinarily produces qualitative data for the researchers (Scotland, 2012). In addition, because the outcome of the study is ultimately the interpretations of the researcher(s), it is the responsibility of the researcher(s) to explicitly make known their specific goal/purpose for the study from the kickoff of the study (Scotland, 2012). Various scholars reveal that the legitimacy of interpretivist research is supported by the fact that studies conducted contribute rich evidence and provides the body of knowledge with credible and justifiable data; meeting the internal validity and/or credibility of research (Cohen et al., 2007; Ritchie & Lewis, 2003). In addition, the study meets the external validity and/or transferability requirement because the outcome of the conducted study can ultimately be used/ transferred by another scholar in a differing situation (Cohen et al., 2007; Ritchie & Lewis, 2003). Finally, the reliability and/or dependability requirement is also confirmed because any scholar can, at any moment in time, mimic the original researchers study and produce the same findings (Cohen et al., 2007; Ritchie & Lewis, 2003).

**Critique of Interpretive Paradigm**

Samdahl (1999) makes clear that with broad generalizations, often times, complex individual meanings can be overshadowed and lost. Hence, this is why an interpretive paradigm is useful, assuming the researcher is seeking to focus on generalizations instead of individualistic perspectives. However, Samdahl (1999) also points out that an interpretive paradigm is flawed and has limitations. Regarding knowledge, interpretive research refutes the fundamental basis of knowledge, which as a result raises concerns
about the validity of interpretive research (Scotland, 2012; Samdahl, 1999). Rolfe (2006) argues that since reality is considered subjective and every individual within a study has a contradictory perspective, it would be impossible to assume that the individuals within the study will be able to establish a consensus that matches the researcher’s interpretations. Therefore, Angen (2000), points out that techniques such as triangulation, which is one of many ways of validating information from multiple sources, peer reviews and the ability to check information by asking other members become useless to the research. The reason they become useless, Angen (2000) states, is because such techniques adopt a fundamental objective certainty that can be confirmed by the use of multiple sources.

Furthermore, Scotland (2012) raises awareness to the concern that an interpretive paradigm produces knowledge that has gaps, flaws, and is not consistent; as a result, it has limited transferability. Unfortunately, the knowledge produced also fails to be generalizable for scholars and policy makers (Scotland, 2012). Scotland (2012) states the knowledge cannot be generalizable because the study ordinarily produces qualitative data that mainly focuses on contextualized data, and the data that is interpreted comprises subjective idiosyncratic constructions. Scotland (2012) also reveals the breach of privacy. The individuals that participate in the research study face the risk of being discovered, because interpretive research methods incorporate intimate and open-ended processes (Scotland, 2012). Howe (2009) and Howe and Moses (1999) reveal that although the intimacy and open-endedness of interpretive research methods can be of benefit to the researcher, for the participant it may unintendedly reveal participant’s secrets, deceits, and domineering relationships. It is the responsibility of the researcher to bring no harm
to their participant(s) and therefore must decide their ethical responsibility to the participants if the participants’ identities are revealed (Scotland, 2012). Depending on the researchers’ vivid description, the more likely it is that the identity of the participant(s) can be uncovered. Therefore, researchers often find themselves debating to what extent they should censor their contextualization in hopes of not exposing the identity of the participants of the study (Scotland, 2012).

Moreover, Scotland (2012) raises the concern that individuals, of which the study is about, have limited input on how the researcher(s) narrates their subjective interpretations about them. In addition, Danby & Farrell (2004) raise the concern that depending on the researcher(s) discipline of expertise the researchers theorized interpretations may possibly vary. Scotland (2012), therefore seeks to stress to researchers to contemplate the importance of understanding to whom does the data belong to? In what fashion, will the data be manipulated by the researcher(s) and to what extent can the participants control the outcomes? Scotland (2012) reminds readers that even though individuals within the study are given a voice, ultimately the decision as to how the research will conduct the study, how the final data will be interpreted, and what parts of the information will be made public lies on the researcher.

Furthermore, Scotland (2012) reminds readers that it is possible for researchers to fall victim to preconceived-meaning-production-processes that we learn throughout our life. As a result, such a lens can taint the researchers’ ability to fully grasp the understanding of the phenomenon without being aware of such biasness (Scotland, 2012). Cohen et al. (2007) also reminds researchers that interpretive research has the potential to take into account the role that external structural forces can play on swaying an
individual’s decision-making process and behavior. Taylor (1993) argues that to really understand some phenomena researchers must take into account ancient customs and traditions, biases and formal practices that are enforced upon us; as can be argued occurs daily throughout various regions and provinces of Pakistan. Any unofficial social norm or ideologies that participants may not be aware they are supporting could potentially dictate their actions (Scotland, 2012). Scotland (2012) stipulates that the explanation of any phenomena by a study’s participants are essentially tainted, because the individuals within the study run the risk of not understanding their own limitations (ideology/reality) that influence and/or guide their day-to-day action(s).

Although the interpretive paradigm meets my dissertation requirement for wanting to comprehend human behaviors and actions, the interpretive paradigm lacks other elements to effectively conduct my study. To begin, in this dissertation I intend to use triangulation to support my findings. Since I plan to use multiple sources, I aim to use triangulation as one of multiple techniques to validate, any and all claims, I make in the last two chapters (4 & 5) of this dissertation. Furthermore, with the interpretive paradigm my study and/or findings will be limited in their transferability to other regions experiencing countering violent extremism narratives from policy makers. Hence, along with the previously mentioned limitations and my specific goals for the purpose of this dissertation, I have taken into consideration a third paradigm; the critical paradigm.

**Critical Paradigm**

Scotland (2012) reveals that the ontological stance of the critical paradigm is classified as historical realism. In addition, Guba and Lincoln (1994) share that reality through historical realism is constructed and takes shape by various elements that make
up our values; such as, society, politics, culture, the economy, ethnicity, and our gender classification. Under historical realism, realities are presumed to be socially constructed beings which adapt continuously to influences from within (Scotland, 2012). As mentioned before, Frowe (2001) believes that language plays a vital role in the shaping and constructing of reality, instead of simply being the tactic by which objects are passively labeled. According to Scotland (2012), it is through the interaction amongst differing elements of the world and language that reality is constructed and comprehended by individuals. However, in regard to the critical paradigm Scotland (2012) believes that language has power functions, as a result language through the critical paradigm is implemented for two purposes; (1) to empower or (2) to weaken.

According to Scotland (2012), critical epistemology falls within the boundaries of subjectivism. Subjectivism is rooted within incidents that occur within the real world and is associated with societal ideologies (Scotland, 2012). Hence, Cohen et al.’s (2007) study supports the notion that true knowledge is brought about from both social group power and positional power by social groups that take ownership of such particular knowledge. Scotland (2012) returns to the example of trees, presented to explain the scientific and interpretive epistemology, and explains that critical epistemology in respect to the knowledge of the trees explains that because of the numerous institutions that exist the tree would ultimately have numerous contradicting beliefs about it. According to Scotland (2012), it is social constructionism that raises awareness to the belief that every individual in society inherits a world that already has meaning; therefore, we embrace the belief that we inherit culture. Crotty (1998), explains that every individual must battle
with being influenced by an existing reality and every individual has no say in embracing such reality.

Such preconceived reality is made up of knowledge that the masses have accepted and are in the process of being accepted by the remaining masses. Siegel (2006), believe that vital elements such as geography, race, cultural associations, and gender classifications directly impact and sway research interests. According to Scotland (2012), the critical paradigm objects to any pre-established belief or ideology that stands as the fundamental ground of knowledge. Therefore, the critical paradigm contradicts what individuals believe to be reality. Crotty (1998) states that when thinking about the critical paradigm researchers need to remember that individuals are not simply in the world, individuals are also with the world. Scotland (2012) shares that it is the goal of the critical paradigm to respond to social justice concerns and issues of marginalization. In regard to the construction of knowledge, Scotland (2012, p. 13) states, “the emancipatory function of knowledge is embraced.”

Scholars advocate that knowledge is derivative of culture because it can be pinpointed within history and can be influenced by political ideas and ideology (Scotland, 2012); therefore, knowledge is not value free. It is because of the critical paradigm that researchers ponder the question “what, then, should we consider naturally meaningful” (axiological question) (Scotland, 2012, p. 13)?” In other words, researchers set out to explore values/beliefs and its nature; as well as, seek to answer questions of morality, metaphysics, various types of religion or the concept of religion itself, and morality (Scotland, 2012). Hence, the critical paradigm questions if things are working properly and evaluates how things ought to be; it is normative and seeks to challenge and judge
reality (Scotland, 2012). In pursuit of continuous improvement (*borderline utopian philosophy*) Scotland (2012) explains that the critical paradigm ultimately leads to more effective democratic societies. As the name implies, the critical methodology is geared towards scrutinizing and challenging established values and assumptions (Scotland, 2012). According to Crotty (1998), critical methodology is directed at shining a light on hegemony and issues of injustice, refuting and questioning accepted and practiced social structures, while engaging in social action. In other words, critical methodology accepts the notion that politics and inquiry cannot be separated, instead they complement one another. According to Scotland (2012), the goal of critical methodology is to liberate the individuals, groups, societies from lack of power and influence.

Pring (2000b, p. 250) reminds readers that researchers, which implement critical methodology into their studies, support the belief that “no research methodology is value free.” As a result, a critical researcher may not deny that from the beginning the researcher is predetermined (Scotland, 2012). Scotland (2012, p. 13) clearly states, “finding out is the means, change is the underlying aim.” According to Freire (1970), such a process is conducted through self-reflection. First, everyone must be critically aware of their current situation (*conscientização*), following self-awareness through praxis the individual must realize the need for change, and finally the individual must reflect on her/his actions for feedback (Freire, 1970); once again beginning the process. Talmy (2010), eloquently states that it is evident that an embryonic, continuously repeating bond between theory, data, research questions(s) and interpretation(s) exists.

Freire (1970) reminds readers that both researchers and individuals of the study contribute to the dialectical duty of unveiling what constitutes as reality, the process of
critically analyzing all aspects of reality, and finally taking the responsibility of reconstructing the knowledge produced. Freire (1970, p. 49) makes clear that it is not the responsibility of the researcher to bring about the transformation for the individuals being studied, it the researchers’ responsibilities to bring about the transformation with them. Creswell (2009), as a result, states that individuals within the study should contribute to designing the study. Participants should assist in formulating questions, assist throughout the collection of data to be analyzed, should contribute to effectively analyzing the data gathered, and should reap the benefits from the study (Creswell, 2009).

According to Scotland (2012), critical research can be conducted using various critical methodologies. For example, if a researcher sought to examine how political and social domination is expressed throughout texts and dialogue the researcher would benefit from conducting a critical discourse analysis methodology (Scotland, 2012). Canagarajah (1993), contributes to the dialogue of critical methodologies by adding that if a researcher is attempting to study culture and be ideologically sensitive to the participants and location, then the researcher would want to follow a critical ethnography methodology. In addition, if a researcher is attempting to bring about change through practice and wants to design a cyclical process that incorporates how to investigate a phenomenon, the actions to take, and a means of evaluation, then the researcher would reap the most from action research methodology. As a final example, Scotland (2012) introduces ideology critique. Ideology critique methodology assists researchers that seek to reveal the truth of individuals’ status within an established systems ideology that causes an imbalance of power between the various levels of status (Scotland, 2012).
According to scholars, critical methods incorporates the analysis of three elements; politics, culture, and history to gain an understanding of reality (Scotland, 2012). Researchers may incorporate focus groups, open-ended interviews, the analysis of peer-reviewed journals, open-ended questionnaires, and open-ended observations in their attempt to gain a full grasp of a phenomenon’s political, cultural, and historical reality (Scotland, 2012). Data collected through such means ordinarily produce qualitative data (Scotland, 2012). Parallel to interpretivism, Scotland (2012) states, that critical methods analysis attempts to analyze the data from a thematic interpretation stance, however it separates itself from interpretivism because explicit values are reached through the researchers’ interpretations. According to scholars, critical research is viewed as exemplary if the researcher(s) incorporates cultural context, historical context, political context, and advocates for the ability to generate dialogue between the individual(s) studied and the researcher(s) conducting the study (Scotland, 2012). Also, Cohen et al. (2007) makes clear that a critical researcher must develop a plan of action that will allow for the transformation of change and reform that will alter the participants’ lifestyle for the better. Such a process meets the catalytic validity requirement (Cohen et al., 2007; Lather, 1986; & Freire, 1973).

Critique of Critical Paradigm

According to Scotland (2012), what sets the critical paradigm apart from the other scientific and interpretive paradigm is that the critical paradigm believes knowledge is interwoven with political ideology; but like other paradigms the critical paradigm is flawed. Critical research struggles to be accepted by reigning administrations because by its very nature critical research seeks to create change of the status quo (Scotland, 2012).
According to Scotland (2012), the critical paradigm research, at times, is not embraced favorably by policy makers because critical researchers take a firm stance that the production of knowledge occurs along with the influence of politics. Furthermore, researchers advocate that it is difficult, borderline impossible, to establish an opportunity to discuss as equals amongst the individual(s) within the study and the researcher(s) (Scotland, 2012). For example, a prison warden, ultimately, has the final say in a new rehabilitation program, thusly participants, in this case inmates in need of rehabilitation, may not be consulted throughout the research design process. In this situation, inmates may potentially experience high levels of pressure to participate. Nolan and Putten (2007) reminds us that in a prison rehabilitation program study it would be difficult, if not impossible, for the inmates to object to the warden because the inmates are dependent of the warden for early release recommendations and access to resources within the prison. Therefore, Scotland (2012) stresses the issue that if individuals participating in the study attempt to satisfy the researcher(s) (Warden), the researcher(s) (Warden) run the risk of obtaining data that could potentially be inaccurate; therefore, the study’s findings lack credibility. Therefore, critical researchers must take into consideration any concerns related to partnership, coerciveness, permission, and independence (Scotland, 2012).

Furthermore, Scotland (2012) reminds us that although critical research seeks to free knowledge of any restrictions, ultimately it is not guaranteed. Any change, if at all, to the individuals studied could be insignificant or non-existent (Scotland, 2012). Therefore, how would one know if the action research made a significant difference? According to Scotland (2012), minimal evidence exists to suggest if a research study made any significant difference. In addition, scholars remind researchers that although
participants of a study are made critically aware of their current reality, change may not be a luxury that is possible in their situation (Scotland, 2012). On the other hand, without knowing the long-term outcome, it is possible that the individuals involved in the study may have changed their lives for the worst (Scotland, 2012). Another critique about the critical paradigm is that the participants within a study are grouped into two stereotypically fashions. Scotland (2012) states that first, individuals of critical research are generally categorized as being part of marginalized groups. As a result, Scotland (2012) argues that the individual identity of participants is lost.

Second, the critical paradigm fails to take into account the various degrees of conscientização that participants have when they enter the research project (Scotland, 2012). The critical paradigm guilelessly speculates that the masses unquestionably accept and contributes to the dominating forces, thereby participants contribute to their own oppression (Scotland, 2012). Burbules and Berk (1999) critique the critical paradigm by reminding scholars that a majority of the critical paradigm researchers constitute males; as a result, feminists are called upon to raise awareness to the fact that the feminists voice and needs are left out as marginalized groups (Scotland, 2012; Burbules & Berk, 1999). Ironically, scholars have noted that critical pedagogy can be called out for contributing to the maintenance of societies status-quo (Scotland, 2012).

**Paradigm Summary**

Before selecting an epistemological stance, researchers need to take into consideration what knowledge is for them, what are ways that knowledge can be discovered, and understand that the answers to these questions are all subjective (Yin, 2014; Scotland, 2012; Creswell, 2009; Sosa & McGrath, 2005). Hence, throughout the
literature the scientific paradigm has been applied to studies seeking to generalize, studies seeking to understand a phenomenon have used the interpretive paradigm, and research seeking to create change and liberate injustices have implanted the critical paradigm (Scotland, 2012). The benefit of each paradigm is that they have their own methods by which knowledge can be realized. As a result, researchers seeking to contribute to the body of knowledge must understand the assumptions that each philosophical lens embraces (Scotland, 2012). In addition, researchers should comprehend how the philosophical assumptions should be intertwined with methodology and methods to be able to know, challenge, and make applicable studies they executed (Scotland, 2012).

In this dissertation, my goal was to use the critical paradigm to focus on analyzing and providing an explanation for the phenomenon I sought to study. Through case study research and content analysis surrounding the December 16, 2014 Peshawar Army Public School massacre that lead to the implementation of Pakistan’s twenty-first (21) constitutional amendment, I sought to conduct an explanatory study. The study attempts to provide a holistic view of the situation in which Pakistani policy-makers faced and are facing when attempting to counter violent extremism within the Northwest region. With the assistance of the critical paradigm, it was my goal in this dissertation to understand the socially constructed reality the Pakistani people are experiencing with the Countering Violence Extremism twenty-first (21) constitutional amendment. In addition, by incorporating the critical paradigm into my dissertation, it was my goal to bridge and to fill a gap in the current body of scholarly research. I sought to fill that gap with the successful completion of this dissertation study.
Content Analysis

Weber (1990), introduces content analysis as one of various methodologies that can be used in research studies. Content analysis seeks to merge various procedures to generate valid implications from text (Weber, 1990, p. 9). These implications are about the speaker(s) that is/are sharing the message, about the message, or the community/group that the message(s) is/are intended to reach (Weber, 1990). As with all research studies, the process by which information is inferred will be interpreted differently based on the research and the use of her/his theoretical and substantive interests (Weber, 1990). According to Weber (1990), content analysis can be used by researchers for various studies, such as:

“(1), To disclose international differences in communication content, (2) compare media or ‘levels’ of communication, (3) audit communication content against objectives, (4) code open-ended questions in surveys, (5) identify the intentions and other characteristics of the communicator, (6) determine the psychological state of persons or groups, (7) detect the existence of propaganda, (8) describe attitudinal and behavioral responses to communications, (9) reflect cultural patterns of groups, institutions, or societies, (10) reveal the focus of individual, group, institutional, or societal attention, (11) describe trends in communication content” (Weber, 1990, p. 9).

According to scholars, an important, of various, uses of content analysis is the ability to produce clear cultural indicators that can help pin-point a group/community specific beliefs, specific values, numerous ideologies, and/or other forms of systems that incorporate culture (Melischek et al., 1984; Namenwirth, 1984; Namenwirth & Weber,
1984; Weber, 1984; Rosengren, 1981; Namenwirth, 1973, 1969; Namenwirth & Lasswell, 1970; Weber, 1981, 1982; Klingemann et al., 1982). For instance, through the analysis of political documents and other textual documents, a researcher may seek to reveal cultural indicators to grasp a better understanding of how a specific society/group studied, a specific institution, or other organizations comprised of individuals are different (Weber, 1989). Every approach intended to collect data and analyze the data through specific techniques vary and have their unique traits; content analysis, too, is different. Weber (1989), states that social interaction is brought about through various elements, hence, communication is a vital element. Therefore, the analysis of content demands that any form of text or transcripts of human communications be studied (Weber, 1989). In addition, depending on the specific research project, content analysis can implement both qualitative and quantitative methods to analyze texts (Weber, 1989). Therefore, as a methodology content analysis could potentially bridge two modes of analysis that are often viewed as antithetical (Weber, 1989).

Weber (1982; 1981) and Namenwirth (1973) advocate that because documents, or other various types of sources, can survive extended periods of time, the ability to map culture indicators is possible. Culture indicators can be mapped in various ways and for various time lapses from a plethora of documents, therefore constituting reliable data sources (Weber, 1989). In partnership with quantitative methods, these reliable data sources can be merged together to understand the relationship between culture indicators and “economic, social, political, and cultural change” (Weber, 1989, p. 10).
Content Analysis Process

According to scholars, human intelligence is complex and by its very nature can be very selective (Gillham, 2000). Gillham (2000) advocates that the reason we are selective, by nature, is because if we do not select from things within our surrounding we will quickly be consumed and stunned by them. Therefore, an argument can be made that as human beings, having an “open mind” can be impossible (Gillham, 2000). Within the context of a case study project, researchers should be aware of this concern because the researcher (human) becomes the research tool (Gillham, 2000). According to Gillham (2000), case study researchers can overcome these lapses of closed-mindedness (our individual prejudices) throughout the research process; more specifically our predeterminations and outlooks. Gillham (2000, p. 27) reminds researchers that prejudices can be boiled down into two categories; (1) knowledge we lack and (2) knowledge we turn a blind eye to and refuse to educate ourselves about. External to a researchers’ project, prejudices are common, and a majority of those prejudices have little value or impact. For example, if an individual decides not to try snake meat we would not find the behavior to be a moral crime.

However, within the context of a research study, scholars raise awareness to the belief that some researchers naturally design and conduct a study with prejudices (Gillham, 2000). It is the responsibility of the researchers to ponder, what do they expect to find throughout the study? (Gillham, 2000). In addition, prior to conducting some research study, researchers may find themselves pondering, in regard to a researchable phenomenon, what are my personal beliefs that construct the phenomenon issue (Gillham, 2000)? These specific questions are prejudices within a research study. Like
prejudice assumptions, they could potentially be right or potentially wrong, but the fact is that these prejudices have limited validity because they are educated guesses without supporting evidence (Gillham, 2000). It is not uncommon, according to some scholars, for researchers to take their *prejudices* one step further and fall victim to their individualistic *preferences* (Gillham, 2000). Some researchers not only take into consideration the various elements they *expect* to find, but they also consider things they *want* to find after the study (Gillham, 2000). However, Gillham (2000, p. 28) shares, “researchers of integrity are constantly challenging and scrutinizing themselves.” In the following sections, I attempted to explain numerous ways in which I navigated about my study to ensure I avoided *prejudices* and researching my own *preferences*.

For my dissertation, I sought to implement Gillham’s (2000) recommendations to avoid prejudices. It was my goal to continuously challenge any prejudices that may arise before and during the research project. In an attempt to be as transparent as possible, I sought to challenge the existing literature revolving countering violent extremism within the Northwest region of Pakistan. According to those scholars, reconstructing the educational system of Pakistan will eliminate violent extremism. However, I believe that the education system is one element of various concerns revolving countering violent extremism within the Northwest region of Pakistan. To make the claim that the educational system is the means by which violent extremism will be countered may be interpreted to imply that everyone within Pakistan seeks to obtain an education. Therefore, it was my goal to explain various alternative avenues by which violent extremism can be countered within the Northwest region of Pakistan. In addition, my
goal was to understand how the policy makers of Pakistan have helped counter violent extremism after implementing their twenty-first constitutional amendment, if at all.

**Issues of Content Analysis**

A key critique of content analysis was provided by Weber (1989), he made clear that through its very nature content analysis takes large amounts of words and funnels them into smaller content groupings. These content groupings may range, depending on the researcher(s), among one word, several words, or numerous words groupings (Weber, 1989). Yet, these word groupings, phrase groupings, or other means of text grouping within the same grouping are supposed to have similar meanings so that the validity of the data is not lost (Weber, 1989). According to Weber (1989), the accuracy of the study has the potential of being unreliable/credible because the researcher could run the risk of grouping the information in a way that misrepresents the validity of the content analyzed. For example, a content analysis researcher may group words/phrases based on synonyms for precision meaning or could group words/phrases based on connotation similarities (Weber, 1989).

In an attempt to provide a solution to this limitation of content analysis, Weber (1989) stressed that it is the responsibility of the researcher to be as strict and transparent as possible throughout the collection and analysis process. In addition, Weber (1989) stated that the approach selected should be as dependable and consistent as possible. In addition, Weber (1989) reminds researchers that because there is no right way to do content analysis the researcher should focus on finding reliable and effective procedures to follow. Once a researcher has found a method she/he seeks to implement, she/he
should clearly reveal the strategy, so in the event a study is questioned anyone can replicate the study (Weber, 1989).

**Culture Awareness**

To begin the research study, I sought to place significant emphasis at the beginning of this dissertation on researching Pakistani Taliban culture, Pakistani government social groups, as well as Peshawar tribal leaders and their culture. According to scholars, researchers must remember that every location has its own culture; the agreements by which groups/societies function (Gillham, 2000). In addition, cultures have specific values and social norms that should not be overlooked or generalized by researchers (Gillham, 2000). These values and norms are ways in which a group/society judge, reason, and converse about their communal experience (Gillham, 2000).

**Finding Discrepancies in Data**

According to Gillham (2000), as researchers go deep within their literature review these researchers, organically, begin to develop interim descriptions about a phenomenon. As a result, Gillham (2000) recommends that researchers should review the literature with a specific question in mind; based on all the data I have found, can I find data that does not agree with the “theories” I am attempting to produce? Gillham (2000), reminds researchers that one of the basic concerns of research integrity is the ability to locate and consider negative data. For instance, literature that debunks or is contradictory, evidence that contributes or complicates a researchers’ comprehension of a phenomenon. Gillham (2000) reminds us that it is not uncommon for researchers, throughout the data collection process, to experience and become a victim of tunnel vision.
To ensure I adhered to research integrity, my goal will be to set reminders/update notifications through Nova Southeastern University library databases to alert me of new articles added to the database that revolved around my topic. I sought to set time aside and skim the article to first ensure the article fit my study. If the article indeed fell within the boundaries of my study I assured to read the article in full and add the contributions to the study. If the article did not fall within the boundaries of my study I did not add it to my dissertation. If the article provided a differing perspective it was my goal to understand where the goal originated from, who wrote it, from whose perspective the article was written, and for whom the article was written. Once I had evaluated the article effectively, I sought to include a critique of the article within my dissertation.

**Triangulation**

According to Gillham (2000), triangulation is a technique by which a researcher brings together varying sources to support a specific finding. If all the sources converge and support your findings, then triangulation has been confirmed (Gillham, 2000). If a researcher can confirm what an individual has stated, links actions to support what they did, and find records of these behaviors than a researcher has revealed a straightforward picture (Gillham, 2000). However, the straightforward approach rarely happens throughout a research study (Gillham, 2000). It is worth mentioning that only because a straightforward approach does not support a researchers’ findings that the triangulation technique failed, it simply means that the researchers postulated connections with the triangulation point may have two issues; (1) either a relationship does not exist and/or (2) the researcher implemented a technique that misunderstood the data and another technique may be better. Therefore, Gillham (2000, p. 30) introduces two concepts to
assist researchers with the triangulation technique; (1) *Time-series* analysis and (2) *pattern* analysis.

Since the focus of my dissertation takes an explanatory stance, I sought to implement a time-series analysis. More specifically, I sought to conduct a chronological time-series analysis commonly used within case study research. It was my goal to compare the progression of events (chronologically) through the various theoretical lenses I implemented in my study. Time-series analysis assisted me in identifying key markers that were traced over time to show a relationship between occurrences.

**Representativeness of Data**

Unlike triangulation, *representativeness* varies in its approach and advantages. According to Gillham (2000), researchers should take into consideration where they are obtaining sources from and from whom they are getting information. In addition, it is the responsibility of the researcher to critically think and analyze why certain individuals or interest groups want to assist them throughout the data collection process (Gillham, 2000). That is not to say that researchers should reject the opportunity to obtain valuable information; Gillham (2000) is simply reminding researchers that they should obtain information from all perspectives to gain a better understanding of a situation instead of focusing on just one perspective. According to some scholars, accessibility is critical (Gillham, 2000). Throughout the data collection process researchers will find that certain information and the perspective of specific individuals are more readily accessible to them than others (Gillham, 2000). As a result, some scholars depend heavily on those contributions throughout their study and their findings show the discrepancy (Gillham, 2000).
Gillham (2000) reveals that this is one weakness that the discipline of journalism experiences; some journalist dumpster dive and quickly release any information that is quickly accessible to them at the moment; hence, through the data collection process the sources collected from media outlets should be handled cautiously. However, such an approach, according to Gillham (2000), fails to provide a holistic representation or perspective of the phenomenon. Gillham (2000, p. 31) states, “whatever the kind of evidence (documents and records, what people say, what they do, the physical or social context they inhibit) an adequate picture involves a lot of digging away.” As a result, Gillham (2000) stresses the importance of researchers being alert and cautious at all times to ensure that as information is found the significance of the information is not overlooked or misguided.

Since it was my goal in this dissertation to provide a holistic representation (Gillham, 2000), I sought to critically analyze the origin of the data collected throughout the data collection process. The data was sorted accordingly and was critiqued throughout the limitations sections of my dissertation to ensure I was transparent with my readers.

**Constant Reflection**

According to Gillham (2000), constant reflections should be conducted simultaneous with representativeness, but also demands that researchers acknowledge how they are achieving their knowledge. According to Gillham (2000, p. 31) that can be done in two fashions; (1) *tacit* or (2) *explicit*. Gillham (2000) reveals that knowledge can be classified as explicit because the researcher can clearly explain why and how the researcher(s) obtained their knowledge. For example, a researcher can provide a direct source of evidence for her/his claim(s). On the other hand, tacit knowledge (referred to as
intuition) is when a researcher claims the knowledge she/he obtained was through how they felt or sensed about an issue (Gillham, 2000); commonly referred to as “gut feelings.” It is not uncommon for these feelings to be strong, but regardless of their significance, tacit knowledge is hard to describe or rationalize to audiences (Gillham, 2000). According to Gillham (2000), tacit knowledge should not be flat out accepted and rejected. Within case study research, Gillham (2000, p. 32) states that any type of knowledge should not be disregarded because “everything is weighted and sifted and checked or corroborated.”

The goal of this dissertation was to focus on explicit knowledge. However, in the event that I experience tacit knowledge I attempted to provide a clear rationale in my dissertation to explain any changes in direction of the study. Ultimately, I sought to be transparent with any moments of tacit knowledge and explain to my readers what led to the tacit moment.

Peer Consultation

Gillham (2000) reveals that researchers should have a support group that includes various strengths to assist the researcher at different phases of the study. Researchers should consult experts that have conducted or are conducting similar research studies, other individuals that are also in the dissertation phase, as well as various experts that are strong in various research methods (Gillham, 2000). By taking into consideration each of these aspects, Gillham (2000) believes researchers can minimize any potential research errors. In addition, obtaining constructive criticism from peers will help provide the researcher with varying perspectives (Gillham, 2000).
In addition, Gillham (2000) acknowledges that it may be difficult to communicate with experts of specific research topics, however that should not deter researchers from attempting to contact them. The knowledge gained from these experts is valuable and can prove to be uniquely rewarding (Gillham, 2000). By communicating with subject matter experts, researchers could potentially receive detailed guidance and recommendations on different methods for researching their specific phenomenon that does not commonly receive recognition from other scholars or are publicly published (Gillham, 2000). Furthermore, Gillham (2000) reminds researchers that committee members are likely to be an immense source of information about the broad area of research that is getting studied; even if they are not subject matter experts they can still provide more information than a novice researcher beginning the literature review process (Gillham, 2000). According to Gillham (2000), more important than having information regarding the topic the researcher is attempting to study, researchers should keep in mind that committee members are experts on the style of research that the researcher is attempting to conduct. Hence, reaching out to these members will help the novice researcher more effectively navigate potential obstacles (Gillham, 2000).

Theory-Construction and Negative Evidence

Scholars would agree that all theories are flawed and cannot be proven; they can simply be supported (Gillham, 2000). As a result, Gillham (2000) reminds researchers that theories should not be a researcher’s primary concern, instead Gillham suggest that evidence should be primary for all kinds of studies. According to Gillham (2000), in a broad sense research can be categorized within two categories, regardless of their discipline. In the first research category, Gillham (2000) defines this category as good
research and such type of research seeks to challenge the researchers’ expectations, embracing any piece of data that contradicts and pushes the research out of their comfort zone of understanding. The second category of research, Gillham (2000) explains is the alternative of good research, but not necessarily bad research. Gillham (2000) defines these studies as confirmatory research, studies that seek to reinforce our current state of beliefs and understanding of phenomenon’s. According to Gillham (2000), the issue with confirmatory research is that challenging evidence to the beliefs of the researcher may be removed from analysis because it does not fit the study’s goals.

Gillham (2000) informs readers that within naturalistic case study projects the development of theories emerges from the study. The theorizing occurs after, because researchers cannot develop a theory without some type of evidence, either rich evidence or minimal evidence (Gillham, 2000). Gillham (2000) informs researchers that their literature review searches will, in the beginning, be determined by their wide beliefs of the phenomenon they are studying. However, increasingly the data collection process is mediated by researchers revised theories and descriptions (Gillham, 2000). Therefore, Gillham (2000) speculates that because of the negative or challenging data that researchers find causes the revisions to occur.

Data Collection

Introduction

Brewer and Hunter (2006) claim researchers should not limit themselves to one style of data collection. Instead, data collection should be collected by both the study’s theories or method(s) (Brewer & Hunter, 2006). The benefit of theories is that the information generated is guided by the theory itself and assist in defining the event
studied; as well as, any speculations of interest for the study (Brewer & Hunter, 2006). On the other hand, methods clearly outline and dictate the style that the data gathered should be conducted (Brewer & Hunter, 2006). To effectively implement theories for data collection purposes researchers must ponder the real-world within the context of multiple hypothetical assumptions and in universal fashions (Brewer & Hunter, 2006). To effectively collect data, researchers must first understand what the researchers are attempting to collect and why.

Researchers need to ask themselves, where is the information I need and what, specifically, am I looking for (Brewer & Hunter, 2006). Through this thought process researchers can define their “actual social unites about which data will be collected and a strategy for sampling from the universe, or population, composed of all such units” (Brewer & Hunter, 2006, p. 79). It is through the process of answering these questions and defining these units that I attempted to be able to decide the objects that were theoretically relevant to my research purpose and problem, and decided sampling approach (Brewer & Hunter, 2006).

**Written Material**

According to Gillham (2000), throughout the data collection process researchers will come across two types of written documents for analysis. The first type of written documents is *published* documents from peer-reviewed sources about previous projects conducted from other scholars (Gillham, 2000). *Published* documents may range from official governmental documents to university quarterly reports; such as statistical reports of student enrollment, girls-to-boys’ ratios, or degree enrollment statistics (Gillham, 2000). The second type of written documents are classified by Gillham (2000) as
unpublished evidence. Unpublished information and records are personal logs, journals, or information that documents an individual’s personal experiences; such as an individual’s weekly budget and spending categories (Gillham, 2000).

Published Literature

Following Gillham (2000) recommendations, I intend to and will continue to use two styles of processes to sort through the published literature. It is my goal to collect and analyze literature that assists me in gaining a deeper understanding of the overall body of literature pertaining to Countering Violent Extremism and getting to know my case; the Northwest region of Peshawar Pakistan (Gillham, 2000). Both of these activities will occur simultaneously so that, per Gillham (2000) recommendations, the knowledge obtained and the information used throughout the study interact. The goal, according to Gillham (2000), is to ensure that the data collected complement one another and strengthen the validity and credibility of my study. According to Gillham (2000), researchers fail to take into consideration that they do not know what they are looking for throughout the literature until they dig deep within the real context. In addition, the findings of the literature review, often times, shifts researchers’ perceptions of the phenomenon (Gillham, 2000).

Electronic Database Searches

Any scholar that has conducted literature review searches within databases for research purposes would agree that the process requires meticulous skills (Gillham, 2000). Many would find it difficult to distinguish database searching between an art and a science (Gillham, 2000). For the purpose of this dissertation, it is my goal to use Nova Southeastern University’s numerous online databases, the Miami Dade County Public
Library online databases, Google Scholar, Miami Dade College online databases, and Google. To ensure my database searches were effective I made sure to enroll in and complete training sessions with Nova Southeastern University librarian specialists on “how-to” tutorials for database searches. In addition, to ensure I was updated on any database changes I intended to communicate with librarian reference desk specialists at each of the various institutions.

In addition, following the recommendations provided by Gillham (2000), I sought to conduct cross-disciplinary database searches for content. To increase the credibility, validity, and trustworthiness of the data I analyzed I sought to collect information from various databases that are housed in various disciplines and sub-disciplines of knowledge (Gillham, 2000). To improve the effectiveness of my searches I planned to cross-reference key words from significant scholars within the area of Countering Violent Extremism and Pakistan. If I found articles or textbooks that were not available within the previously mentioned institutions, I made sure to use Nova Southeastern University’s inter-library loan resource to obtain a copy for my research.

**Manual Databases**

Since a majority of researchers agree that no such database exists that fully houses every source of document, I sought to follow Gillham’s (2000) recommendation of also manually reviewing printed databases. The purpose for searching these databases was because all sources may potentially provide information that would contribute to this dissertation (Gillham, 2000). To increase the effectiveness of searches I sought to follow Gillham’s (2000) suggestions of browsing content lists in search of recent journals relating to my topic and evaluating its references. By reviewing the references, Gillham
(2000) suggests, I would be able to expand my content pool and quickly screen information. Furthermore, Gillham (2000) suggests reviewing textbooks bibliographies that cover my dissertation topic. The bibliographies within the textbooks effectively allowed me to review present and past content relating to my topic (Gillham, 2000).

**Analyzing & Organizing the Literature**

Sorting through the data followed specific guidelines. Each article, found through various sources, would be read and I would *highlight* vital points and sections (Gillham, 2000). Highlighted parts were vital pieces of information that related to my study. Following the highlighting process, I sought to review the articles for references that would link me to other documents (Gillham, 2000). Based on the references found, I sought to highlight the references in another color and attempted to retrieve the document for analysis (Gillham, 2000). According to Gillham (2000, p. 41), “to a considerable degree the published literature is interlinked so that, to use another metaphor, when you pick up on thread, others are joined to it.” I sought to continue this process for all the documents and sort the information into separate piles to organize the information; referred to as *sorting* (Gillham, 2000).

**Unpublished Literature**

According to Gillham (2000), numerous institutions hold information/documents that are not peer-reviewed published documents; nor made available to the public. Depending on the institution, certain information may be readily available by the nature of the organization (Gillham, 2000). For instance, non-profit organizations brochures. Smaller institutions, for instance schools, will have pamphlets for potential students and parents about their institution; essentially documents that are produced by their public
relations group (Gillham, 2000). Although some scholars may advocate that such information is bias and a misrepresentation of these institutions to make themselves look good, within a case study research, they constitute evidence and should be taken into consideration (Gillham, 2000). Hence, Gillham (2000) stressed the importance of distinguishing between documents and records. According to Gillham (2000, p. 42) documents are “policy statements, minutes of meetings, reports of one kind or another.” Records are “often computer stored – detailing absence rates, turnover, changes in numbers (employed or on roll), accidents, and so on.”

**Locating Documents**

Gillham (2000) makes clear that all organizations have their unique style of storing documents and record keeping. As a result, learning how to get a hold of these documents are not easily known and may be more complex depending on the institutions (Gillham, 2000). As a result, it was my intention to use Gillham’s (2000) suggestion of communicating to help obtain these documents. By communicating my research goals and the purpose for wanting specific documents, the gatekeeper(s) had a better chance of guiding me down the right path of obtaining the information (Gillham, 2000). The purpose of communicating with individuals within organizations was not to make those individuals part of the study; these individuals served the same purpose that Nova Southeastern University librarian specialist ultimately served, which was to point me in the right direction and explain how to obtain more information. The individuals were not interviewed to collect personal experiences which were used to produce knowledge within this dissertation.
Observations

According to Gillham (2000), observations can be divided into two subcategories. First, is referred to by Gillham (2000) as participant observations. The second, Gillham (2000) classifies as detached/structured observations. Although two categories exist, Gillham (2000) shares that both approaches to observations have three core traits; (1) the process of watching the actions/behaviors of people, (2) actively listening to what the people are saying, and (3) when necessary engaging the people in dialogue to help clarify any confusions. According to Gillham (2000), participant observations are mostly referred to as descriptive because the researcher must be directly involved. Within detached/structured observations the researcher is removed from the phenomenon watching what is going on and taking notes of the observations (Gillham, 2000); not directly engaging or influencing participants.

Observations vary from other sources because they are not what someone wrote, or what someone said, they are about what someone actually did (Gillham, 2000). A significant concern of observations is that it can be a time-consuming process (Gillham, 2000); and the information produced from the observation may not contribute to the study. In addition, Gillham (2000) attempts to inform researchers that data collected from observations may be difficult to organize and analyze, a challenge to write-up and show its significance, and requires researchers to be persistent and patient in attempting to effectively make the data work for the research.

Observations can be used for multiple purposes. According to Gillham (2000) observations can be used for exploratory purposes within a case study. Also, observations can be used as the starting step before implementing other techniques for data collection
(Gillham, 2000). In addition, observations can assume a *supplementary* role to provide the study with an illustrative dimension (Gillham, 2000). Furthermore, observations may be used as part of a more complex *multi-method* strategy in research (Gillham, 2000). Finally, Gillham (2000) believes observations have the potential to be used as the *main* tactic within explanatory descriptive studies.

**Physical Artefacts**

Gillham (2000) defines “physical artefacts” as a general term for whatever has been *made* and believes that within case study research physical artefacts may be the most important source of evidence. As with all forms of sources, researchers must take into consideration the potential value of any item/source that can influence the outcome of the study (Gillham, 2000). But it is important to make the claim that illustrations included in journal articles are not physical artefacts (Gillham, 2000). Physical artefacts are physical objects, not tally charts or pie charts or hierarchical models (Gillham, 2000). Scholars reminds researchers, mainly novice researchers, the value and benefit that a good quality photograph can have on dissertations (Gillham, 2000); or research in general.

Hence, scholars agree that not all data can be accurately told or measured, however a picture can surely *show* a lot (Gillham, 2000). For instance, for generations’ genocide researchers have studied, written about, described, explained, and have shown statistical representations of the number of deaths that occurred in numerous concentration camps. Thus, the audience is responsible for constructing those images within their minds and may not grasp fully the severity of the situation. However, by
incorporating pictures of bodies piled on top of one another, lifeless, may generate a different reaction (emotion) from the reader (Gillham, 2000).

Therefore, Gillham (2000) asks researchers to ask themselves, what are methods I can implement to give my ‘readers’ the experience of being there? Within research, the visual dimension can play a significant role in a researcher’s study (Gillham, 2000). According to Gillham (2000), researchers should take into consideration the various ways of designing and incorporating physical artefacts into a study. One approach is to follow the guidelines of previous researchers and adhere to the process originally designed (Gillham, 2000). Another approach a researcher can take is to embrace their own creativity and design a system that works for them (Gillham, 2000).

**Secondary Analysis Data**

Kiecolt and Nathan (2011) both claim that, by tradition, it has been the responsibility of social scientists to gather their own data for their research study, regardless of the approach taken to obtain the information. However, depending on the topic that a research is attempting to study, independent data collection may not be an option or feasibly possible (Kiecolt & Nathan, 2011). Unless a researcher has achieved a fully-funded grant to research a phenomenon, economic concerns may be an obstacle to data collection (Kiecolt & Nathan, 2011). In addition, depending on the region and specific situation studied, reaching a specific location for the purpose of reaching specific people may be out of the question for security reasons. For instance, attempting to get lived experiences of suicide bombers may not be possible because to record the suicide bomber experience would require the individual to follow through with the full act of conducting the suicide bombing; it would be impossible to speak to the bomber after the
bomb explodes. Aside from research topics, the process of collecting independent data is itself a tremendous task (Kiecolt & Nathan, 2011). It is also important for the researcher to keep in mind that fresh new data cannot be obtained from periods of time that have passed, therefore researchers of change are bounded to data that already exists (Kiecolt & Nathan, 2011). As a result, researchers resort to secondary analysis of existing data.

Secondary analysis is not restricted to formal analytical procedures or statistical approaches (Kiecolt & Nathan, 2011). Instead, secondary analysis is the process by which a researcher scavenges for and analyzes data that has already been collected by other scholars (Kiecolt & Nathan, 2011). Kiecolt and Nathan (2011) claim that primary data collection requires that researchers put in much of their effort in both the collection and analysis phases of data, however, in secondary analysis researchers are focused on being able to creatively apply various techniques to data, that were previously collected, to answer their specific research topics/questions. According to Kiecolt and Nathan (2011), documents have traditionally been found within historical research and fall within the category of secondary analysis. Through secondary analysis researchers have the ability to gain access to these datasets and implement those surveys into their studies; a task that was not always feasible to researchers unable to travel or interact with community members (Kiecolt & Nathan, 2011).

Another advantage to secondary analysis is the minimization of any data collection errors or concerns by the researcher (Kiecolt & Nathan, 2011). A plethora of research databases exist where a researcher, like myself, can obtain significant amount and machine-readable data regarding various topics, various time periods in history, and a numerous amount of geographical locations (Kiecolt & Nathan, 2011). As with all aspects
of designing a research project, every technique has its strengths and weaknesses; but the strengths of secondary analysis are significantly greater than the weaknesses (Kiecolt & Nathan, 2011). Kiecolt and Nathan (2011) claim that the concerns of secondary analysis is not directly towards the approach, it is more in regard to the data obtained. First, researchers must ask themselves if data exists about their specific topic; Kiecolt and Nathan (2011) claim that a problem some researchers will find is the lack of sufficient/significant data available to them for secondary analysis. Another problem researchers experience is the misinterpretation of what secondary data means, and therefore they use primary data instead of secondary data (Kiecolt & Nathan, 2011). Another concern researchers may experience with secondary analysis is the inability to use macro level data for micro level studies (Kiecolt & Nathan, 2011). As a solution, researchers can sample surveys for various information on the specific subpopulation (Kiecolt & Nathan, 2011). Furthermore, no research study is ever perfect and accurate (Kiecolt & Nathan, 2011), therefore the data used for secondary analysis may be flawed. Kiecolt & Nathan (2011) claim that even the most glorified and credible surveys run the risk of having issues with how they were measured by the researchers.

**Databases to Search**

With the abundance of scholarly databases, it is not uncommon or unheard of for novice researchers to be quickly overwhelmed and intimidated when conducting a literature review. How would a researcher know where to begin, how wide of a search should be conducted, how small of a search should be conducted? Unfortunately, no set guidelines exist to determine such actions. However, conventional wisdom dictates that once a researcher has reached a point of saturation, it is fair to know that she/he has
casted a wide enough search to become well informed to begin analyzing the information. As a result, below are a list of databases I sought to browse for literature revolving countering violent extremism within Peshawar Pakistan. The list of databases below are not ranked on level of importance or recognition from scholarly contribution. The databases below were selected because of the literature review conducted in this dissertation and proved to be databases with information revolving countering violent extremism within Peshawar Pakistan.

Open Access (PQDT Open), ProQuest Military Collection, ProQuest Newsstand, and Religion (Oxford Scholarship Online).

The purpose of searching multiple databases throughout the data collection process was to improve the credibility and validity of the information gathered. Once the articles that were relevant to my topic were collected I sought to sort and narrow down information that was relevant and of significance to my study. It was my goal not to use information from every database, but it was my intention to browse these databases to help me in not being bias to one specific discipline or database. In addition, it was my goal to obtain recommendations from experts in the field and my committee members.

**Sampling Strategies and Inclusion Criteria**

Daniel (2012, p. 2) makes clear that good research projects involve “preparation, preparation, and preparation.” Thus, in order for a researcher to ensure she/he has chosen the appropriate choice for sampling, she/he needs to draw their focus on effectively meeting the preparation demands (Daniel, 2012). Effectively designing and conducting sampling procedures not only strengthens the validity of the research, it can also help minimize cost for the researcher, minimize lost time searching for data for researchers, and minimize the amount of effort required of the researcher (Daniel, 2012). In addition, sampling increases the study’s validity, reliability, and generalizability of the outcome (Daniel, 2012). Unfortunately, not all researchers take the proper precautions, therefore the outcome is the production of a flawed and ineffective research study (Daniel 2012).

Unlike quantitative studies where researchers can benefit from the rigidity of the procedures required to collect and analyze data, qualitative studies lack the rigidity (Coyne, 1996). Morse (1991) claims that the lack of proper guidelines to help researchers
navigate the sampling process has led to much confusion within the literature of qualitative sampling and qualitative research. Kitson et al. (1982), claims that qualitative researchers have been critiqued for their failure to describe their method of sampling, thereby leaving their readers unable to comprehend the study and replicate the study. Numerous other scholars have claimed that qualitative researchers limited expertise in their ability to combine qualitative methods to meet their study’s expectations has caused them to inappropriately describe their assumptions and logic (Stern, 1994; Baker, et al., 1992; & Knaf & Howard, 1984). Concerns from various scholars have drawn attention to qualitative studies that have inappropriately reported multi-methods studies and the ‘slurring’ of theoretical point of views (Stern, 1994; Becker, 1993; Baker et al., 1992).

According to Schatzman and Strauss (1973, p. 39), sampling is “shaped by the time the researcher has available to him, by his framework, by his starting and developing interest, and by any restrictions placed upon his observations by his host.” Schatzman and Strauss (1973) claim that the more knowledge the researcher obtains about her/his research goals, the better informed the researcher will be to select the most appropriate form of sampling to implement into her or his study. In addition, they claim that the sampling of individuals, locations, occurrences, and groups will also be based on the literature review and their research aim(s). Coyne (1997) makes the claim that age, gender, status, role(s), or function(s) sorts, as well as all philosophical and ideological claims could potentially aid a researcher at the start of a research project and play the role of guides to the study. Patton (1990) stressed the importance of relying on purposeful and selective sampling. Rich data generated from purposeful sampling allows researchers to
become more informed on their topic(s) (Patton, 1990). Coyne (1997, p. 627) provides researchers with a detailed table that outlines various qualitative sampling methods:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Sampling Method Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Strauss & Corbin (1990) | Theoretical sampling — three stages  
  - open sampling  
  - relational and variational sampling  
  - discriminate sampling |
| Patton (1990)       | All sampling is purposeful — 15 strategies  
  - extreme or deviant case sampling  
  - intensity sampling  
  - maximum variation sampling  
  - homogeneous samples  
  - typical case sampling  
  - stratified purposeful sampling  
  - critical case sampling  
  - snowball or chain sampling  
  - criterion sampling  
  - theory-based or operational construct sampling  
  - confirming and disconfirming cases  
  - opportunistic sampling  
  - purposeful random sampling  
  - sampling politically important cases  
  - convenience sampling |
| Morse (1991)       | Four types:  
  - purposeful sample  
  - nominated sample  
  - volunteer sample  
  - total population sample |
| Sandelowski et al. (1992) | Selective sampling  
  - theoretical sampling |
| Sandelowski (1995) | All sampling is purposeful — three kinds  
  - maximum variation  
  - phenomenal variation  
  - theoretical variation |

*Figure 3. Various examples of qualitative sampling*

For the purpose of my dissertation, I sought to begin with *open sampling* as my sampling procedure (Morse, 2011). Open sampling is the process by which the researcher intentionally gathers “as much variations as possible within the limits of the topic” (Morse, 2011, p. 3). As I gained more knowledge of Countering Violent Extremism within Peshawar Pakistan, and I began to sort the sampling data I reflected on making
any alterations to my theoretical sampling to assist in narrowing down key issues in my study (Morse, 2011). Hence, I sought to continue sampling until the theoretical sampling was rich, sufficient, and I had reached a point where information began to be repetitive (saturated) (Morse, 2011). Due to the nature of the study, randomization sampling was inappropriate because not everyone within Peshawar Pakistan would be potential participants that fit my research study. In addition, as Morse (2011) has mentioned, not all of the individuals that have shared similar lived experiences are worth including in my study for the purpose of my dissertation.

Morse and Richards (2002) claim that qualitative researchers have the freedom to halt the sampling process whenever she/he gets bored with the process. However, Morse (2011) claims that qualitative sampling should only end after the researcher has reached saturation and the researcher is unable to obtain new data and/or the researcher no longer hears any challenging information worth evaluating. In addition, for Morse (2011) data saturation can be easily reached and better managed if the researcher effectively narrows down the research focus; thereby, eliminating the need to cast such a large net intended to generate as much data as possible. To aid me in reaching the saturation point, I sought to use Morse’s (2011) two step approach; (1) appropriateness and (2) adequacy.

According to Morse (2011), adequacy is the process by which the researcher has found enough data to conduct her/his study. To reach the adequacy point, researchers should not simply stop after obtaining a piece of data from one source, instead the researcher should cross-reference the data collected and verify the information from multiple individuals or sources (Morse, 2011). Morse (2011) claims that sources can vary in type, for instance, they may be printed or unprinted documents, participatory or non-
participatory observations, and other methods; the point is to have multiple points of view verifying/supporting the original data found. Morse (2011), in addition, believes that adequate data provides a strong foundation for the construction of new notions and theories. Following adequacy, I sought to follow Morse’s (2011) guideline of appropriateness. Appropriateness is the process by which the researcher intentionally finds and gathers data that relates to the research study (Morse, 2011). Morse (2011) claims that within qualitative studies appropriate sampling is a continuous process within a study and only ends when saturation has been reached.

**Processes for Data Analysis**

No research proposal is complete without a researcher explaining the method by which she/he will analyze the data gathered. Therefore, within this section it was my intention to explain my specific choice of data analysis and the process by which I conducted the analysis. Clearly stated, it was my goal to conduct a critical historical analysis throughout my dissertation. Smith, Ayanian, Covinsky, Landon, McCarthy, Wee, & Steinman (2011) and Smith (2008) claim that humans are continually evolving (for better or worse) and we are all impacted and influenced (for better or worse) by history. Smith et al. (2011) and Smith (2008) claim that the terminology of history can be broken down into two subcategories; (1) the stages by which change occurs through time and (2) the analysis that can be conducted to fully grasp the complexity of how the change occurred. Smith et al. (2011) and Smith (2008) claim that scholars must understand the relationship and interconnections of “historical occurrences, historical evidence and historical analysis, and two feedback loops.”
To begin, Smith et al. (2011) and Smith (2008) state historical occurrences serve a dual purpose depending on the researcher’s goals within her/his study. A researcher may want to study the relationship or structure change, also known as a *specific instance* (Smith et al., 2011; Smith, 2008). For instance, change within a specific terrorist network as a member transitions into leadership roles. Another study may want to study the change that occurred within the relationship or structure, known as *particular kind* (Smith et al., 2011; Smith, 2008). For instance, change within the network of terrorists as women gain a more influential role and the balance of power diminishes for the opposite gender.

The second dimension of history is referred to as historical evidence (Smith et al., 2011; Smith, 2008). According to Smith et al. (2011) and Smith (2008):

> “Historical evidence may be written down, for example in the form of letters, diaries, memoranda, reports, lists, guidebooks, advertising material and press reportage. It may be visual, including film, video and surviving art, arte-facts and architecture. It may also be oral, in the form of folksongs, an oral tradition, or interviews recorded either by a historian or someone else (p. 3)”

Regardless of the fashion in which the researcher gathers the evidence, Smith et al. (2011) and Smith (2008) claim the researcher(s) must take into consideration, clearly, the circumstances in which the evidence came about. For instance, were the documents being reviewed for analysis written by a torture survivor as confession, or are the documents memoirs written voluntarily by survivors to record their experience? Smith et al. (2011) and Smith (2008, p. 4) claim:

> “it is important to know who produced the material being treated as evidence, where they were located within the society concerned, who was their intended
audience (e.g., friends, superiors within an organization, potential political
supporters, posterity) and what their intentions were in producing the material.”

The third element of historical evidence needs to be broken down into two
analytic categories before a researcher can understand how it is used within a research
study (Smith et al., 2011; Smith, 2008). The first analytical category consists of
understanding the contextual logic that connects multiple events because they influenced
one another within a specific time period (Smith et al., 2011; Smith, 2008). Such a
process would require the researcher to take into consideration both the perception of the
actor and the objective challenges or obstacles that needed to be overcome in their lives
(Smith et al., 2011; Smith, 2008). The second complex analytical task is the duty to find
evidence that indicates any real “social mechanisms that operate in more than one
historical context (e.g., the putative tendency for oligopolies or monopolies to emerge
within markets)” (Smith et al. 2011; Smith, 2008, p. 4). Smith et al. (2011) and Smith
(2008) claim that such a task is even more difficult when the research attempts to find
empirical generalizations that shine a light on social structures and social processes
exhibiting similar behavior. Smith et al. (2011) and Smith (2008) synthesize the two
analytical approaches as, (1) uncovering what took place at a specific period of time and
location, and (2) reveal the outcome potential whenever those conditions repeat
themselves.

Finally, the fourth element, as mentioned before, consists of two feedback loops
(Smith et al., 2011; Smith, 2008). According to Smith et al. (2011) and Smith (2008), the
relationship between the historical evidence collected and historical analysis is the first
form of loop that provides researchers with feedback. The impulse that is generated
internally for the researcher to find the missing piece of the puzzle, or as Smith et al. (2011) and Smith (2008, p. 4) describes it, “a curiosity that needs satisfying, a problem that needs ‘solving’ or a theory that needs ‘testing’.” Therefore, it is the responsibility of the researcher to always keep in mind the purpose of the study and how the data collected contributes to that purpose (Smith et al., 2011; Smith, 2008). The second loop of feedback requires the researcher to be detailed oriented and patient. According to Smith Smith et al. (2011) and Smith (2008, p. 4), “participants in the events and processes historians study conduct their own historical analyses of the recent or distant past and try to feed conclusions drawn from these analyses into contemporary debate and action.”

To effectively execute the process of the second feedback loop, the researcher(s) need to obtain detailed data that provide a clearer picture of the complexity and uniqueness of the structures, while making sure not to make the mistake of speculating broad generalizations (Smith et al., 2011; Smith, 2008). Kiser and Hechter (1991) claim that researchers can avoid this mistake by incorporating theoretical perspectives to studies.

**Analyzing and Reporting Findings**

As with all research studies, there comes a time when the design process, collection process, and organizing process ends. As a result, researchers must begin a new process referred to as the analysis and reporting of the findings (Gillham, 2000). The final phase of any research study is a formidable job (Gillham, 2000). Gillham (2000) states that the more structured and organized a researcher is throughout the first few stages of a research study the less complex the final stage will be. The reason is because case study research, unlike other methodologies, has no specific way of reporting the
findings (Gillham, 2000). Scholars have the liberty of designing their own way of reporting the findings (Gillham, 2000). According to Gillham (2000):

“It can vary in length or emphasis, depending on its intended audience; it can be given live; it can be presented in conjunction with other work from various sources – as part of a large-scale survey or an exhibition, or a themed conference” (p. 93).

Regardless of the style the researcher seeks to use, Gillham (2000) states that reporting case study findings can be a demanding job and requires the full commitment of the researcher. Four important elements make up the process of reporting case study findings (Gillham, 2000); (1) presenting the numerous types of data and sources used throughout the study, (2) revealing the unique skills the study demanded to intertwine the data into a flowing narrative, (3) the demand of remaining focused and keep on track the overall goal(s) of the study and the answering of all research question, and finally (4) the task of explaining or theorizing of the findings clearly to the readers.

Following the guidelines provided by Gillham (2000), I sought to use the naturalistic researcher approach throughout the research process. The five broad and essential components of the naturalistic approach are as follows. First, I sought to structure occurrences in chronological order (Gillham, 2000). Unlike the logic of the research process, the chronology element is the process by which I attempted to uncover new data that correlates with previously uncovered data made earlier. Thusly, through reflections on the new and existing data uncovered I attempted to begin to construct a better understanding of what had occurred prior to the phenomenon studied in my dissertation (Gillham, 2000). Throughout my reporting stage I attempted to transition
between past and present information to make my connections (Gillham, 2000).

Secondly, I attempted to implement logical coherence (Gillham, 2000). According to Gillham (2000), chronology will not always be a sufficient method in which issues and themes can be reported. Therefore, researchers will have to compare, side-by-side, and cross-reference information to ensure the validity/credibility of the information (Gillham, 2000). Thirdly, I attempted to stay focused on the aim of my study (Gillham, 2000). By focusing on the purpose for why I was conducting the study, I was able to remain structured throughout the journey (Gillham, 2000); regardless of any potential digressions. Fourthly, I attempted to keep in mind my research question(s) (Gillham, 2000). Research questions, according to Gillham (2000), will play a sub-plot role within the narrative I construct. Fifthly, I attempted to explain and/or theorize about the phenomenon I originally set out to study (Gillham, 2000). It was my goal at the completion of this dissertation to provide an understanding (give meaning) to my case study research (Gillham, 2000). I sought to go past describing the phenomenon and provide an explanation of what I found (or do not find) (Gillham, 2000).

**Triangulation of Data**

According to scholars, all researchers should seek to design the best possible study they can design that incorporates effective internal and external reliability and validity measures, along with guidelines that will help eliminate any potential prejudices (Thurmond, 2001; Shih, 1998; Mitchell, 1986). As a result, one of many ways of increasing the validity, credibility, reliability of the study, minimize researcher(s) biases, and provide a holistic point of view is to implement triangulation into their studies (Thurmond, 2001; Denzin, 1970). According to Thurmond (2001), triangulation is not a
magical technique that can help improve a flawed research project. Instead, a researcher should use triangulation to aid in the comprehension of the specific phenomenon being studied (Thurmond, 2001). In addition, Thurmond (2001) recommends that researchers should effectively elaborate as to why triangulation will be used within a study and the purpose it will serve to enhance the overall study.

The aim of triangulation within research studies should be to use multiple sources of data, scholars/researchers, methodological techniques, and theoretical beliefs (Kimchi, Polvika, Stevenson, 1991; Denzin, 1970), or methods of data analysis. Denzin (1970) and Thurmond (2001), provide researchers with five broad ways that triangulation can be used within a research study, including subcategories within each technique. To begin, Denzin (1970) introduces triangulation through data sources. According to Denzin (1970), data sources can be subdivided into additional categories; (1) time, (2) space, and (3) person. Mitchell (1986) and Denzin (1970) agree that data sources are not bounded by time because when researchers begin the data collection process they can collection data from any given time; from the past to present. In addition, data sources can be collected from a variety of locations and can be based on a variety of locations (Mitchell, 1986; Denzin, 1970). Finally, data sources can be collected from a variety of individuals and institutions (Mitchell, 1986; Denzin, 1970). Thurmond (2001) advocates that researchers should not confuse longitudinal studies with triangulation. Longitudinal research focuses on recognizing patterns over an extended period of time (Thurmond, 2001). According to Kimchi et al. (1991), time triangulation, on the other hand, is the process by which researchers gather data at various periods of time to evaluate if replicated outcomes occurred.
Banik (1993) believes that the advantage of using data triangulation is based on the amount of data that is produced from its analysis. In one study, Burr (2006) was able to use questionnaires and interviews of select individuals to uncover both convergent and divergent areas. Within naturalistic qualitative studies, scholars have found that no single piece of data could possibly be given unquestionable status unless the data has been triangulated (Lincoln & Guba, 1985). The disadvantage of data triangulation is that the data generated could overwhelm the novice researcher(s) (Thurmond, 2001). In addition, Porter (1989) reminds scholars that regardless of the large amounts of data collected, false results of the phenomenon studied can still occur.

The second type of triangulation that Denzin (1970) believes researchers can benefit from is known as investigator triangulation. Investigator triangulation demands that researchers incorporate multiple perspectives of observers, multiple questioners, multiple coders, and multiple data specialist throughout a research project (Thurmond, 2001). Denzin (1970) believes that the data should be confirmed by multiple investigators studies without previous interaction to taint the outcomes, because such a process helps increase the credibility of the observations conducted by the researchers.

The advantage of investigator triangulation for researchers is summarized as research honesty (Lincoln & Guba, 1985). Working within a team could obligate researchers to stay honest throughout the analysis process and increase credibility of the results (Lincoln & Guba, 1985). Banik (1993) believes that when the data is assessed by multiple specialists, the findings not only obtains higher recognition of reliability but also of validity. Duffy (1987) advocates that specialists with various skill sets minimizes the chances of experiencing research bias/prejudices and prevents holistic fallacies. Kimchi
et al. (1991) reveals that one disadvantage of investigator triangulation is the inability to effectively measure and control researchers’ biases. The failure to manage all of the researchers, potential, biases could potentially lead to having higher instead of lower levels of biases within a study (Thurmond, 2001). In addition, Nolan and Behi (1995) believe that multiple researchers working together will waste time failing to recognize one another’s epistemological stance. Thus, if the researchers fail to comprehend and learn to work together they risk undermining the study (Thurmond, 2001). For the purpose of this dissertation, I made sure to work alone and my “team” was my committee members. I intend to obtain constructive feedback from my committee members, but ultimately I made the final decision based on their input and the ultimate goal of my dissertation.

The third type of triangulation technique is known as methodological triangulation (Thurmond, 2001). According to scholars, methodologic triangulation is most commonly referred to as multi-method research, mixed-method studies, or methods triangulation (Barbour, 1998; Greene & Caracelli, 1997; Polit & Hungler, 1995). Goodwin and Goodwin (1984) believe that novice researchers may be easily confused while reviewing methodologic triangulation literature, because the concept can be referred to as either a method of data collection or research design (Lincoln & Guba, 1985). It is not uncommon for researchers to critique methodologic triangulation as solely for the purpose of mix-methods studies; paradigmatic relationship (Barbour, 1998; Greene & Caracelli, 1997). However, Mitchell (1986) believes that methodologic triangulation should not be confined to one single method. Instead, scholars should break
down methodologic triangulation into two categories; (1) within-method of triangulation and (2) amid/across-method triangulation.

According to Kimchi et al. (1991), when researchers implement at least two (2) types of data collection strategies from the design tactic for triangulation purposes the researcher is conducting *within-method* triangulation. In quantitative studies, for instance, within-method triangulation would be when the researcher(s) use surveys to collect data and use pre-established survey data from a database. In a qualitative study, “nonparticipant observations could be combined with focus group interviews” (Thurmond, 2001, p. 254). Without a doubt, scholars have made the claim that amid-triangulation and across-triangulation can be used within the same study regardless of being quantitative or qualitative (Boyd, 2000; Denzin, 1970; Kimchi et al., 1991; Mitchell, 1986).

Lincoln and Guba (2000) make clear that within similar paradigms, it is only sensible and good practice to incorporate mix approaches to data collection. Dzurec and Abraham (1993) propose that even though scholars may not agree on various epistemological and ontological paradigms, both quantitative and qualitative methods both agree on the importance of objectives, research scope, and use of methods to conduct a research study. Ultimately, both styles of research seek to produce new knowledge and a better understanding of occurrences (Dzurec & Abraham, 1993). Polit and Hungler (1995) postulates five (5) potential disadvantages to methodologic triangulation:

1. Varying epistemological perspectives will lead to reoccurring debates of which research design is appropriate for the study.
2. Multimethod research can lead to large expenses and can become an obstacle for researchers working on a budget.

3. The researcher may have limited skills in various methods and approaches.

4. The researcher(s) may find themselves unable to effectively merge statistical information with narrative data to portray a clear description of the phenomenon studied.

5. The researcher may struggle to find editors that finds the study valid and willing to publish mix-methods research.

Theoretical triangulation is the fourth type of triangulation technique that researchers can incorporate into their studies (Denzin, 1970). As the name implies, theoretical triangulation is the process in which researchers take advantage of various theories or assumptions for the purpose of analyzing a phenomenon (Thurmond, 2001; Denzin, 1970). According to Thurmond (2001), the researcher attempts to execute a research study with varying perspectives and speculations in mind, in search of challenging or confirming outcomes. The theoretical speculations may contradict or validate the researchers point of view of a phenomenon (Denzin, 1970). Boyd (2000) provides a different approach for theoretical triangulation, the researcher may be attempting to challenge numerous theories by evaluating data from a pre-established data set.

According to Mitchell (1986), the advantage of using numerous theoretical point of views is that numerous theoretical point of views can minimize other accounts of the study outcomes. Unlike other approaches, theoretical triangulation provides a wide range and in-depth evaluation of the results (Banik, 1993). Thurmond (2001) believes that
multiple theories also pushes the researcher outside of their comfort zone and personal
prejudices that may lead to obvious explanation studies. In addition, studying a
phenomenon from multiple points of views assists in eliminating other hypothesizes for
specific studies; ultimately, increasing the validity of the study (Banik, 1993). The
disadvantage of theoretical triangulation is that it requires explicitly identifying a
theoretical framework (Mitchell, 1986). If not, Mitchell (1986) believes that if the
theoretical framework is not clearly defined and adhered to the researcher will find
her/himself confused. In addition, Lincoln and Guba (1985) share that at times
researchers may fail to select theories to study a phenomenon that do not align
epistemologically and may be flawed. If the theories selected for theoretical triangulation
are theories that challenge one another generating knowledge will prove to be difficult
(Lincoln & Guba, 1985).

Finally, the fifth type of triangulation is referred to by scholars as data-analysis
triangulation. Data analysis triangulation is most commonly found within quantitative
studies (Kimchi et al., 1991). Data analysis triangulation is the process by which the
researcher merges multiple statistical tactics to show correlations or support data (Kimchi
et al., 1991).

Ethical Considerations

Orb, Eisenhauer, and Wynaden (2001) believe that ethical principles assist
researchers navigate through concerns that arise at the start of a project and throughout
the research study. Specifically, within qualitative research, Orb et al. (2001) feel that
ethical principles ensure that the aim of the study and the rights of the individuals
associated with the study are not violated and any risk to do harm is kept to a minimum.
Ethical considerations assist researchers in avoiding executing research that can cause harm to participants like in the Tuskegee syphilis study conducted by the United States Public Health Service (Caplan, 1992).

Although some researchers, most commonly novice researchers, make the assumption that ethical considerations are similar across quantitative and qualitative studies, other scholars would claim that such a belief is false (Orb, Eisenhauer, & Wynaden, 2001). Within qualitative studies, Punch (1994) shares that it is uncommon, and borderline difficult, to stumble upon a study that has ethical letdowns. Contrary to that belief, other scholars have expressed that when researchers, both novice or experienced, do not take the time to incorporate ethical considerations into their study to address potential ethical obstacles, often times those failures commonly leads to those same researchers not knowing how to overcome the unforeseeable obstacles that are expected of qualitative studies (Batchelor & Briggs, 1994).

Even though most universities, within the United States, have their own ethical review committee that evaluates any potential research study for approval, ultimately it is the responsibility of the primary research to ensure she/he protects the participants within the study by minimizing any potential for harm (Orb, Eisenhauer, & Wynaden, 2001; Dresser, 1998). Some scholars have proposed three potential ethical concerns that all qualitative researchers may encounter; (1) ethical considerations that may arise between the participant(s) and researcher(s) relationship, (2) how the researcher(s) subjectively analyzes and interprets the data generated throughout the study, and (3) how the study to be conducted is planned and designed (Ramos, 1989). For example, Robert Allen Humphreys tearoom sex study (1970) is a clear example of the potential for researchers
to be unethical and not attempt to minimize the potential harm that can occur to
participants.

Based on the failed attempts of previous scholars to take into consideration ethical
contcerns, scholars have created various ethical principles to help future scholars from
making similar mistakes. According to Orb, Eisenhauer, and Wynaden, (2001, p. 95),
ethical principles can be divided into three subcategories that will help researchers; (1)
Justice, (2) autonomy, and (3) beneficence. All forms of research should at a minimum be
facilitated by the principles of respect for individuals, benevolence, and fairness. Orb,
Eisenhauer, and Wynaden (2001) claim that individuals of the study deserve respect;
respect for their rights, the right to be clear about the purpose of the study, the right to
make conscious decisions to contribute to the study, and the right to walk away from the
study at any stage of the research without the fear of penalization by the researcher.

Kvale (1996) claims that within qualitative studies the principle of autonomy
should be fulfilled through the process of providing participants with an informed consent
form. Informed consent allows participants to have a good balance between having
enough information to know the purpose and their role in the study, while also being
sufficiently under-informed to not taint the researcher results and be willing to make a
conscious decision of the risks involved (Kvale, 1996). Therefore, the researcher is
removed from pressuring the participants to make a decision and the participants regain
full control over their decision-making process to accept or refuse to participate in the
study (Orb, Eisenhauer, & Wynaden, 2001). Many scholars refer to the consent process
as a process by which trust is negotiated and built, and may lead to continuous
renegotiations (Kvale, 1996; Field & Morse, 1992; Munhall, 1988).
The second ethical principle that researcher(s) should incorporate into their study is the beneficence principle (Orb, Eisenhauer, & Wynaden, 2001). The beneficence principle is most commonly known as the process by which researchers intend to do good by stakeholders of the study and prevent harm to the participants (Orb, Eisenhauer, & Wynaden, 2001); but should not be taken to a paternalistic extreme (Orb, Eisenhauer, & Wynaden, 2001). If a researcher incorporates an extreme interpretation of the beneficence principle she/he risks denying participants their autonomy and right to make individual decisions to consent (Orb, Eisenhauer, & Wynaden, 2001). For instance, researchers may want to study a vulnerable population, but because the population is classified as a vulnerable group the researchers fail to allow participants of the vulnerable group in the study. On the other hand, Raudonis (1992) provides a different perspective to the beneficence principle. Raudonis (1992) claims that the participants should not be the only ones that the beneficence principle applies to; instead research approaches/techniques implemented throughout the data collection and the selection process for participant inclusion into the study also require ethical considerations. Therefore, Raudonis (1992) claims that researchers should give sufficient consideration to how participants are sought after, to be involved in the study.

Another aspect of the beneficence principle is the moral consideration given to protecting participants’ identities (Orb, Eisenhauer, & Wynaden, 2001); hence, researchers recommend creating false identities (pseudonyms) for participants to protect any potential identity exposure. Orb, Eisenhauer, and Wynaden (2001) claim that such an approach is flawed within small communities, it is close to impossible to conceal participant’s identities. Therefore, researchers should restrict access to the study until the
participants have removed themselves from the community and potential harm (Orb, Eisenhauer, & Wynaden, 2001). Because a researcher may want to use direct statements of participants, researchers need to be told how, when, and where the publication will be released to the public (Orb, Eisenhauer, & Wynaden, 2001).

Finally, the third ethical principle that researchers should take into consideration when designing and conducting a study is the justice principle (Orb, Eisenhauer, & Wynaden, 2001). According to scholars, for ethical justice purposes researchers need to be fair and treat all participants as equals (Orb, Eisenhauer, & Wynaden, 2001). In other words, ethical justice seeks to eliminate the mistreatment and manipulation of research participants. Within qualitative studies, the justice principle can be addressed by researchers through conducting a strength and weakness analysis of the individuals included in the study (Orb, Eisenhauer, & Wynaden, 2001). However, researchers claim that the ethical principle of justice is not perfect. Capron (1989) claims that practical concerns are associated with the principle of justice within studies. Such as, the concept of justice should not further restrict or burden an already vulnerable population (Capron, 1989). Therefore, it is the responsibility of the researcher to find a reasonable and respectable boundary that works for their specific study, since no cookie-cutter template exists that are universal for all studies.

**Reliability Considerations**

According to Weber (1989) and Krippendorff (1980), if a researcher seeks to use content analysis methods she/he must meet three requirements of reliability; (1) stability, (2) reproducibility, and (3) accuracy. According to Weber (1989), if the results of content grouping are invariant throughout a period of time, then the content grouping meets the
stability requirement. Weber (1989) advocates that researchers should conduct a first and second level analysis of coding, by the same researcher, to ensure stability. If the researcher experiences discrepancies throughout the coding process, the coding is then unreliable (Weber, 1989). Weber (1989), reveals that discrepancies may be due to numerous issues. For example, discrepancies may occur due to the guidelines of how coding should occur (Weber, 1989). Discrepancies may also occur because of ambiguities throughout the text(s), reasoning changes that may occur for the researcher as she/he learns more about the study subject(s), or because of basic research errors (Weber, 1989). Finally, Weber (1989) reminds scholars depending on the amount of content that is analyzed, one individual may become exhausted and rush through information. As a result, stability, per Weber (1989), unfortunately is the weakest procedure of reliability.

According to Weber (1989), intercoder reliability (reproducibility) seeks to address how a study can be replicated by other researchers based on following the same procedures the original researcher used. Errors throughout the coding process usually happens because the researcher may have gained new information that changes her/his perception of the data (Weber, 1989). Or because researchers fail to follow effective procedures for coding (Weber, 1989). Whereas stability seeks to account for consistency within the researcher, reproducibility seeks to account for the shared comprehension of meaning that the information generates (Weber, 1989). According to Weber (1989), the ability of the research to clearly portray the groupings of text that make up specific groups/society standards or norms is when the researcher has met the accuracy requirement. Because it is not an easy task to complete, Weber (1989) believes that accuracy is the backbone of reliability. Reliability, according to Krippendorff (1980), is
the process of ensuring reliability in coding can be used, and has been used, to challenge how the individuals coding match against standard coding procedures created by other coding researchers.

Krippendorff (1980), sought to reiterate to researchers the gravity of the value of effectively executing the coding process. Krippendorff (1980) pointed out that many scholars fail to fully assess the reliability of the coding they have conducted. Furthermore, in their attempt to assess their reliability, researchers only conduct procedures that give the illusion of making their data seem more reliable than they truly are. Because coding reliability may lead to issues, Krippendorff (1980), states that researchers should take into consideration any foreseeable coding issues before analyzing the codes. Although Krippendorff’s (1980), concerns relate directly to researchers coding the information manually, instead of using new technological software systems, the suggestions are vital for this study. As the researcher, I made sure to pay particular attention to Krippendorff’s (1980) discussion of reliability flaws to ensure my coding process is trustworthy.

Validity Considerations

While reviewing the literature I came across various scholars that stressed the importance of validity considerations. As I read and compared Brinberg and Kidder (1982), Cook and Campbell (1979), Campbell and Stanley (1963), I found myself perplexed by the concept because validity considerations have been implemented in various ways throughout various methodologies. However, two distinctions were reached. Brinberg and McGrath (1982) present validity as the information shared amongst two groups of things, for example, concepts, variables, methods, and data. As
well as, the ability to generalize the outcomes, interpretations, and assumptions of validity (Brinberg & McGrath, 1982). For instance, if a specific phenomenon is analyzed by two specific methods, and the data produced by the analysis of both variables are found to have a significant relationship, then the researcher(s) can speculate that the variables analyzed are true valid indicators of the phenomenon. The knowledge produced serves as an indication that the phenomenon has the potential to be generalized because the measurement does not depend on a specific way by which to be operationalized (Weber, 1989). Within the context of violent extremism, as an example, we can speculate that two groupings exist showing issues with antagonism. One group is categorized solely on words used, the other group is categorized on full/complete sentences. Taking it one step further, let’s speculate that for the same groupings of text the different ways in which they are measured show a significant relationship. The knowledge produced would reveal that both variables are accurate measures of the phenomenon studied; as a result, both variables become valid representations of the phenomenon.

According to Weber (1989), the second distinction, geared specifically towards content analysis methodology, consists of two parts. The first is between the validity in regard to the grouping scheme or variables that can be extrapolated from the groupings, and the validity of the relationship of the researchers’ implications of the variables of the content and their applicability to the causes or significances (Weber, 1989). According to Weber (1989, p. 18), “to assert that a research result based on content analysis is valid is to assert that the finding does not depend upon, or is generalizable beyond the specific data, methods, or measurements of a particular study.” Weber (1989), also advocates that face validity is the feeblest form of validity in content analysis. Face validity involves the
generation of information based on the way that a researcher defines a concept and the way that the researcher defines how the concept should be measured (Weber, 1989).

As a result, Weber (1989) introduces four differing ways to ensure stronger validity that incorporate external criterions. To begin, Weber (1989) introduces construct validity. To Weber (1989), construct validity has a significant relationship with another means of measurement of the same phenomenon. However, other scholars have gone one step further in defining construct validity and have made an emphasize of differentiating convergent from discriminant validity (Campbell & O’Connell, 1982; Fiske, 1982; Althauser, 1974; Alwin, 1974; Campbell and Fiske, 1959). According to these scholars, construct validity can be classified as having a meaningful relationship when it connects with other measures of the same phenomenon (convergent) and it fails to show a relationship with dealings of divergent phenomenon (discriminant). In addition, according to the scholars mentioned previously, construct validity embodies the ability to take a broad view of the phenomenon through various measures or methods used by researchers (Campbell & O’Connell, 1982; Fiske, 1982; Althauser, 1974; Alwin, 1974; Campbell and Fiske, 1959).

Another type of validity that Weber (1989) informs researchers of is known as Hypothesis validity. The information that can be revealed between variables and the information amongst these relationships and theories used by researchers within a study are known as Hypothesis Validity (Weber, 1989). According to Weber (1989), when a variable is assumed to “behave” a specific way based on the relationship with other variables, and as a result the variable does in fact “behave” in the assumed fashion the variable is therefore known as hypothesis validity. Namenwirth (1969, 1973) and Weber
(1984, 1982) have conducted studies using hypothesis validity when reviewing political documents. In these studies, these scholars were able to produce outcomes with assumptions made by theories on the topic of cultural and social processes that can come from political documents with changes in the economy (Weber, 1989).

Another type of validity, according to Weber (1989), is known as *predictive validity*. As the name implies, predictive validity is the ability to forecasts about specific situations and conditions outside of the boundaries of the study that show a relationship to real occurrences or conditions (Weber, 1989). According to Weber (1989), the prophecies are not time constraint, therefore they can be about the past (*post diction*), the upcoming events, or simultaneous situations. According to Weber (1989), due to the fact that generalization of the inferences made from the data collected can be applied to broad range of situations not related to the study or under the direct manipulation of the researcher, *predictive validity* is viewed by researchers as powerful. Finally, the fourth type of validity is known as *semantic validity* (Weber, 1989). Regardless of how the researcher(s) groups and categorizes words or other units that have been coded together the researcher must incorporate similar undertones if they seek to meet the *semantic validity* requirement (Weber, 1989). “Semantic validity exists when persons familiar with the language and texts examine lists of words (or other units) placed in the same category and agree that these words have similar meanings or connotations” (Krippendorff, 1980, p. 159ff). Conventional wisdom would agree that for valid content analysis studies Krippendorff’s interpretation would be a given, however scholars raise concerns regarding the vagueness of words and of category groupings (Weber, 1989).
Chapter 4: Results

Within this chapter, I aim to present my readers with my data analysis. I begin with a brief introduction. Following the introduction, I will present my data and the sources used throughout the study. After presenting the data and sources I will inform my readers of the challenges and solutions to these challenges I experienced throughout the execution of the study. Furthermore, I will explain, and theorize, the findings clearly to my readers. After presenting my findings I layout significant quoted statements I found throughout my analysis that are relevant to the study and will end the chapter with a brief summary and critique before transitioning to chapter five.

Introduction

Since the formation of Pakistan, its social fabric has experienced many deep scars and tears. Setting aside the previously mentioned numerous killings that took place before the partition, Pakistan faced the challenge of finding a solution for the on-going problem of Kashmir. Arguably, since its foundation and independence, the leaders of Pakistan structured and framed the Kashmir concerns as the core concern of its national make-up. Confronted with an opponent with greater capabilities, Pakistan sought an alliance with jihadis and, as a result, embraced a business philosophy and outsourced its war of attrition (Swami, 2000). In other words, by outsourcing the task to jihadis, Pakistan set itself up for a dynamic timing game. A long-term dynamic timing game where the players pick and choose moments to stop and initiate the game, while ultimately hoping, to achieve the most possible results and outlasting the other opponent(s) through the prolonging of time. According to Stern and McBride (2013), the government of Pakistan and the ISI intelligence services brought about, gave full support
to, and governed extremist training camps. The training grounds themselves were not clandestine locations, on the contrary, most if not all the masses knew where the camps were located. In addition, those seeking to join extremist groups where aware of the various locations and methods of enlisting.

Hence, throughout the North-West regions of Pakistan numerous camps were, and still are, found to embrace and teach an extreme discourse of Islam; like camps during the Afghan war with the Soviet military. As a result, the various camps located throughout Pakistan ultimately became the prime location for individuals with the hope of becoming jihadis, while also giving individuals globally a new home that embraced their reality. Thusly, it did not take long for Pakistan to become known as one of earth’s most dangerous locations; because it (1) provided individuals with extremist views an opportunity to join extremist groups and (2) because it allowed extremist individuals to train. The gradual society collapse occurring within Peshawar Pakistan has been built up by chaos in the (1) region, (2) the political crisis, (3) the economic degradation, (4) an oppressive atmosphere of morale, and (5) various religious doctrine vacuums’.

On the 16th of December of 2014 seven (7) Tehrik-e-Taliban (TTP) men armed and equipped for a fight infiltrated the Army Public School in the North-Western city of Peshawar in Pakistan to execute a terrorist attack. To initiate the attack, the TTP attackers began by blowing up their means of transportation behind the Army Public School. Following the vehicle explosion, the TTP attackers stormed the Army Public School and began to indiscriminately fire rapidly towards the groups of children/students and teachers running frantically in search of cover. Yet, the TTP attackers did not simply station themselves in specific positions in hopes of shooting just a few students and
teachers. Instead, the TTP attackers began entering classroom by classroom to execute dozens of more students and teachers that sought safety behind closed doors.

The Tehrik-e-Taliban (TTP), as mentioned in chapter two of this dissertation, is an umbrella organization that is made up of various heavily armed anti-state religious extremist smaller groups; hence, the unity of these various groups makes the TTP significantly dangerous within Pakistan, including the North-Western province of Peshawar Pakistan. Shortly after the Army Public School massacre, the TTP took responsibility for the attack and explained that the massacre was a retaliation attack for the speculated killings due to the Pakistani military operations that sought to put an end to the TPP expansion. Specifically, the military operations conducted in June of 2014 in North Waziristan and Khyber provinces. Once the Pakistani military could neutralize the seven (7) TTP attackers and assure the school was no longer under attack, over 149 individuals within the Army Public School were killed. Of the 149 individuals murdered, a total of 132 of them were students ranging between the ages of 12 to 16.

In the days following the TTP attack on the Army Public School, the government leadership of Pakistan, along with the military leaders, congregated, designed, agreed upon, and implemented immediate changes to address the increasing blowback of the Army Public School massacre. The Pakistani government and military found itself confronted with angry masses demanding the TTP be held accountable. Hence, in alignment with this dissertation in the following sections I present to my readers the findings of my analysis of the before and after events that led up to and resulted from the December 16th of 2014 Peshawar Pakistan’s Army Public School massacre. Specifically,
the Northwest region of Pakistan’s violent extremism national transformation to countering violent extremism that occurred prior and after January 06, 2015.

Data Analysis

In the following sections, I have defined the data analysis section into various subcategories. I will begin by defining the specific timeline that was gathered and analyzed for the generation of my findings. After the time frames, I have presented the process by which I gathered my data. Following the data gathering process, I inform my readers of how the data was divided to more effectively organize the data and facilitate the data analysis process later in the process. Following the organization, I have provided details of how the data was structured for the data analysis. Proceeding, I have included, examined, and critiqued the Pakistani 20-point National Action Plan. Finally, this chapter, chapter four (4), includes the findings of the data collected and analyzed. The findings have been broken down into two different categories. First, I have presented the theoretical findings. Secondly, I have presented the practical findings based on the effectiveness of the countering violent extremism narrative of the 21st Constitutional Amendment within the Pakistani constitution. In transition to chapter five (5), I have included a conclusion section to summarize and highlight key points of chapter four (4). The purpose of clearly outlining and recording the process in chapter four is because I seek to be as transparent as possible and I want to make the replicability of this dissertation as easily as possible for scholars intending to replicate my results.

Time Line

To initiate the historical content analysis for my case study, it was essential that I select specific time frames and bound texts within the parameters of this dissertations
scope. Based on the data gathering process, the government of Pakistan did not begin to enforce the National Action Plan (NAP) until January of 2015. Hence, the timeframe post the December 16, 2014 Army Public School massacre selected for this dissertation will launch in the middle of June 2014, because mid-June 2014 is officially when the government of Pakistan, according to the data gathered, transitioned into embracing and enforcing Pakistan’s official countering violent extremism narrative. The end timeframe following the Army Public School massacre, for the purpose of this dissertation, was February 28, 2017.

**Data Gathering**

To ensure the validity and credibility of the sources used for analysis I incorporated Hansen’s Model 2 to select texts. According to the model (Hansen, 2013), researchers must incorporate official and governmental narratives, various texts, statements, and narratives from critiques, media, and entities, so they can be taken into consideration for a proper holistic data collection and analysis. Hence, by incorporating Model 2 into this dissertation I was able to select and analyze texts that show how official, opposition, and political narratives regarding Pakistan’s countering violent extremism narrative collaborated following the Army Public School massacre. In addition, the model allowed me to analyze how the power of freshly formulated, unified, governing narratives aided Pakistan in ultimately furthering its political interests. Not only were texts from various sources incorporated throughout this dissertation to formally align with Hansen’s Model 2, but texts from numerous sources were used to provide a more holistic perspective of Pakistan’s complex official narratives.
As the secondary data gathering process supports, within Pakistan the federal government is not the institution to obtain formal narratives on countering violent extremism. As previously stated in chapter two (2) of this dissertation, since the 1947 independence of Pakistan the civilian and military relationship is at a constant tug-of-war struggle for power when faced with the task for making decisions and enforcing governance. Therefore, to vividly portray an accurate picture, based on the data collected, of Pakistan’s countering violent extremism narrative I selected various sources to begin to comprehend the complexity of governance of narratives on countering terrorism within Pakistan.

**Division of Data**

As stated in chapter one (1) of this dissertation, I originally sought to structure occurrences in *chronological* order ranging from January 1, 2003 through January 31, 2015 and February 1, 2015 through February 28, 2017 (Gillham, 2000). However, throughout the data collection process, sources and/or evidence revealed that the richest means of data/evidence collected, that directly influence and were relevant for this dissertation topic, originates as of June of 2014 through February 2017. As a result, more than 600 texts were critically read, highlighted for any evidence relevant to this dissertation, analyzed, and cross-referenced with other sources to ensure validity and accuracy. To begin, I viewed, read, and examined critiques of press statements and critiques of press briefings involving the military of Pakistan’s Inter Services Public Relations (ISPR) (Prime Minister Office, 2016). Secondly, following the Inter Services Public Relations statements and briefings critiques I read and examined more than six National Assembly’s (NA) transcripts, which covered information following the Army
Public School massacre. The National Assembly’s transcripts focused on discussions revolving how to properly implement legislations and the twenty-first (21) constitutional amendment; which directly impacts this dissertation. Thirdly, in alignment with a historical holistic perspective I read and examined various articles in support of and against (1) press releases, (2) policy addresses by the Pakistani government, and (3) official speeches addressed by the Prime Minister’s Office (PMO). Fourthly, I also read and examined critiques of numerous political parties’ responses to the Pakistani government’s formal addresses and statements. Finally, I organized the data based on various media outlet intelligences, televised reports, and debates conducted through the radio. Furthermore, I incorporated opinion articles written by both Pakistani and worldwide journalists, subject matter experts, and political representatives.

Data Structure

As previously mentioned, with each piece of data that was found it was attentively read, selected if it was relevant to my dissertation topic or discarded if it was not relevant, and sorted accordingly from various sources. The first challenge I faced throughout the data collection process was the realization that within Pakistan the internet is limited, hence a significant population depend on and resort to televised broadcasting, radio broadcast stations, and Urdu newspapers for information. Hence, all data found and significant for my dissertation topic were examined, analyzed, defined, and triangulated with three major televised media outlets to ensure the accuracy, validity, and reliability with the three outlets. Specifically, the televised media outlets used throughout the triangulation phase were the three most commonly used tv media outlets used in first level data sources that are also streamed online; 92 news, Dunya News, and Geo News.
Due to language barriers, these major televised sources were used because they provide articles in English, online, and I did not have to worry about having a translator and any valuable data lost in translation because I was using translated secondary level data. Also, Radio Mashaal and Radio Deewa were two major global radio stations used for data collection, but through other scholars I was able to find secondary level data through these outlets. In alignment with the televised media sources, these radio stations were selected because of my ability to obtain articles in English online. In alignment with my pursuit to provide full disclosure to my readers, I was able to find data in Deewa Radio’s online platform because Google provides a free English Translation feature, thereby allowing me to effectively read, examine, and determine the significance of the information to my dissertation. Furthermore, secondary level data referencing three Urdu newspapers were also included within this dissertation as data sources. The Daily Jang is considered to be the newspaper most read throughout Pakistan. In addition, the Daily Jang is the most established newspaper in Pakistan, dating back to 1946. The Daily Pakistan was founded by Mujeeb-ur-Rehman Shami, an internationally known journalist. The benefit of the Daily Pakistan for this dissertation is that the newspaper is published in cities throughout Pakistan such as Karachi, Lahore, Islamabad, Peshawar, and Multan. Express News has an ongoing partnership with the International Herald Express, which happens to be the first newspaper throughout Pakistan that provided readers with a global point of view of current events and of current events occurring throughout various regions of Pakistan.

Data addressing the National Action Plan or countering violent extremism were also incorporated for secondary level analysis from the (1) Prime Minister’s Office, the
(2) Pakistani Military’s Inter Services Public Relations, the (3) National Assembly, and 
(4) media outlets were triangulated to ensure the accuracy, credibility, and legitimacy of 
the texts. The triangulation process was conducted in three phases. To begin, I searched 
for and selected secondary level data from the Geo News and Dunya News televised 
programs streamed online and read and examined to assure specific texts were mentioned 
and/or referenced in any top story announcement. It is important to note that in Pakistan, 
and specifically Geo News and Dunya News, the reporting’s are classified into three 
various categories based on their level of importance and/or significance.

The first (1) type of news reporting is short news. Short news consists of an 
anchor taking up about no more than a minute of air time to inform viewers of a specific 
incident; within this minute the anchor may or may not incorporate pictures to reference 
the news. Short news will also be found in Urdu newspapers as a single column. The 
second (2) type of news reporting classification within Pakistan is considered long news. 
Long news stories are not confined to less than a minute of air time in reporting. In 
addition, long news more often than not have some type of audio recording, or sound on 
tape (SOT), for both televised streaming and radio broadcasting. Within an Urdu 
newspaper, long news will not have a single column, on the contrary, long news are 
provided with more space for reporting. A third (3) type of news reporting classification 
within Pakistan is news report. A news report is guaranteed to include one means of 
audio along with the story, possibly more. In addition, a news report will also include an 
analysis or commentary, will be allowed between two or three minutes of televised or 
radio air time, and will easily be found as a top story within Urdu newspapers. Finally, 
the fourth (4) type of news reporting classification within Pakistan is referred to as news
**tickers.** News tickers are simply short-texts news, similar to Twitter messages, or specific points of a top story/lead. Most commonly, news tickers are short texts streaming on the bottom or top portion of a televised reporting, similar to sports channels during games which will report the score of statistics of other teams/games playing simultaneously to update viewers of all games scores/statistics.

Once I confirmed that a specific text was broadcasted as one of the four styles of reporting, I cross-referenced the same text with secondary level data from Express News TV online platform. If the specific text was also mentioned in Express News TV online platform I also cross-referenced the specific text with Urdu Newspapers online platform to ensure the specific text was also mentioned. In the end, to assure I provide a holistic perspective, I found that it was critical to also cross-reference specific text with global news sources. As a result, CNN, BBC, Al Jazeera, NPR, MSNBC and Pashtun region radio stations were also included. The rationale for including such international sources and Pashtun region radio stations was because the data collected showed that the political violence within Pakistan was not occurring within Peshawar Pakistan, instead it was occurring in the North-West province of Pashtun. In addition, significant amounts of Pakistani Military operations were being executed within the FATA tribal belt area, therefore I sought to cross-reference specific texts with secondary level data from the most active regions within Pakistan that were relevant to this dissertation.

All of the data collected for this dissertation, whether it was related to the Pakistani government, the Pakistani military, or pro and anti-groups, was screened through this rigors process. As a result, any secondary level data not matching the expected criterion were immediately omitted. It is important to note that the secondary
level data used for this dissertation, regardless of source and political views, were incorporated into this dissertation for analysis because it directly impacted/related to my research question. In addition, the international news media outlets, although outside of the Pakistan boundaries, served three distinct purposes for this dissertation. First (1), were to critically evaluate and analyze the varying perspectives and discourses of politicians and subject matter experts in the region. Second (2), due to my lack of proficiency in Urdu or Pashto, I sought to include global media sources to help minimize the need of translating documents. Third (3), the international outlets were included because a significant amount of data found were connected to international media outlets and were properly cited and quoted. Hence, these sources allowed me to locate other documents and thereby created a snowball effect for data collection.

**National Action Plan**

Immediately after the Army Public school massacre on December 16, 2014, the government and political parties of Pakistan united to condemn and find a solution to end violent extremism within Pakistan. The byproduct of the national consensus was officially named the “20 Points National Action Plan (NAP)” (National Counter Terrorism Authority NACTA Pakistan, 2014).
Table 2

20 Points of National Action Plan

1. Implementation of death sentence of those convicted in cases of terrorism.
2. Special trial courts under the supervision of Army. The duration of these courts would be two years.
3. Militant outfits and armed gangs will not be allowed to operate in the country.
4. NACTA, the anti-terrorism institution will be strengthened.
5. Strict action against the literature, newspapers and magazines promoting hatred, extremism, sectarianism and intolerance.
7. Ensuring against re-emergence of proscribed organizations.
8. Establishing and deploying a dedicated counter-terrorism force.
9. Taking effective steps against religious persecution.
10. Registration and regulation of religious seminaries.
11. Ban on glorification of terrorists and terrorist organizations through print and electronic media.
12. Administrative and development reforms in FATA with immediate focus on repatriation of IDPs.
13. Communication network of terrorists will be dismantled completely.
16. Ongoing operation in Karachi will be taken to its logical end.
17. Balochistan government to be fully empowered for political reconciliation with complete ownership by all stakeholders.
18. Dealing firmly with sectarian terrorists.
19. Formulation of a comprehensive policy to deal with the issue of Afghan refugees, beginning with registration of all refugees.
20. Revamping and reforming the criminal justice system.


In theory, the National Action Plan seeks to intertwine security duties and responsibilities of both the state government and the regional governments through three phases. First, the 20-point National Action Plan seeks to engage all the stakeholders that can aid in countering violent extremism. Secondly, the National Action Plan 20-point seeks to completely destabilize and rip to shreds violent extremist systems/networks. Thirdly, the 20-point National Action Plan appears to be designed as a deterrence strategy by uniting various resources of security entities to counter inner threats to the Pakistani state’s security. In practice, the 20-point National Action Plan is a blend between sixteen (16) basic responsibilities and obligations any state must provide to govern effectively
and four (4) case specific objectives. In greater detail, the four (4) case specific objectives of the 20-point NAP are, (1) the establishment and enforcement of military courts for the purpose of expediting extremist trials, (2) the validation of capital punishment for violent extremist, (3) the establishment and enforcement of the National Counter Terrorism Authority (NACTA), and (4) reforms to be conducted within the Federally Administered Tribal Area. The sixteen (16) basic obligations and responsibilities that an effective government must uphold to govern in the 20-point NAP closely resemble the 2014 National Internal Security Policy (NISP) that the Pakistani government sought to enforce years prior to the National Action Plan 20 - Points.

Based on an in-depth analysis, a significant portion of the National Action Plan 20-Points runs parallel to numerous pre-existing laws that the Pakistani government had already created and enforced within its constitution. For example, the countering of blacklisted groups from functioning and/or congregating under a newly recognized name(s). Also, the elimination of providing extremist groups with monetary resources. Furthermore, destabilizing extremist ability to transfer knowledge amongst one another. In addition, banning the creation of nonstate sponsored militias. As well as, putting an end to any/all means of hate speech and hate literature. Hence, below is a simplified chart of the reorganization of the flow of information. Specifically, the graph represents the fashion in which the various institutions are shifted to effectively implement and enforce the National Action Plan 20-point strategy.
Figure 4. The Restructuring of Information Sharing

In the graph above, the Prime Minister has governance authority over the army chief, the nine (9) ministries, the National Counter Terrorism Authority, and various intelligence agencies to assure the implementation and enforcement of the National Action Plan 20 – points. The nine (9) ministries are made up of nine (9) cabinet members which make up the Federal Apex Committee. Ultimately, the three (3) groups reporting directly to the Prime Minister are responsible and held accountable for directly outlining and recommending which are the political policies that are in the best interest of the Pakistani state.

In the graph below, I have reconstructed the structure in which the enforcement and the effectiveness of the 20-point National Action Plan are established at the provincial level. According to the National Action Plan, provinces are broken down into subcategories. The Provincial Apex Committee is made up of local chief ministers and these same chief ministers collaborate with provincial police captains, civil-society administration, and numerous intelligence and security entities. These committees
formally have allowed the military to dominate the civil-society realm in an attempt to assist the Pakistani state in countering violent extremist acts in various provinces.

![Chain of Command at Provincial Level](source: Sustainable Development Policy Institute)

**Figure 5.** Chain of Command at Provincial Level

**National Action Plan Analysis**

In regard to the National Action Plan strategy, through secondary-level data I have collected and analyzed the effectiveness of the individual 20-points. In the table below, I mapped out the individual 20 points of the NAP, the specific institution that are responsible for the governance of each task, and the status of the data point based on secondary level data.

Table 3

| N.A.P. Point, Overseeing Institution of N.A.P. Point, & Analysis of Data Point Progress |
|---|---|---|
| **N.A.P. #** | **Goal of National Action Plan** | **Governing Institution** | **Notes** |
| 1 | “Execution of Convicted Terrorist” | Ministry of Interior | A total of 483 individuals executed under ATA/PPC |
| 2 | “Special Trial Courts” | Ministry of Interior | 11 Courts Notified 388 Cases transferred to STC |
“Action against Armed Militias”

Provincial Government, Ministry of Defense, Ministry of Interior
- Visibility of armed militias and display of weapons curtailed.
- Terrorist Killed: 1811
- Terrorist Arrested: 5611

Findings

Renovation of two buildings for housing NACTA in progress
- Office Space

Budget 2016/17
- Requested: 1559.0 M
- Approved: 1545.5 M

Budget 2017/18
- Requested: 1528.727 M
- Approved: 143.019 M

HR

“Strengthening and activation of NACTA”

Prime Minister/Ministry of Interior/Ministry of Finance

“Countering hate speech and extremist material”

Provincial Government/Ministry of Interior

Hate Speech/Materials
- Cases registered: 1353
- Persons Arrested: 2528
- Shops Sealed: 70

Misuse of Loudspeakers
- Cases Registered: 17795
- Persons Arrested: 18520
- Equipment confiscated: 7942

- FERA/Hawala Hundi Cases: 777; Arrests: 1060; Recovery: 1320.705 Million
- Anti-Money Laundering: Cases: 336, Arrests: 483
- Suspicious Transaction Reports: STRs, Received from EMU: 176; Converted into Cases: 32; Closed: 14; Under Process: 130

- Counter Financing for Terrorists (CFT) Units established in all provincial CTDs.
- CFT to be made an integral part of provincial investigations.
- National Task Force (NTF) on CFT with reps from “all stakeholders,” set-up in June 2017 for “effective coordination” on policy and operations
- Categorize: (63+3) 164 UNSCR Common 13
- 4th Schedule Total Activists: 8333

- Number of Accounts Frozen: 5023
- Amount Frozen: Rs. 150 Million
- Following Actions have been taken against Proscribed Persons:
  - Passport Embargo
  - Frozen Bank Accounts
  - Ban on Financial Support and Services by financial institutes. Arms License Embargo
- Provincial Governments requested to take legal action under ATA 1997

UNIT Sanctioned Present
“Establishing a Counter Terrorism Force”

Federal Government/Ministry of Interior/Provincial Government

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Province</th>
<th>ICT</th>
<th>Punjab</th>
<th>Sindh</th>
<th>Bal</th>
<th>KP</th>
<th>GB</th>
<th>AJK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Punjab</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>5000</td>
<td>4300</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sindh</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>728</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bal</td>
<td>3000</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KP</td>
<td>2206</td>
<td>2080</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GB</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>168</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AJK</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>260</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

“Taking steps against religious persecution”

Ministry of Religious Affairs/Provincial Government

- Data Collection in progress, to be verified and then put up for further action
- Two separate Registration and Data form for Madaris developed in consultation with Ittehad-e-Tanzeem-ul-Madaris Paksitan (ITMP)
- Committees under Federal Board of Intermediate and Secondary Education (FBISE) and Higher Education Commission (HEC) formed with representation from ITMP for grant of equivalence degree awarding status of Wafaqs.
- Strict implementation of ban on electronic media of activists of proscribed organizations.
- Any violation is instantly reported to concerned quarters and actions taken.
- Visible improvement noticed.

“Registration and regulation of Madrassas”

Ministry of Religious Affairs

“Ban on glorification of terrorism in media”

Ministry of Information & Broadcasting

- The Federal Cabinet has approved in principle recommendations of the Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA) reforms committee.

“FATA Reforms”

Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Government/Ministry of States & Frontier Regions Pakistan

“Dismantling communication networks of terrorists”

Telecommunication Authority/Ministry of Interior

- 98.3 Million SIMs blocked
- Biometric Verification system in place.

“Tangible measures against abuse of internet and Social media for terrorism”

Ministry of Information Technology

- Pakistan Electronic Crime Act 2015 passed
- 937 URLs and 10 websites of proscribed organizations have been blocked by Ministry of Information Technology
- Hardcore Elements Identified: 1132
- Schedule IV: 405
- Firebrand Speakers: 78
- Government of Punjab launched pilot project to train 200 children in technical skills and soft loans for development

“Militancy in Punjab”

Punjab Government

- Government of Punjab launched pilot project to train 200 children in technical skills and soft loans for development
“Taking the ongoing operation in Karachi to its logical conclusion”

Sindh Government/ Ministry of Interior

“Steps towards Baluchistan Reconciliation”

Federal Government of Baluchistan/ Ministry of Defense/ Ministry of Interior

“Ending Sectarian Terrorism”

Provincial Government/ Ministry of Interior

“Resolving issues of Afghan Refugees”

Ministry of States & Frontier Regions

“Revamping the Criminal Justice System”

Ministry of Law & Justice/ Provincial Government

- Visible improvement in law & order situation in Punjab
- Target Killing down by 97%
- Murder down by 87%
- Terrorism down by 98%
- Robberies down by 52%
- Weapons recovered 33.37%
- Registered significant decline in terrorism, crime, and improvement in law and order

- Surrendered & Reconciliation/ Rehabilitation of Facraris/outlaws in progress.

Number of Year Incidents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Incidents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2016</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2017</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total 676

- Federal Cabinet approved the Repatriation & Management Policy
- POR cards valid up to December, 2017, visa forms developed. Tripartite agreement for voluntary repatriation has been extended for an additional year.
- The Ministry of States & Frontier Regions in consultation with NADRA has finalized an Operational Plan for documentation of unregistered Afghan refugees.
- Draft National Refugee Law has been developed and shared with relevant stakeholders.
- Draft National Refugee Law has been developed and shared with relevant stakeholders.
- NACTA conducted Nine (9) meetings of Provincial Representatives since May 2016
- One (1) week workshop of the Federal Core Group in April 2017
- Developed Recommendation for Revamping of Criminal Justice system, its implementation plan, along with responsibilities, timelines, and cost elements
- Sector wise: Police, Prosecution, Prison, Parole & Probation and Judiciary, through consensus and in coordination with provinces
Analysis of Violent Extremist Attacks

To obtain a deeper comprehension and gain a clear perspective of the extremist violence within Pakistan I first recorded and graphed the fatalities that were a result of terrorist violence within Pakistan between the years 2001 through 2017. In the graphs below, I have complied, based on secondary data, the number of deaths that resulted from terrorist violence in Pakistan between the years of 2001 and 2017. In table 1 through table 4, I have provided a general overview of the number of civilian, military/security personnel, and terrorist fatalities by terrorist violence for the years ranging between 2003 and 2017. In tables 5 through 19, I have provided a more in-depth analysis of the number of fatalities as a result of extremist violence. Specifically, I have compiled, based on secondary data, the number of casualties of civilians, security personnel, and extremist for each specific month of the years ranging from 2003 through 2017.

In the below table, I have summarized the differences between Civilians, Military/Security Personnel, and Extremist deaths for the years ranging between 2003 and 2006. As the table reveals, in 2003 a total of 189 fatalities as a result of extremist violence were recorded in Pakistan. In 2004, a total of 863 fatalities due to extremist violence were recorded in Pakistan. In 2005, 648 fatalities in Pakistan were a result of extremist attacks throughout Pakistan. In 2006, a total of 1,471 fatalities were recorded in Pakistan that were a direct result of extremist violence. Based on the data findings, in these four years, the table supports that a significant portion of the fatalities were civilians. Specifically, 51% of the fatalities between 2003 and 2006 were civilian
casualties. 30% of the fatalities between 2003 and 2006 were extremist casualties. In addition, 19% of the fatalities between 2003 and 2006 were security personnel.

![Number of Deaths in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence (2003 – 2006)](image)

**Figure 6.** Number of Deaths in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence (2003 – 2006)

*Note.* Source: South Asian Terrorism Portal & Institute for Conflict Management

In the below table, I have summarized the differences between Civilians, Military/Security Personnel, and Extremist deaths for the years ranging between 2007 and 2010. As the table reveals, in 2007 a total of 3,598 fatalities because of extremist violence were recorded in Pakistan. In 2008, a total of 6,715 fatalities due to extremist violence were recorded in Pakistan. In 2009, 11,704 fatalities in Pakistan were a result of extremist attacks throughout Pakistan. In 2010, a total of 7,435 fatalities were recorded in Pakistan that were a direct result of extremist violence. Based on the data findings, in these four years, the table supports that a significant portion of the fatalities were extremist. Specifically, 64% of the fatalities between 2007 and 2010 were extremist.
casualties. 26% of the fatalities between 2007 and 2010 were civilian casualties. In addition, 10% of the fatalities between 2007 and 2010 were security personnel.

**Figure 7.** Number of Deaths in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence (2007 – 2010)

*Note.* Source: South Asian Terrorism Portal & Institute for Conflict Management

In Error! Reference source not found., I have summarized the differences between Civilians, Military/Security Personnel, and Extremist deaths for the years ranging between 2011 and 2014. As the table reveals, in 2011 a total of 6,303 fatalities because of extremist violence were recorded in Pakistan. In 2012, a total of 6,211 fatalities due to extremist violence were recorded in Pakistan. In 2013, 5,379 fatalities in Pakistan were a result of extremist attacks throughout Pakistan. In 2014, a total of 5,496 fatalities were recorded in Pakistan that were a direct result of extremist violence. Based on the data findings, in these four years, the table supports that a significant portion of the fatalities were civilians. Specifically, 43% of the fatalities between 2011 and 2014 were extremist casualties. 45% of the fatalities between 2011 and 2014 were civilian
casualties. In addition, 12% of the fatalities between 2011 and 2014 were security personnel.

![Number of Deaths in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence](image)

*Figure 8. Number of Deaths in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence (2011 – 2014)*

*Note.* Source: South Asian Terrorism Portal & Institute for Conflict Management

In *Error! Reference source not found.*, I have summarized the differences between Civilians, Military/Security Personnel, and Extremist deaths for the years ranging between 2015 and 2017. As the table reveals, in 2015 a total of 3,682 fatalities because of extremist violence were recorded in Pakistan. In 2016, a total of 1,803 fatalities due to extremist violence were recorded in Pakistan. In 2017, 1260 fatalities in Pakistan were a result of extremist attacks throughout Pakistan. Based on the data findings, in these four years, the table supports that a significant portion of the fatalities were extremists. Specifically, 57% of the fatalities between 2015 and 2017 were extremist casualties. 31% of the fatalities between 2015 and 2017 were civilian
casualties. In addition, 12% of the fatalities between 2011 and 2014 were security personnel.

![Number of Deaths in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence (2015 – 2017)](image)

**Figure 9.** Number of Deaths in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence (2015 – 2017)

**Note.** Source: South Asian Terrorism Portal & Institute for Conflict Management

The figures presented in **Error! Reference source not found.** were collected from the South Asian Terrorism Portal and Institute for Conflict Management, which gather their data from various news sources. As a result of the restricted access for news media agencies and civil society institutions in operational zones, the Pakistani military’s numbers are the only official figures available that the media have to report. However, through a holistic historical critical analysis, I was able to compile and cross-check numerous casualties for civilians, security forces personnel, and extremists for each of the twelve (12) months in the years ranging between 2003 through 2017.

In the year of 2003, a total of one-hundred and forty (140) Civilian casualties occurred as a result of extremist violence in Pakistan. Twenty-four (24) Security forces
personnel were killed because of extremist violence. As well as, twenty-five (25) extremists were recorded killed for the year. A total of one-hundred and eighty-nine (189) casualties were a direct result of violent extremist attacks within the borders of Pakistan. The findings show that 74% of the casualties because of violent extremist attacks were civilians in the year 2003. 8% of the fatalities in 2003 because of violent extremist attacks were made up of security forces personnel. Finally, 13% of the deaths because of violent extremist attacks were violent extremist.

![Figure 10. 2003 In-depth Analysis of Body Count in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence](image)

*Note. Source: South Asian Terrorism Portal & Institute for Conflict Management*

In the year of 2004 Error! Reference source not found. reveals, a total of four hundred and thirty-five (435) Civilian casualties occurred as a result of extremist violence in Pakistan. One hundred and eighty-four (184) Security forces personnel were killed because of extremist violence. As well as, two hundred and forty-four (244) extremists were recorded killed for the year. A total eight hundred and sixty-three (863) casualties
were a direct result of violent extremist attacks within the borders of Pakistan. The findings show that 50% of the casualties because of violent extremist attacks were civilians in the year 2004. 21% of the fatalities in 2004 because of violent extremist attacks were made up of security forces personnel. Finally, 28% of the deaths because of violent extremist attacks were violent extremist.

![2004 In-depth Analysis of Body Count in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence](image)

**Figure 11.** 2004 In-depth Analysis of Body Count in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence

*Note.* Source: South Asian Terrorism Portal & Institute for Conflict Management

In the year of 2005 the below table shows, a total of four hundred and thirty (430) Civilian casualties occurred as a result of extremist violence in Pakistan. Eighty-one (81) Security forces personnel were killed because of extremist violence. As well as, one hundred and thirty-seven (137) extremists were recorded killed for the year. A total six hundred and forty-eight (648) casualties were a direct result of violent extremist attacks within the borders of Pakistan. The findings show that 66% of the casualties because of violent extremist attacks were civilians in the year 2005. 13% of the fatalities in 2005
because of violent extremist attacks were made up of security forces personnel. Finally, 21% of the deaths because of violent extremist attacks were violent extremist.

![Figure 12. 2005 In-depth Analysis of Body Count in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence](image)

*Note.* Source: South Asian Terrorism Portal & Institute for Conflict Management

In the year of 2006 the below table shows, a total of six hundred and eight (608) Civilian casualties occurred as a result of extremist violence in Pakistan. Three hundred and twenty-five (325) Security forces personnel were killed because of extremist violence. As well as, five hundred and thirty-eight (538) extremists were recorded killed for the year. A total one thousand-four hundred and seventy-one (1,471) casualties were a direct result of violent extremist attacks within the borders of Pakistan. The findings show that 41% of the casualties because of violent extremist attacks were civilians in the year 2006. 22% of the fatalities in 2006 because of violent extremist attacks were made up of security forces personnel. Finally, 37% of the deaths because of violent extremist attacks were violent extremist.
In the year of 2007 the below table shows, a total of one thousand - five hundred and twenty-two (1,522) Civilian casualties occurred as a result of extremist violence in Pakistan. Five hundred and ninety-seven (597) Security forces personnel were killed because of extremist violence. As well as, one thousand – four hundred and seventy-nine (1,479) extremists were recorded killed for the year. A total three thousand - five hundred and ninety-eight (3,598) casualties were a direct result of violent extremist attacks within the borders of Pakistan. The findings show that 42% of the casualties because of violent extremist attacks were civilians in the year 2007. 17% of the fatalities in 2007 because of violent extremist attacks were made up of security forces personnel. Finally, 41% of the deaths because of violent extremist attacks were violent extremist.
Figure 14. 2007 In-depth Analysis of Body Count in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence

Note. Source: South Asian Terrorism Portal & Institute for Conflict Management

In the year of 2008 the below table shows, a total of two thousand - one hundred and fifty-five (2,155) Civilian casualties occurred as a result of extremist violence in Pakistan. Six hundred and fifty-four (654) Security forces personnel were killed because of extremist violence. As well as, three thousand – nine hundred and six (3,906) extremists were recorded killed for the year. A total six thousand - seven hundred and fifteen (6,715) casualties were a direct result of violent extremist attacks within the borders of Pakistan. The findings show that 32% of the casualties because of violent extremist attacks were civilians in the year 2008. 10% of the fatalities in 2008 because of violent extremist attacks were made up of security forces personnel. Finally, 58% of the deaths because of violent extremist attacks were violent extremist.
Figure 15. 2008 In-depth Analysis of Body Count in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence

*Note.* Source: South Asian Terrorism Portal & Institute for Conflict Management

In the year of 2009 the below table reveals, a total of two thousand - three hundred and twenty-four (2,324) Civilian casualties occurred as a result of extremist violence in Pakistan. Nine hundred and ninety-one (991) Security forces personnel were killed because of extremist violence. As well as, eight thousand – three hundred and eighty-nine (8,389) Extremists were recorded killed for the year. A total of eleven thousand - seven hundred and four (11,704) casualties were a direct result of violent extremist attacks within the borders of Pakistan. The findings show that 20% of the casualties because of violent extremist attacks were civilians in the year 2009. 9% of the fatalities in 2009 because of violent extremist attacks were made up of security forces personnel. Finally, 72% of the deaths because of violent extremist attacks were violent extremist.
Figure 16. 2009 In-depth Analysis of Body Count in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence

Note. Source: South Asian Terrorism Portal & Institute for Conflict Management

In the year of 2010 the below table reveals, a total of one thousand - seven hundred and ninety-six (1,796) Civilian casualties occurred as a result of extremist violence in Pakistan. Four hundred and sixty-nine (469) Security forces personnel were killed because of extremist violence. As well as, five thousand – one hundred and seventy (5,170) Extremists were recorded killed for the year. A total of seven thousand - four hundred and thirty-five (7,435) casualties were a direct result of violent extremist attacks within the borders of Pakistan. The findings show that 24% of the casualties because of violent extremist attacks were civilians in the year 2010. 6% of the fatalities in 2010 because of violent extremist attacks were made up of security forces personnel. Finally, 70% of the deaths because of violent extremist attacks were violent extremist.
Figure 17. 2010 In-depth Analysis of Body Count in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence

Note. Source: South Asian Terrorism Portal & Institute for Conflict Management

In the year of 2011 the below table reveals, a total of two thousand - seven hundred and thirty-eight (2,738) Civilian casualties occurred as a result of extremist violence in Pakistan. Seven hundred and sixty-five (765) Security forces personnel were killed because of extremist violence. As well as, two thousand – eight hundred (2,800) Extremists were recorded killed for the year. A total of six thousand - three hundred and three (6,303) casualties were a direct result of violent extremist attacks within the borders of Pakistan. The findings show that 43% of the casualties because of violent extremist attacks were civilians in the year 2011. 12% of the fatalities in 2011 because of violent extremist attacks were made up of security forces personnel. Finally, 44% of the deaths because of violent extremist attacks were violent extremist.
In the year of 2012 the below table reveals, a total of three thousand and seven (3,007) Civilian casualties occurred as a result of extremist violence in Pakistan. Seven hundred and thirty-two (732) Security forces personnel were killed because of extremist violence. As well as, two thousand – four hundred and seventy-two (2,472) Extremists were recorded killed for the year. A total of six thousand - two hundred and eleven (6,211) casualties were a direct result of violent extremist attacks within the borders of Pakistan. The findings show that 48% of the casualties because of violent extremist attacks were civilians in the year 2012. 12% of the fatalities in 2009 because of violent extremist attacks were made up of security forces personnel. Finally, 40% of the deaths because of violent extremist attacks were violent extremist.
Figure 19. 2012 In-depth Analysis of Body Count in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence

Note. Source: South Asian Terrorism Portal & Institute for Conflict Management

In the year of 2013 the below table shows, a total of three thousand and one (3,001) Civilian casualties occurred as a result of extremist violence in Pakistan. Six hundred and seventy-six (676) Security forces personnel were killed because of extremist violence. As well as, one thousand – seven hundred and two (1,702) Extremists were recorded killed for the year. A total of five thousand - three hundred and seventy-nine (5,379) casualties were a direct result of violent extremist attacks within the borders of Pakistan. The findings show that 56% of the casualties because of violent extremist attacks were civilians in the year 2013. 13% of the fatalities in 2013 because of violent extremist attacks were made up of security forces personnel. Finally, 32% of the deaths because of violent extremist attacks were violent extremist.
Figure 20. 2013 In-depth Analysis of Body Count in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence

Note. Source: South Asian Terrorism Portal & Institute for Conflict Management

In the year of 2014 table 16 shows, a total of one thousand - seven hundred and eighty-one (1,781) Civilian casualties occurred as a result of extremist violence in Pakistan. Five hundred and thirty-three (533) Security forces personnel were killed because of extremist violence. As well as, three thousand – one hundred and eighty-two (3,182) Extremists were recorded killed for the year. A total of five thousand - four hundred and ninety-six (5,496) casualties were a direct result of violent extremist attacks within the borders of Pakistan. The findings show that 32% of the casualties because of violent extremist attacks were civilians in the year 2014. 10% of the fatalities in 2014 because of violent extremist attacks were made up of security forces personnel. Finally, 58% of the deaths because of violent extremist attacks were violent extremist.
In the year of 2015 the below table shows, a total of nine hundred and forty (940) Civilian casualties occurred as a result of extremist violence in Pakistan. Three hundred and thirty-nine (339) Security forces personnel were killed because of extremist violence. As well as, two thousand – four hundred and three (2,403) Extremists were recorded killed for the year. A total of three thousand - six hundred and eighty-two (3,682) casualties were a direct result of violent extremist attacks within the borders of Pakistan. The findings show that 26% of the casualties because of violent extremist attacks were civilians in the year 2015. 9% of the fatalities in 2015 because of violent extremist attacks were made up of security forces personnel. Finally, 65% of the deaths because of violent extremist attacks were violent extremist.

Figure 21. 2014 In-depth Analysis of Body Count in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence

Note. Source: South Asian Terrorism Portal & Institute for Conflict Management
Figure 22. 2015 In-depth Analysis of Body Count in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence

*Note.* Source: South Asian Terrorism Portal & Institute for Conflict Management

In the year of 2016 the below table shows, a total of six hundred and twelve (612) Civilian casualties occurred as a result of extremist violence in Pakistan. Two hundred and ninety-three (293) Security forces personnel were killed because of extremist violence. As well as, eight hundred and ninety-eight (898) Extremists were recorded killed for the year. A total of one thousand - eight hundred and three (1,803) casualties were a direct result of violent extremist attacks within the borders of Pakistan. The findings show that 34% of the casualties because of violent extremist attacks were civilians in the year 2016. 16% of the fatalities in 2016 because of violent extremist attacks were made up of security forces personnel. Finally, 50% of the deaths because of violent extremist attacks were violent extremist.
In the year of 2017 the below table reveals, a total of five hundred and forty (540) Civilian casualties occurred as a result of extremist violence in Pakistan. Two hundred and eight (208) Security forces personnel were killed because of extremist violence. As well as, five hundred and twelve (512) Extremists were recorded killed for the year. A total of one thousand - two hundred and sixty (1,260) casualties were a direct result of violent extremist attacks within the borders of Pakistan. The findings show that 43% of the casualties because of violent extremist attacks were civilians in the year 2017. 17% of the fatalities in 2017 because of violent extremist attacks were made up of security forces personnel. Finally, 41% of the deaths because of violent extremist attacks were violent extremist.
Figure 24. 2017 In-depth Analysis of Body Count in Pakistan by Terrorist Violence

Note. Source: South Asian Terrorism Portal & Institute for Conflict Management

Results/Findings

In 2014 on the 16th of December, the Army Public School massacre caused a political transformation across numerous religious and nonreligious political parties in Pakistan. For the first time, in the history of Pakistan, these parties congregated and sought to find a concrete solution to counter violent extremism. Three (3) specific religious and nonreligious political parties stood out throughout the data analysis process that are worth mentioning. To begin, the Jamaat-e-Islami (JI) which is an Islamic political organization that formed in the year of 1941. The Jamaat-e-Islami fall within the boundaries of being a social conservative movement. The Jamaat-e-Islami was one of the first few organizations that believed to be in alignment with the modernization of Islam and embraced such ideology. Secondly, the Jamiat Ulema-e-Islam (JUI-F) which is based in Pakistan and is recognized as a Sunni Deobandi party within the realm of politics.
Finally, the Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf (PTI), which is another party within Pakistan’s political realm, is rapidly expanding and growing in influence. The PTI consider themselves as an *anti-status quo* group.

Social disorganization can be portrayed in numerous fashions, however the clearest way to describe it is, the inability of members within a social group to individually regulate or to reach a consensus on their social groups values and together problem solve mutually experienced concerns. Hence, a socially disorganized region is a region in which the members of such community do not have the ability or means to counter crime and deviance because they are unable, as a group, to acknowledge the spreading shared norms. In alignment with Durkheim, when individuals lack the fear of structural or informal punishment, these same community members allow themselves to mayhem in pursuit of their own self-interest while completely disregarding the legal ramifications of their actions and behaviors.

Based on the findings, the Jamaat-e-Islami, the Jamiat Ulema-e-Islam, and the Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf were all three seeking to reconcile with the Tehrik-i-Taliban Pakistan (TTP). The Tehrik-i-Taliban Pakistan is a simplified reference name for the overarching Taliban Movement occurring within Pakistan. In addition, Jamaat-e-Islami, the Jamiat Ulema-e-Islam, and the Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf also were hesitant to condemn additional school massacres but following another school massacre they ultimately united together to problem-solve and take proper measures against such type of attacks in the future. In addition, the Pakistan People’s Party (PPP), the Pashtunkhwa Milli Awami Party (PMAP), the Awami National Party (ANP), and numerous other political parties united together in support of the designing, implementation, and
enforcement of countering violent extremism initiatives. Furthermore, all these organizations set aside their individual positions, and collaborated in furthering a mutual interest they all had; which was collaborating with the Pakistan Muslim League Nawaz (PML-N) government and giving their unquestionable support in countering violent extremism within Pakistan.

Throughout the data analysis process, it became evident that even though numerous attacks were conducted continuously that resembled the Army Public School massacre, the Pakistani government, the Pakistani military, various significant political parties, and subject matter experts within the Pakistani security personnel continued to unquestionably believe that the National Action Plan (NAP) was and still is an effective holistic strategy to counter violent extremism. In alignment with this belief, various political parties, media sources, subject matter experts, and the government of Pakistan firmly take the stance that the only avenue to win the war against violent extremism is if, and only if, the National Action Plan is embraced and enforced one hundred percent in Islamabad (Rizvi, 2016; ANP, 2015; Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf, 2015). Within the government of Pakistan, various Parliament Members (PM) representatives of Pakistani political parties relied on the ongoing narrative that the Pakistani military “use all necessary means” to effectively rid Pakistan of violent extremism in “all its forms and manifestations;” thereby the National Assembly enacted and implemented both the twenty-first (21) Constitutional Amendment and the Pakistan Army Act of 2015 (NAP, 2015).

Furthermore, throughout the National Assembly’s Army Public School massacre open dialogue, various political representatives recognized and addressed the concern
that since the 1980s, the state of Pakistan consciously stood behind in support of numerous Afghan extremist groups throughout their conflict with the former Soviet Union in Afghanistan. In addition, such behavior had not changed since the 1980s because the state of Pakistan continues to support these extremist groups till this day. According to data analyzed, an overwhelming portion of the Pakistani government and Pakistani Members of Parliament strongly agree that long-term stability in Afghanistan will have a domino effect and lead to peace in Pakistan; which would be in the Pakistani government’s “best interests” (The News, 2016; Express Tribune, 2015; Dawn, 2015). In addition, data was found in which the President of Pakistan, the Prime Minister of Pakistan, the Pakistani Army Chief, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Pakistan, and two Pashtun nationalist political parties in Pakistan also were in support of helping Afghanistan achieve stability in hopes of Pakistan reaching peace. The two Pashtun nationalist political parties are the (1) Awami National Party and the (2) Pashtunkhwa Milli Awami Party.

Even though the Awami National Party and the Pashtunkhwa Milli Awami Party firmly take the position that Islamabad is the invisible hand behind Afghanistan’s political affairs by aiding the “good Taliban,” both the Awami National Party and the Pashtunkhwa Milli Awami Party advocate that the only way Pakistan can get rid of extremist violence is if Afghanistan reaches stability. Both political parties debate and reiterate that long-term stability and political violence within Pakistan is a ripple effect of the Afghan policy currently held by Islamabad. Interestingly, various members of the Pakistani government, critiques, and subject matter experts in Pakistan, including journalists, shine light on the fact that the Taliban and other violent extremist groups have
been provided financial support, skillfully trained, and given resources. These monetary gains, training lessons, and resources were provided by the government of Pakistan, the Pakistani Military, and Pakistan’s Inter-Services Intelligence (ISI) agency, and have created a “Frankenstein Monster” which no one is able to control and is unable to stop it from turning on its creator (Filkins, 2016; Walsh, 2009).

Post the National Action Plan and taking ownership of the failures of the previous years, the Pakistani government and the Pakistani military shifted their position and embraced a narrative that did not separate “good and bad Taliban.” Instead, their narratives focused on the mediation and facilitation of Kabul’s resolution process with the Taliban in Afghanistan. Thusly, this new position augmented the countering violent extremism narrative that the government of Pakistan implemented. In 2015, adamant to prove it was taking a firm stance against violent extremist groups, the military of Pakistan provided numerous press releases informing the people of Pakistan and the global viewers of the operational killings of “terrorists” and legal sentencing of extremist members to death after military court “trials.” In one instance, the Pakistani military informed viewers and listeners that in December of 2015 the military had actively killed 3,400 violent extremists in their quest to rid the state of violence (The Express Tribune, 2015); this narrative also emphasized that a majority of the killing occurred in the Khyber provinces of FATA and in North Waziristan. According to data gathered throughout the analysis process, the military of Pakistan flaunted their statistical records for the month of December in 2015 and emphasized that they had “phenomenal successes” in fragmenting the “backbone of the terrorists” (ISPR, 2015).
Theoretical Findings

Michel Foucault advocates that narratives are historical and generate knowledge that mingles and runs parallel with power. Hence, narratives are historical and ultimately causes an effect in which power is transmitted (Foucault, 1980). Arguably, both power and knowledge are interconnected, and it would be unreasonable to speculate or philosophize of a moment in which knowledge produced will stop to rely or depend on power (Foucault, 1980, p. 51 – 52). Thusly, the relationship between power and knowledge function in such a fashion that governs the leading and domineering truth and normality through the division and marginalization of opposing/differing voices, perspectives, and truths (Newman, 2005). Furthermore, the narratives of countering violent extremism operate in a similar fashion. In other words, the narratives of countering violent extremism without a doubt marginalizes and takes away their voice from being heard, and in the event that their voice is acknowledged a deviation occurs (Newman, 2005). The redirection does not attempt to reflectively listen and comprehend the position and interests of the violent extremist and militant phenomena; and/or their belief in their reality normality interpretation. The deviation, on the contrary, fails to implement the conflict resolution process, and instead exploits the “evils” of violent extremism that instill fear and division (Newman, 2005). Hence, the advocates and individuals analyzing terrorism based solely on their actions, accept the notion of violent extremism as a sort of “evil” reality, thereby dictating from the beginning a moral criticism regardless of any investigation or critical analysis (Newman, 2005). Thereby, failing to take into consideration or acknowledging the gaps, hinderances, and the phenomena(s) that are intertwined and hidden within the domineering narrative.
In regard to the Army Public School massacre, the events resorted in the state of Pakistan and community members advocating for a transformation. The need for such a transformation united the Pakistani government and the Pakistani people against violent extremism and, arguably, repressed any and all micro, countering, and nonconforming discourse that challenged the state of Pakistan and their capability/legitimacy to overcome and put an end to violent extremism. For Pakistan, being in the position that most benefited from countering violent extremism sentiments, designed, agreed upon, and enforced the National Action Plan. As a result, intentionally or unintentionally, the National Action Plan is a type of extremism itself, parallel to the extremism by extremist actors, where in which it is virtually impossible to distinguish from violence enacted in legislature, entities, and sovereign power of the State as an actor. As scholars and philosophers have theorized, if violent extremism can be viewed/portrayed as an act to instill fear within another individual/group, then logic dictates that the same can be said about the actions of state terrorism and non-state terrorism (Lefort, 1988). Hence, the National Action Plan, as a whole, is a symbol of legalization of the coercive power that can be designed and enforced by the state as an actor to use towards any and all of its enemies that threaten its stability/peace.

Thusly, with the “legally” unveiled and enforced law, which can be viewed as terror, ultimately seeks, labels, and structures opponents/enemies of the State and fuels more conflict in opposition; which is an attempt to deviate from the reality and uncertainty of the State’s very own foundation. Hence, following the Army Public School massacre, the Pakistani government and military discursively formed an enemy that was to be portrayed as evil at all costs and dehumanized the enemy through its narrative.
According to the data collected and analyzed, the National Assembly dialogues while in session revealed what the Army Public School massacre represented was in actually a “wicked,” “inhuman,” “monstrous,” and “evil” event in the history of Pakistan that lead to loss of lives of numerous “innocent schoolchildren.” Therefore, the labeling and portrayal of the Tehrik-i-Taliban was one of an “enemy” to the State of Pakistan, that grew in threat significance with each state legislature from the past and present (National Assembly of Pakistan, 2015). Incidentally, it was Pakistan whom portrayed the Tehrik-i-Taliban as an extremist organization that was against the state, however it was also Pakistan whom during the same era distinguished the Tehrik-i-Taliban from other extremist groups conducting attacks within the Afghanistan borders.

With Pakistan’s new 21st Constitutional Amendment seeking to counter violent extremism, any and all potential opposing enemies of Afghanistan ultimately shift to also enemies of Pakistan. Therefore, the all-time ruling conventional wisdom of the differing bad and good extremist is put to an end. Such a shift is critical to address because it is a vital element of two crucial narratives. In the first, with the shift to allying themselves against Afghanistan enemies, the State of Pakistan is giving legitimacy to the narrative of the “Frankenstein’s Monster” theory many critiques and individuals of the government shared. In the second, with the shift of enemies the State of Pakistan is also giving credibility and legitimacy to the cause-and-effect theory that in order for Pakistan to reach stability, Afghanistan must first achieve long-term peace.

Hence, the decision to implement the twenty-first amendment to counter violent extremism into the Pakistani Constitution is the first true acknowledgement that Pakistan is beginning to embrace the notion that knowledge revealed in discourses relies on and is
connected to power. Contrary to the Pakistani government’s actions prior to the October 2014 School Massacre, the government of Pakistan, can be argued, shifted its position from viewing power and knowledge as opposites of one another or the ends of a spectrum. Without a doubt, formally introducing the twenty-first amendment into the constitution after the October 2014 school massacre was the State’s attempt at exerting power and using power as a force, but not a force that sought to inflict pain or torture individuals, on the contrary, it was a force that sought to mold subjects and subjectivity.

**Data Findings**

The analysis conducted on the Pakistani countering violent extremism narrative, 21st Constitutional Amendment, presents a differing point of view from the represented realities from both the Pakistani political realm and the top brass in Pakistani military. Although the focus of this dissertation was the North-West province of Peshawar Pakistan, data collected and analyzed revealed that an alarming amount of most of the attacks by violent extremist occurred within two specific regions since 2001; (1) the Federally Administered Tribal Areas and (2) Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. When I specifically observe suicide bombings since 2001, the data shows that more than 460 attacks by violent extremist have occurred within the borders of Pakistan. A closer look into those 460 suicide bombing attacks reveals, based on the data gathered, that 344 suicide bombing attacks were conducted in the regions of the Federally Administered Tribal Areas, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, and in Baluchistan (Pakistan Body Count, 2016). A significant portion of the suicide bombings conducted by violent extremist in Sindh were actively conducted in areas heavily populated by Pashtun provinces of Karachi. In addition, attacks were also found in various regions of Baluchistan, which coincidentally
a significant number of Pashtuns or Shia Hazaras populate (South Asia Terrorism Portal, 2016). Data analyzed supports that had the extremists specifically focused their attacks in various Punjab regions, a high significant of those victimized would be Pashtuns, religious minorities, and individuals mostly associated with the lower portion of the middle class (South Asia Terrorism, 2016).

If I analyze the data from a differing perspective, in this case, to observe the number of individuals dead in all extremist attacks in Pakistan, the data supports that north of 20,000 innocent bystanders were killed between 2003 through 2016. In addition, the data supports the notion that those same civilians killed between 2003 through 2016 were mostly Pashtuns or religious minorities. Also, between the years of 2003 through 2016 over 6,000 Pakistani security personnel lost their lives due to attacks and conflicts (South Asia Terrorism, 2016(b)). On the other side of that coin, for more than a decade, violent extremists continually attack Afghanistan’s government and security personnel, various worldwide troops, and members of the public throughout the entire country (South Asia Terrorism, 2016(b)). According to the data gathered and analyzed, the findings support that in reality the Monster (Taliban) of Pakistan was not in fact attacking/targeting the Master; the Master being the State of Pakistan and the various institutions of the State, such as the government of Pakistan, the Pakistani military, or the Inter-Services Intelligence. However, the data supports that the Pakistani Monster (Taliban) does roam freely and does in fact consistently conduct attacks indiscriminately within the Afghan borders.

Hence, the findings support that the narrative constructed about both the Monster (Taliban) and the Master (the State of Pakistan) is a conflict, not in theory but in actual
practice. Without a doubt, it is conventional wisdom that the Pakistani Taliban (*Monster*) have in the past engaged and attacked the (1) Pakistani military General Headquarters located in Rawalpindi, (2) the Naval Base that is located in Karachi, and (3) has effectively plotted and executed the attack on the Army Public School children and teachers in Peshawar Pakistan. Such behavior and attacks, based on the data findings, have assisted the state of Pakistan in accomplishing their political agenda that falls outside of the boundaries of terrorism.

Primarily, similar styles of attacks by the Taliban assist the Pakistani State to mold and redesign status-quo challengers to the state to establish a solid ground and meaning whenever the violent extremist narrative is distorted. Next, once an enemy is clearly defined and established, the state (*Pakistan*) can pull down the veil of ignorance to hide the failures and clear paradoxes by aggressively flexing its power abilities; attempting to exhibit itself as vengeful and in accordance with the long-term goal of eradicating violent extremism. Hence this sort of power can be implemented in two various fashions. One, it can be coercive, such as the operations of military assaults. Two, it can be disciplinary, such as the construction or reconstruction of new legislation, laws, or policies that must be followed without all parties buy-in. Two differing styles of power that are in alignment with Foucauldian philosophy. Following the construction of an enemy, the state (*Pakistan*) constructs and presents narratives that instill fear, a sense of insecurity, and an endangered sovereignty. A narrative that rationalizes the states very own acts of viciousness and mayhems from eras before, the current times, and/or any and all upcoming acts through the newly designed, crafted, and enforced legal frameworks. Arguably, similar to the course of actions that the Pakistani state did with the creation and
enforcement of the National Action Plan following the 2014 Army Public School massacre.

Furthermore, by the state representing itself as one of many victims of violent extremism and by revealing a high body count of deaths and collateral damage, the state is able to achieve sympathy and monetary aid from international governments and institutions. While also, obtaining critical evidence that supports the claim that the threat/enemy falls external to its own borders (Pakistan), legitimizes and offers credibility to the narrative that what occurs within Pakistan is a ripple effect from the instability of what occurs within the Afghan borders. In the end, the narrative constructed by the state becomes so powerful that it not only gets buy-in from the masses, but also cloaks various vital episodes. To elaborate more vividly, because the state narrative legitimizes the enforcement of coercive power to counter a threatening opponent, the people of the state ordinarily are oblivious to the significant dislodgment of individuals in regions in which the military/security personnel perform daily operations to rid the state of extremists. Furthermore, through the increase in legitimization of power and authority for the military and the government, the masses are oblivious to the new and alarming number of security protocols that, in actuality, hinder and chip away the freedom of these same individuals; freedoms that they actively depend on the government and military to provide, recognize, and protect.

Evidence supports the notion that for more than a decade Pakistan has been in constant conflict with Afghanistan because of broken-down Afghan policies that have allowed violent extremist to roam freely in mayhem within the Pakistani borders. Despite that, various politicians, analysts, subject matter experts, and government members hold
accountable various state entities to acknowledge and enforce the National Action Plan and unite in the war against violent extremist in the Federally Administered Tribal Areas. The dialogue sessions held by the Pakistani National Assembly members following the Army Public School massacre and the National Action Plan 20-point strategy are evident examples of how various political parties across the spectrum in Pakistan unanimously congregated, mediated, facilitated, and reached a consensus on the creation of military courts. While, arguably, simultaneously overshadowing the present justice apparatus found within the Pakistani Constitution. The findings support that the Pakistani government relinquished its governing power and provided monetary backing to the Pakistani military, thereby legitimately and judicially facilitating the human rights violations; while also granting immunity for all the previously executed actions in the years prior (Amnesty International, 2016; 2004; Human Rights Watch, 2011). From a bigger picture context, the assembly delegated its power to the Pakistani military and Pakistani government in such a fashion that directly defied the very existence of democracy in Pakistan. The findings support that over more than one year since the countering violent extremism narrative and the National Action Plan, the Pakistani state is actively collaborating with groups not associated with the state; specifically, in three areas, (1) within the Pakistani borders, (2) within Afghanistan borders, and (3) within India’s borders. In addition, the nonstate group collaboration has provided the countering violent extremism narrative a deeper meaning and credibility.

As a result, throughout the content analysis this dissertation study is shining a light on five (5) key themes. In the following pages, it is my goal to present my findings. Although the themes are in numerical order, the themes are not presented by their level of
importance, significance, or ranking. The researcher presents the themes based on the organizational structure he used throughout the gathering, sorting, and data analysis process.

**Theme 1 – Word-Based Agency**

A key trait of the National Action Plan 20-Points is that the document itself mimics a self-sustaining and self-managing system. A body of individuals, whereby each individual adapts themselves to their surrounding social atmosphere can, and would be, categorized as a self-organizing system (Umpleby, 2007). From a strategy perspective, the countering violent extremism amendment process began days following the December 16, 2014 Army Public School massacre, when the Pakistani Parliament consisting of both the Senate House and the National Assembly congregated to negotiate how the January 5, 2015 countering violent extremism amendment would be designed, implemented, and enforced.

The creation and enforcement of the 21st amendment is self-authorizing by its very nature, hence I argue that to begin to understand the 21st amendment we must acknowledge the amendment within the context of strategy boundaries. Essentially, the countering violent extremism 21st amendment strategy expressed and reveals its own vitalness, specifically when analyzed within the parameters of meta-text; for example, the points expressing and defining the resolution and ideas of the goal. The most evident representations are points such as the ones below:

- (1) Implementation of death sentence of those convicted in cases of terrorism.
- (2) Special trial courts under the supervision of the Army. The duration of these courts would be two years.
Yet, it should not go unnoticed that the concept of self-authorization is, without a doubt, also communicated in more subtle styles throughout different points of the National Action Plan 20-Points. Such as in the citation below:

- (19) Formulation of a comprehensive policy to deal with the issue of Afghan refugees, beginning with registration of all refugees.
- (12) Administrative and development reforms in FATA with immediate focus on repatriation of IDPs.
- (9) Taking effective steps against religious persecution.

Critical here are the propositions which make reference to “effective steps,” “administrative and development reforms,” and “comprehensive policy.” In the first National Action Point bullet above (19), “formulation of a comprehensive policy to deal with the issue of Afghan refugees, beginning with registration of all refugees” creates a chronological structure in which policy comes first and what follows are instruments for the enactment of the policy. In the second bullet point, “administrative and development reforms in FATA with immediate focus on repatriation of IDPs” the impact is expressed in a more concrete and central fashion. The role of FATA is to be adjusted to the necessities of the overall policy/strategy. I argue, that such assertions in the National Action Plan 20-Points had key implications for the power interconnectedness of the several players involved. Specifically, on the implications firming up the position of the Pakistani administration with respect to the Pakistani politicians.

Ultimately, the influence of the 21st amendment strategic goals are clearly portrayed by how the document is manipulated as a point of reference throughout subsequent decision-making; including the legitimization of behaviors/actions by the
Pakistani government. Without a doubt, the 21st amendment, essentially, attempts to legitimize a comprehensive rationalization of countering violent extremism, which secondary level data reveals that such an objective would not have been contemplated nor realistic without the new policy/strategy. As the Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif put it:

“This bill is about military courts trying hardcore terrorists who kill Pakistanis…. This is an important day for Pakistan when the nation decided that terrorists will be taken out from the roots.”

Syed Khursheed Ahmen Shah, a veteran Pakistan People’s Party leader of the Opposition within the National Assembly described it as follows:

“We have not been in favor of military courts in the past but the Pakistani public’s safety is our priority and it is the government’s responsibility to keep the masses safe in this country.”

As a result, the National Action Plan 20-Points, as a strategic document, is a word-based agent, an actor that is able to influence and generate actions and behavior internally and externally regardless of borders (Cooren, Matte, Taylor, & Vasquez, 2007; Cooren, 2006; Robichaud, 2006). Worth mentioning, the creation of such written agency was, nevertheless, significantly reliant on its mobilization in the negotiation and facilitation dialogues by the stakeholders; both the National Assembly and the Senate House.

Theme 2 – Knowledge & Governance

According to the analysis, another vital element of the Pakistani countering violent extremism 21st amendment is the implementation of strategic conflict resolution and security/governance terminology. In this dissertation, I argue the vocabulary used not
only facilitated, but also nourished the resolution stages connected with how to debate countering violent extremism within Pakistan, how to draft up the amendment and policies, and how to understand the finalized document of the countering violent extremism 21st constitutional amendment. Furthermore, I argue that the formulation process resembled a universal model of calculated planning and, as a result, was established by deliberate ideas and vocabulary. Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif described the process as follows:

“The All Parties Conference gathered to decide about the implementation of the National Action Plan, endorsed the proposed legislative measures including amendments in the Pakistan Army Act to extend its jurisdiction for speedy trial of cases under specified acts and provide the constitutional cover with a sunset clause of two years from the date of enactment.”

At first, the 21st amendment strategic language may seem simplistic and inconsequential, but I argue that it has broad insinuations within the context of a strategy to counter violent extremism. Particularly, the simplistic and inconsequential lexicon influenced the power positions of the numerous decision-makers, because I argue that some of the individuals had a greater advantage of becoming experts of the narrative expressed than the other individuals; because of various variables, such as level of education, their background, or exposure to strategic conflict resolution skills, governance and/or knowledge. As an example, one participant shared his perspective on the difficulties posed by the strategically constructed jargon during the opening speech of the 21st amendment sessions:
“No matter who it is, no one can speak against religion. The country has been a victim of terrorism for a long time. It is a sin for us to even pass laws here which go against the teachings of Prophet Muhammad” (Leader of Opposition – Syed Khursheed Ahmed Shah).

I argue, that the 21st amendment depended heavily on broad strategic conflict resolution ideas. Specifically, the terminology facilitated and served as key rhetorical pillars for the Pakistani 21st constitutional amendment. “Effective steps,” “regulation,” “administrative and development reforms,” “zero tolerance,” “logical end,” “comprehensive policy,” and “fully empowered for political reconciliation” were key vital notions that establish the foundation of a conflict resolution analysis. Revamp and reform, as a few examples, were terms deployed in an attempt to define the long-term objectives of the Pakistani decision-makers and its governmental entities. Furthermore, I argue that the same can be said about terms such as “zero tolerance,” “establishing and employing,” and “dealing firmly,” which have the capacity to play a crucial role, however that would require the Pakistani government to establish forms of assessment to track and record the progress and effectiveness of the 21st amendment. Critically, such pillars have taken the shape of a business type-strategy that coerces stakeholders of the 21st amendment to negotiate and compromise on Pakistan’s long-term countering violent extremism with a business type-strategy rationale; while also including its philosophical insinuations.

Stressing the vitalness for a need to have tangible results and understanding of ways in which Pakistan will counter violent extremism strategy, the 21st amendment attempts to incorporate numerous explanations and descriptions:
• (5) Strict action against the literature, newspapers, and magazines promoting hatred, extremism, sectarianism, and intolerance.

• (8) Establishing and deploying a dedicated counter-terrorism force.

• (11) Ban on glorification of terrorists and terrorist’s organizations through print and electronic media.

• (14) Measures against abuse of internet and social media for terrorism.

• (17) Balochistan government to be fully empowered for political reconciliation with complete ownership by all stakeholders.

In the National Action Plan points above, I argue, there is clearly an explanatory tone and mood. Such mood provides broad strategy claims which attempt to provide readers with clarity and a means by which these objectives should be held accountable. Therefore, I argue that the Pakistani 21st amendment is evidently constructed for an audience who does not inevitably comprehend strategic conflict resolution, or the rationale connected to such a specific strategy by Pakistan. Hence, I argue that such dialectal dictions are impactful and meaningful in regard to the interpersonal positioning that establishes societal and political power relationships. Stated differently, the drafters of the 21st amendment are portrayed as subject matter experts which naturally inherit subject matter expert power, however the readers are left seeking a legitimate explanation of what the newly drafted amendment reveal (Bourdieu, 1991). Within the context of a strategy, such an insinuation is the establishment of a pedagogic power interconnection, in which the insinuations portrayed are significantly difficult, borderline impossible, to challenge by anyone that has not become a subject matter expert of countering violent extremism narratives (Samra-Fredericks, 2003; Oakes, Townley, & Cooper, 1998).
Hence, I argue that the simplistic and systematic manipulation of strategized written words are overall interpreted positively by the Pakistani Senate and National Assembly, which hurriedly sought for ways to expedite and facilitate the discussion and decision-making process more comprehensive and systematic. However, numerous judges of the Supreme Court in Pakistan have voiced their reservations about the simplistic terminology and their meanings towards tangible results. Below are typical critiques from a leading Supreme Court judge against sections of the 21st amendment:

- “Our legal and constitutional history has amply demonstrated that laws can be made by parliament which does not necessarily represent the aspirations of the people. In the 2010 NRO case, the Supreme Court held that even so it is for parliament to make laws regardless of whether the same are unpopular or are based on expediency. This power to make laws (including constitutional amendments), however, is not absolute and untrammeled.” (Justice Khawaja).

- “All constitutional bodies and functionaries must have the common aim that the constitution which embodies the will of the people is enforced because this is an obligation set out in the constitution itself. It, therefore, must be accepted and implemented both in letter and in spirit with sincerity by every organ and functionary of the state.” (Justice Khawaja).

**Theme 3 - Accountability**

A third theme that stood out throughout the data analysis process focused on the prioritization of Pakistan’s strategic 21st amendment narrative regarding countering violent extremism. In this dissertation, I argue that the most vital key element of the 21st constitutional amendment narrative focuses on breaking down responsibility and holding
individuals/stakeholders accountable. The National Action Plan 20 Points does not simply focus on “revamping” and “reforming” as a broad change process within Pakistan, but it also attempts to add a new element that is broadly overlooked at a first glance. The new element being the advocacy and promotion of a new style of thinking among the citizens of Pakistan. A leader of the Opposition in the National Assembly described the manifestation of this new element as such:

“The Parliament is going to vote to save Pakistan. The bitter pill of this new law is being swallowed for the security of Pakistan. Murdering one person is like killing all humanity…… It doesn’t matter if the person is from grammar school, Aitchison or a government school – there will be no differences between any terrorists.” (Syed Khursheed Ahmed Shah)

Based on the quote above, the 21st constitutional amendment to counter violent extremism targets two vital elements; (1) the importance and demand to increase security and to counter violent extremism within Pakistan, and (2) to empower the citizens to embrace an active role in fostering accountability and enforcing the countering violent extremism narrative. From a strategic conflict resolution stance, the theme of accountability can be found in the National Action Plan 20 Points through the following points:

- (15) Zero tolerance for militancy in Punjab.
- (16) Ongoing operation in Karachi will be taken to its logical end.
- (17) Balochistan government to be fully empowered for political reconciliation with complete ownership by all stakeholders.
In the third National Action Point (17) above, the beginning portion of the sentence mentions ‘Blochistan government to be fully empowered.’ Focusing on this first chunk of the National Action Point bullet establishes meaning for the second chuck of the bullet point: Balochistan government to be fully empowered ‘for political reconciliation with complete ownership by all stakeholders.’ In this bullet point alone, the implication is that Balochistan has been empowered to meet political reconciliation and in fact has done so accordingly. Furthermore, the insinuation has been made that the accountability lies on individuals within Balochistan, but ultimately in due time a transformation will occur in the future. It is the transfer of accountability that is constructed as a new strategy, which calls on the revamping and reforming of the justice and social system, which are voiced in other bullet points of the National Action Plan. Continuing with the National Action Plan point “Balochistan government to be fully empowered for political reconciliation with complete ownership by all stakeholders,” I argue that the unavoidable demand for transformation of accountability is raised in a declarative mood. Therefore, the construction aids to factualize the state of affairs and as a result they are interpreted differently. From a local level, this bullet point could be interpreted as a promise, from a state level, the bullet point could be interpreted as an order, and from the national level this bullet point could interpreted as a threat; essentially the interpretations could vary based on reader/everyone’s education, background, beliefs, and other variables.

As previously stated, I argue that the 21st amendment narrative embodies a sense of accountability to specific stakeholders and was launched as an attempt to present a new style of thinking about countering violent extremism within Pakistan. Yet, the 21st amendment also resulted in other types of interpretations when the notion of individual
accountability and responsibility was acknowledged after the implementation and enforcement of the amendment. In the following excerpt is one of various critiques of different interpretations:

- “Terrorism fuels foreign agenda against religious seminaries in Pakistan…. They [the seminaries] have never been involved in any terrorist activity…..the situation will deteriorate and no religious leader will take responsibility for it…… Do not blame religion for sparking or promoting terrorism in Pakistan…. Blame the state for its bad governance and failures in addressing the grievances of people.” (Wafaqul Madaris General Secretary Maulana Haneef Jalandhari)

- “I will strongly stress the superior bars in the upcoming meeting that we should approach the apex court against the new constitutional amendment as it has completely destroyed the basic structure of the constitution.” (Yasin Azad)

I argue that within the context of the 21st amendment new style of thinking, in the first excerpt, voices accountability and responsibility as an innovation, while the second excerpt reveals a transformational new style of interpreting its ramifications. As a result, individual accountability, can be argued, was at the forefront of an ideological conflict. Throughout numerous points, the National Action Plan resorted in Pakistani citizens interpreting its actual meaning and implications in various ways because the text shifted towards a less rigid engagement and decreased the significance of the values and entities contained within an old-style Islamic model. It is in this third theme that the pressure to achieve consensus is the most vivid. Yet, with the pressure to respond to such attacks by extremist, I argue that the short negotiation process with various interest parties at the negotiation table the idea of individual accountability remained the foci point throughout
the 21st amendment. I argue that one of the key reasons it was the central part is because politicians, specifically, are able to directly correlate individual accountability with a sense of political activeness. In other words, the representation of being a contributing and active community member equates to being seen by other community members as positive. As well as, I argue that the 21st amendment was drafted, implemented, and enforced because the National Action Plan 20-Points was drafted with all stakeholders’ interests, so that enough political populations could contribute to the buy-in process for the new amendment.

**Theme 4 – Closure**

The timeline between the Army Public School massacre in Peshawar Pakistan and the date that the 21st amendment was drafted and implemented reveals that the two events occurred within days of one another. Hence, the fourth theme brought about by the 21st amendment, based on the data I argue, is the demand to achieve a significant level of union or position for the National Action Plan 20 Points; I would argue forced closure. The data reveals that prior to the December 16, 2014 Army Public School massacre, it was evident that deep-seated differences of opinion amongst participants, political parties, and amongst numerous elected leaders and civil servants, regarding countering violent extremism, within Pakistan existed and was well known. However, following the December 16, 2014 Army Public School massacre those same deep-seated differences were not vividly voiced within the context of the 21st amendment. Instead, I argue that the 21st amendment on countering violent extremism functioned as a means of transformation agent to provide official closure of the Army Public School massacre and
spark a shift to focusing on addressing the problem; the problem being countering violent extremism through the unity of stakeholders.

I argue that the currently active 21st amendment within the Pakistani Constitution stands as a vivid representation of various stakeholders reaching a compromise. In reality, compromising actions/behavior are overtly stressed throughout several National Action Plan points. For instance, the bullet point from the National Action Plan 20-Points reads as such:

- (3) Militant outfits and armed gangs will not be allowed to operate in the country.
- (14) Measures against abuse of internet and social media for terrorism.

Hence, I argue that the such actions of compromising contribute to the power of the 21st amendment to counter violent extremism as a strategy, because it insinuates a win-win mentality achieved by decision-makers. Specifically, in this situation, the core concern was that Pakistan as a state player would cease to be the only player to be held accountable for resolving the violent extremism issue within the country and that countering violent extremism is in addition to a large extent also the duty of the Pakistani people themselves.

**Theme 5 – Deontic Orientation**

Finally, the analysis conducted revealed the fifth theme being the deontic orientation of the Pakistani 21st amendment; in other words, its mandatory and assertive nature. According to Lyons (1977, p. 823), the notion of deonticity is the interplay of a semantic element meaning “so-be-it” and requirement. As a result of this perspective, deonticity is the meshing of a long-term goal to be achieved in the future and its linking to intention. Although the 21st amendment process began with imperatives in mind, I
argue in this dissertation that the 21st amendment transformed throughout the negotiation process from a (1) future-oriented analysis to counter violent extremism in Pakistan towards (2) decisively itemized points. Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif describes the process as follows:

“I want to thank all the party heads and their parliamentary representatives for attending committees and sharing their thoughts and advice on this highly important bill. This bill was created with the help of everyone’s common agreement.”

“Through this bill, we can overcome the last 60 years of unrest which should have ended years ago.”

“The parties that were in disagreement of this law, we understood their point of view and tried our best to address their reservations and their point of view was also accommodated.”

“Therefore if they could not vote on it at the National Assembly I would urge them to vote for it in the Senate.”

It is worth noting that the grammatical structure of the bullet points in the National Action Plan 20-Points are at a first glance strictly declarative in nature, however when we take into consideration the context and the goal of the National Action Plan the grammatical mood shifts; the goal of the National Action Plan being to guide future action. In other words, the grammatically declarative National Action Plan points convert into imperative points. According to scholars, these changes can be referred to as metaphors of mood, which are simply secondary type of grammatical metaphors.
The following National Action Plan points can be used as examples:

- (4) NACTA, the anti-terrorism institution will be strengthened.
- (6) Choking financing for terrorist and terrorist organizations.
- (9) Taking effective steps against religious persecution.
- (11) Ban on glorification of terrorist and terrorist organizations through print and electronic media.
- (13) Communication network of terrorists will be dismantled completely.
- (18) Dealing firmly with sectarian terrorists.

I argue that when a body of text is well-thought-out as a directive manuscript that makes available rules to be followed, as can be found in the Pakistani 21st amendment, these same types of clear-cut declarative declarations are construed by the Pakistani people as imperatives. Therefore, assertions such as “NACTA will be strengthened,” “Taking effective steps against,” Ban on glorification of,” Communication network dismantled completely,” and “Dealing firmly” become directive obligations for the Pakistani administration and fellow stakeholders whom have direct influence in the decision-making process.

Arguably, the insinuations of denticity may be construed by observers as performative results on the 21st amendment policy. Below is an excerpt by President Mamnoon Hussain (2010) summarizing the insinuations of the 21st amendment to the delegation headed by Senator Haji Ghulam Ali of JUI-F:

“Since terrorists’ reform is impossible, therefore, the only way to improve the situation is to eliminate them completely.”
I argue that attention should be drawn to how the 21st amendment policy is referred to as an agent of reform, which is “the only way to improve the situation.” Ashtar Ausaf Ali, the Special Assistant for Law of Prime Minister Nawaz Sharif, describes it as follows:

“Prosecution will be improved, evidence collection will be better…. Circumstances will have improved……The European Union, the United States, and other democracies need to understand that we need to make decisions according to our circumstances…. And we know best how to rid ourselves of terrorists.”

Essentially, the excerpts included above are vivid representations of the 21st amendment to counter violent extremism narrative realization force potential. Their interpretations of the impact of policy suggests the use to which the 21st amendment was drafted, implemented, and enforced by the administration in Pakistan. As a result, the policy narrative can be considered an implicit order to completely end violent extremism. However, in the second excerpt the comment, “The European Union, the United States, and other democracies need to understand,” insinuates that there was conflict over the exact meaning and phrasing of the 21st amendment narrative. Yet, this should not be a surprise because the data shows that throughout the drafting and voting process numerous politicians voiced their displeasure because they were bypassed in the decision-making process. Hence, the deontic impact of the 21st amendment could, and I argue will continue, to face conflict and resistance by the people because of the possibility of alternative interpretations.
Conclusion

The findings of this dissertation support the notion that the Pakistani 21st Amendment in its Constitution has given the state the opportunity to portray itself as a victim of violent extremism. In addition, the findings support that the political and countering violent extremism narrative is molded and reshaped by the security entities within Pakistan. Hence, these same security institutions also manage the distribution of the narrative through media and various intelligence organization, reiterating the power/knowledge relationship, which in the end effectively satisfies its interests of causing an imbalance in the power dynamics and governance within the Pakistani state.

Following the Army Public School massacre, the countering violent extremism narrative found in the 21st Amendment of the Pakistani Constitution, according to the data, has not only overshadowed the concerns and voices of individuals but it has also threatened the notion of democracy for the state. Specifically, the countering violent extremist narrative and the National Action Plan, ultimately, based on the findings have failed to provide the desired results that it was created to do. According to the data, attacks conducted after the National Action Plan and the 21st Constitutional Amendment, community members and critics demand results and are displeased with the course of action taken by the state. The state’s pattern, based on the data, consists of repeated press releases and official statements promising to end violent extremism with all the tools in the toolbox and boast of operational successes and statistics provided by the military. Yet, another attack occurs and once again the state repeats the process of controlling the narrative.
Chapter 5: Discussion, Conclusions, and Recommendations

Introduction

The completion of this dissertation study has critically analyzed the countering violent extremism narrative recently implemented into the Pakistani Constitution. In addition, this study challenges the effectiveness of the CVE narrative and the 20-Points National Action Plan. Therefore, this theoretical analysis provides an alternate theoretical framework for countering resolution stalemate. The qualitative holistic historical content analysis case study methodology, executed in this dissertation, was conducted to analyze how the CVE narrative influenced conditions that enable the recruitment and radicalization of violent extremist in Peshawar Pakistan. Due to heightened security measures and the lack of a gate keeper to obtain first level data, the use of secondary level data was used throughout the data collection and analysis process. This chapter, chapter five (5), presents an overarching summary of the study, a discussion, the significance of the study, the limitations of the study, and the recommendations for future research that I believe need to be conducted. Chapter five (5) concludes with various potential implications this dissertation project could have on the field of conflict analysis and resolution.

Discussion

The goal of this dissertation was to critically examine the newly embraced and enforced countering violent extremism narrative within the Pakistani Constitution. Throughout the data analysis process, it was unavoidable to not analyze strengths and weaknesses of the 20 - Point National Action Plan, which was a byproduct of the 21st Constitutional Amendment. This dissertation, through multiple theoretical perspectives
and secondary data analyzed, supports the explanation about how Pakistan’s countering violent extremism narrative following the December 16, 2014 Army Public School massacre is in fact enabling the recruitment and radicalization of extremist. However, contrary to my initial assumption, the data does not support that the recruitment and radicalization of extremist is occurring in Peshawar Pakistan. Following the Army Public School massacre on December 16, 2014, the Pakistani government implemented into its constitution the 21st amendment to counter violent extremism and ultimately took the first step in terminating its relationship with the Pakistani Taliban. Following the new constitutional amendment, the Pakistani Taliban immediately became the new enemy to the state. Therefore, to obtain the sympathy and support from members of the international community, it was in their best interest to portray itself as another casualty in the war against violent extremism. Although well intended, throughout the data analysis process it was evident that the countering violent extremism narrative is viewed by the Pakistani Taliban as a legal method to implement and enforce coercive power to oppress opposing voices.

It is not uncommon for some conflict resolution practitioners and some conflict resolution academics to avoid reflectively listening, comprehending and engaging violent extremists. Especially, after a violent extremist’s massacre which can emotionally unstable an individual. However, the more significant the intensity or level of complexity a situation can be, ultimately, will demand an approach that acknowledges all party’s links and rationality. Without a doubt, it is not unheard of for violent extremists to knowingly and strategically fail to abide by dialogue negotiation agreements, but that is why conflict resolution practitioners and conflict resolution scholars must continue to
incorporate more holistic approaches to conflict resolution strategies. It is through the identification of these extremists needs and attempting to create common ground that will consistently be vital elements in future conflict resolution strategies and cases.

**Significance of Study**

First and foremost, the significance of this study is to fill a gap in the existing body of literature on countering violent extremism in Peshawar Pakistan. The findings of this study, I expect, will present a new perspective to the discourse of countering violent extremism. Specifically, the greater awareness of violent extremism rationale we can obtain, to explain their behaviors and course of actions, will ultimately justifies the need for more effective, life-changing CVE approaches. Thus, government institutions, military entities, civil-society organizations, and states, in this case Pakistan, as a whole, that apply the recommended theoretical perspective implemented for the findings of this dissertation will be able to add a new tool to their toolbox of conflict resolution skills. In addition, conflict resolution practitioners will be guided on a differing perspective of what should be emphasized when reflectively listening, analyzing, and engaging into dialogue violent extremist to counter and manage conflict out in the field.

From the academic/researcher(s) perspective, the significance of this dissertation is a perspective that distinguishes itself from conventional wisdom and uncovers critical elements in the countering violent extremism literature and conflict resolution process that other scholars/researchers have not yet been able to explore or critically think about. Therefore, a fresh new means of engaging violent extremists may, one day, be reached if other scholars/researchers decide to continue to analyze the different perspective presented in this dissertation.
Limitations of Study

Simon and Goes (2013) define limitations as matters or events that occur in a study that fall outside of the control of the researcher. In addition, Simon and Goes (2013) claim every study, regardless of the amount of time and effort put into designing the study, has limitations. According to Simon and Goes (2013), validity and reliability are limitations that are commonly associated with qualitative studies. Within the context of case studies, Simon and Goes (2013) believe the generalizability of the results may be questioned. Although the results may suggest similarities to other entities, additional research would be demanded for verification purposes to the claim of generalizability (Simon & Goes, 2013).

Based on my topic and the design of my study I share with readers the following limitations. To begin, as suggested by Simon and Goes (2013), my qualitative historical holistic case study faces concerns of reliability and validity. Since I am using secondary analysis I cannot make the claim that the knowledge generated is accurate and without flaws. I can only make the claim that with data obtained I designed my study to ensure reliability and validity. In addition, since the phenomenon studied is historical, I am unable to provide direct observational data to my case study. I must rely on archived information to recreate the event. Also, although my topic seeks to create a chronological time analysis of how Pakistan policy-makers led to the decision to counter violent extremism I did not directly interview any policy-makers. My study, specifically, used contextual information to suggest the chronological thought process that led to such decisions; which can rightfully be argued is a limitation. Finally, my inability to travel due to cost, security purposes, and lack of gate keepers is another limitation of my study.
Recommendations

Arguably, on the one hand the culture within the political realm of Pakistan is a key element in cracking down on social conflicts. On the other hand, the intertwining of devastation, terror, and social disorder are without doubt ignitors for political clash. The creation of violence to capitalize on the masses religious sentiments is the trigger that nourishes and fosters political intolerance and the greed for power by social actors. As a balance of power begins to shift, ultimately the shift begins to create a gap, similar to a crack on the foundation of a house, between the legitimacy of power and the institutions of expectations from power. Hence, resulting in the loss of legitimacy and position associated with any support to previously established social agreements. Thusly, as the gap continues to widen, the tension between parties’ increase making it significantly difficult to reevaluate the previously established social agreements under the new changes in power. Hence, conventional wisdom, history, and the Peshawar Army Public School massacre that occurred on December of 2014 teaches us it is more likely that various random events can ultimately trigger future conflicts over the previously established interests of social actors/groups. The Peshawar Army Public School massacre that occurred on December of 2014 was a conflict that was used to establish a new consonance between expectations and power.

As a result, in an attempt to put to an end the futile communal bickering, the Pakistani government and its people must no longer deviate on revamping educational institutions, mass media outlets such as social networks, television networks, radio stations, cinema productions, and newspapers. In addition, the Pakistani government and people need to refocus, embrace, and hold accountable their literary and socio-cultural
entities for the promotion of secular values within its country. In addition, as this study supports, various communal violent acts within Pakistan have been structured and supported mostly by political representatives and political parties. Thusly, these actors must be included during peace talks and be held accountable to the commitment, for the nation and the people of Pakistan, that violent acts will stop.

Furthermore, in alignment with the twenty-first (21) Constitutional amendment to counter violent extremism, the Pakistani government should focus on minimizing and ultimately ending any sort of violent act towards minorities and various tribes by implementing and enforcing strict laws with exemplary punishments; but these laws should be created with representatives of various provinces and minorities and should be mediated. Without a doubt, civil society within Pakistan must play a larger role within countering violent extremism. Moving forward, the state of Pakistan and numerous entities of society must embrace and promote cultural festivals that span across communal distinctions; while also incorporating creative literature. To ensure that both creative literature and cultural festivals are successfully embraced and fostered, religious leaders whom are not associated with a political party must be held accountable and be given an opportunity to formally explain their religions. But such opportunities should be granted if Imams of various mosques embrace and acknowledge three important aspects to hold everyone accountable; (1) a complete reading and understanding of human rights, (2) agree to be held accountable and abide by constitutional rights, and (3) the acknowledgement and acceptance of other laws with religious knowledge. Without a doubt the recommendations provided thus far are not easy tasks to accomplish. On the contrary, various critiques will argue that some of the recommendations have already
been taken into consideration or are too idealistic to effectively occur because of the
generational conflicts that have built up the current tensions in the region. However, the
Pakistani people should not, at a minimum, stop attempting to raise the people’s
awareness on the importance of communal relationships, and the ability of uniting
together to counter violent extremism within various regions of the state.

**Future Research**

Based on this dissertation finding, it can be argued that the Tehrik-i-Taliban
Pakistan’s course of action does not align with the Frankenstein’s Monster theory. The
reason it can be argued in such fashion is because the Tehrik-i-Taliban Pakistan
(Monster) are intentional in their attacks and are not randomly creating chaos. In
addition, it is worth noting that the Tehrik-i-Taliban Pakistan (Monster) are not seeking to
escalate the conflict against the state (the Master), instead they seem to avoid engaging
the state. Also, the ongoing theory that the Pakistani state fails to differ between the bad
and the good extremist lacks traction and credibility because the Pakistani state provides
training, funding, and resources to other extremist groups (Monsters). These other
extremist groups (Monsters) run mayhem actively conducting massacres within nearby
borders. Lastly, the hypothesis that in order for Pakistan to obtain peace Afghanistan
must first reach stability lacks cause-and-effect credibility and validity, because Pakistan
is actively aiding nonstate extremist organizations to destabilize the Afghans.

As a result, I would suggest three differing studies must be conducted based on
the findings of this dissertation. First, a study should be conducted that analyzes and
geographically maps the Tehrik-i-Taliban Pakistan targets, along with an in-depth
analysis of the relationship and various transformation phases between the Pakistani
government and the Tehrik-i-Taliban Pakistan. Secondly, research must be conducted on leading extremist groups that have Pakistani government supporting that are actively, or not, conducting attacks within the Afghanistan and Indian borders. Thirdly, active research should be conducted to support, or not support, the notion that Pakistan is in actuality supporting nonstate extremist groups to destabilize the Afghan state because of the political and monetary rewards from the international community members. If data supports that the Pakistani government is supporting such acts it must be addressed by the international community members immediately, and if the data does not support such findings than the data should reveal/provide new hypothesis.

**Conclusions**

The designing, implementation, and completion of this dissertation was constructed to advance the comprehension of countering violent extremism narratives impact and set the stage for the identification of conflict resolution strategies for engaging violent extremist. An examination of the scholarly literature suggests, that both a philosophical and practical lack of comprehension exists regarding the countering violent extremism narrative impact on the recruitment and radicalization within Peshawar Pakistan, specifically the North-West Frontier Province. In addition, because the lack of comprehension exists, the means to counter such behavior through conflict resolution approaches are also lacking.

Through the qualitative historical holistic case study methodology in this dissertation, the findings provide a redefined and thorough explanation of how Pakistan’s countering violent extremism narrative influenced the conditions that enable extremist recruitment and radicalization. However, contrary to my initial assumptions, findings do
not support that the radicalization and recruitment is occurring within Peshawar Pakistan, specifically the North-West Frontier Province. This dissertation study findings identified that the National Action Plan lacks a concrete strategy to counter violent extremism and as a result limited, virtually none that the NAP was constructed for, results have been generated.

This dissertation's analysis has the potential to bridge future contextual and philosophical examinations of the various options at practitioners’ disposal while attempting to engage and manage violent extremist disputes that seem complex and thought-provoking. The findings in this dissertation advocate that conflict resolution practitioners’ have the ability to achieve a more holistic comprehension of violent extremism influencers. Therefore, through the transformation of our individual understanding of the numerous effective tactics to manage conflict, as practitioners it is our responsibility to effectively evaluate and take into consideration as many perspectives to a conflict as possible and subsequently rule out the strategies that will stagnate conflicts.
References


*BusinessWeek: Asia*, Retrieved from:

http://www.businessweek.com/globalbiz/content/nov2009/gb20091125_996881.htm


https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/comte/


South Asia Terrorism Portal, (2016(b)). Suicide Attacks in Pakistan: 2002 – 2016, SATP: South Asia Terrorism Portal. Retrieved from:
http://satp.org/satporgtp/countries/pakistan/databases/causal/base/Fidayeenattack.htm


https://watson.brown.edu/costofwar/files/cow/imce/papers/2013/Terrorism%20after%20the%202003%20invasion%20of%20Iraq.pdf


